



**ACE EUROPE** bvba  
Leopoldstraat 7-9, bus 601  
B-2800 Mechelen  
tel. +32(0)15 34 88 84  
fax +32(0)15 34 88 64  
info@ace-europe.be

# EVALUATION OF THE TVET POLICY AND PRACTICE OF ICCO, WOORD EN DAAD AND EDUKANS

**FINAL EVALUATION REPORT - ANNEXES**

**Team of evaluators:**

Geert Phlix (ACE Europe – main author final report)

Gerda Heyde (independent consultant)

Clemens Romijn (Ecorys)

Nuria de la Fuente Teixido (Ecorys)

Ranjana Srivastava (local consultant India)

Lebesech Tsega (local consultant Ethiopia)

Buyela Wepukhulu (local consultant Kenia)

Mimoza Gjika (local consultant Albania)

**April 2008**

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND DEFINITIONS

CBO	Community based organisations
CFO	Co-financing Organisation
EFA	Education For All
GTZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
ILO	International Labour Organisation
ISTP	Informal Skills Training Programme
JBC	Job and Business centre
NGO	Non Governmental Organisation
OVC	Orphans and Vulnerable Children
PME	Project Monitoring and Evaluation
TVET	Technical and Vocational Education and Training
VTC	Vocational training Centre
WPF	World Population Fund

Basic education	The whole range of educational activities, taking place in various settings (formal, nonformal and informal), that aim to meet basic learning needs. It has considerable overlap with the concept 'fundamental education'. Basic education comprises primary education (first stage of basic education) and lower secondary education (second stage). Source: Unesco (glossary)
Competence based education	Competency based education and training (CBET) is an education and training system that incorporates the appropriate knowledge, skills and attitudes into the workforce preparation activity. These competencies are based on the specific requirements of the various occupations. Competency-based training implies that the orientation of programmes aims at the development of abilities which may be applicable to a wide range of labour situations involved in the environment of an occupation. Source: ILO ( <a href="http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/ampro/cinterfor/temas/complab/xxxx/37.htm">http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/ampro/cinterfor/temas/complab/xxxx/37.htm</a> )
Formal education	As normally used, the term formal education refers to the structured educational system provided by the state. In most countries, the formal education system is state-supported and state-operated. In some countries, the state allows and certifies private systems which provide a comparable education. Source: UNESCO

Informal education	Learning that takes place in daily life without clearly stated objectives. The term refers to a lifelong process whereby every individual acquires attitudes, values, skills and knowledge from daily experiences and the educative influences and resources in his/her environment – e.g. family and neighbours, work and play, the marketplace, the library, the mass media. Source: Unesco (glossary: <a href="http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php">HTTP://PORTAL.UNESCO.ORG/EDUCATION/EN/EV.PHP</a> )
Informal sector	The term was first used by ILO in 1972 to indicate those small scale income generating activities which took place outside the official regulatory framework. A more recent definition (ILO-15 <sup>th</sup> ICLS 2000 – used for statistics and policy making) of an informal sector enterprise is based on the following four criteria. Firstly, they are private and unincorporated which means that they are owned by individuals or households that are not constituted as separate legal entities independently of their owner. Secondly, the goods or services of the enterprise should be (partly) for sale or barter. The activities can be carried out in the enterprise owner's house, in identifiable premises, unidentifiable premises or without fixed location, which implies that self-employed street vendors, taxi drivers etc. are considered as enterprises in the informal sector. Thirdly, the size of the enterprise in terms of employment is below a certain threshold (depending on national circumstances) and the enterprise is not registered under specific forms of national legislation. Lastly, the enterprise is engaged in non-agricultural activities, including secondary non-agricultural activities
Non formal education	Learning activities typically organized outside the formal education system. The term is generally contrasted with formal and informal education. In different contexts, non-formal education covers educational activities aimed at imparting adult literacy, basic education for out-of-school children and youth, life skills, work skills, and general culture. Such activities usually have clear learning objectives, but vary in duration, in conferring certification for acquired learning, and in organizational structure. Source: Unesco (glossary: <a href="http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php">http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php</a> -)
TVET	Technical and Vocational Education and training: Those aspects of the educational process involving, in addition to general education, the study of technologies and related sciences, and the acquisition of practical skills, attitudes, understanding and knowledge relating to occupations in various sectors of economic and social life. Technical and vocational understanding is further understood to be: (a) an integral part of general education; (b) a means of preparing for occupational fields and for effective participation in the world of work; (c) an aspect of lifelong learning and a preparation for responsible citizenship; (d) an instrument for promoting environmentally sound sustainable development; (e) a method of facilitating poverty alleviation (UNESCO, ILO, 2002)

## TABLE OF CONTENT

Annex 1 Terms of reference .....	5
Annex 2 – Evaluation framework.....	39
Annex 3 – Chronogram of the evaluation .....	45
Annex 4 – Overview of working documents.....	47
Annexe 5 – Brief description of partners visited .....	48
Annex 6 reaction of ACE Europe on commends of the CFOs with regard to the first draft of the evaluation report.....	56
Annexe 7: Commends of the external reference group on the final evaluation report.....	64

## **ANNEX 1 TERMS OF REFERENCE**

---

### **An evaluation of Technical and Vocational Education and Training activities in the Co-financing Programme**

#### **Terms of Reference**

##### **1. Introduction**

In 2005 the Policy and Operations Evaluation Department (IOB) of the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs, responsible for the evaluation of Dutch foreign policy, planned to execute an evaluation of the involvement of the Co-financing Agencies in the field of education. This evaluation would be part of the evaluations planned by IOB within its responsibility of inspection and assessment of the quality of programmes under the Co-financing Programme (2003 -2006) agreed by the Minister for Development Co-operation and the six Dutch co-financing agencies (CFOs: CORDAID, ICCO, NOVIB, HIVOS, PLAN-NL and Terre des Hommes). Selected topic for this evaluation were the Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET) activities in the co-financing programme. Participating organisation in this evaluation were ICCO (with part of the programmes carried out by Edukans and Prisma), Cordaid and Terre des Hommes. A Terms of Reference was prepared, a consultant hired for coordination and a desk study started. In October 2005 IOB announced to stop the preparations for this evaluation due to concentration of the available capacity on the evaluations already in execution.

In the take off of the planned evaluation both Prisma and Edukans, through which organisations part of ICCO's MFP money was invested in TVET activities, showed genuine interest for evaluation of the topic TVET. Information was gathered, meetings held in order to furnish the IOB researchers with relevant information. Both this interest and the investments already done in the evaluation were reason for ICCO to ask Prisma and Edukans to join in an own TVET evaluation. As member organisation of Prisma, Woord en Daad participates in the evaluation. Proposed evaluation would built on the work already done by IOB, although it was found necessary by the three parties to adjust the ToR more specifically to TVET activities and interventions of ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad, and also adjust the lists of partner organisations made.

Another reason for asking Prisma and Edukans is that starting 2007 both these organisations are so-called Alliance Organisations of ICCO. Together with them and 3 other organisations ICCO submitted in 2006 a new subsidy request to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. This request was granted in November 2006. In this new Co-Financing Programme (2007 – 2010), programme evaluations are the main instrument for the CFOs for accountability and learning towards their donor, the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. One of the areas in which the alliance will work strongly together is basic education. For its Programme on Labour and Income (including

education for work), Woord en Daad submitted its own subsidy request for the period 2007-2010 to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. However, the ICCO Alliance and Woord and Daad agreed on a strategic partnership on this topic. This TVET evaluation, although looking at the former period, will be a prelude and finger exercise towards the future in which ICCO will perform Programme Evaluations both with the MBN organisations plus and with its Alliance Partners.

## 2. Co-Financing Programme 2003 - 2006

The main objective of the Co-Financing Programme (CFP) is structural poverty reduction through three inter-linked intervention strategies: direct poverty reduction, civil society building and policy influencing. ICCO works together with partner organisations in the South and finances activities aimed at sustainable poverty reduction that are executed or implemented by the partner organisations.

In 2003 and 2004 a total of €110 mln. was granted to ICCO. Over the last few years the grants have been divided as followed:

**Table 1: Grant CFO's (in €)**

	2000	2001	2002	2003	2004
<b>ICCO</b>	88.597.016	90.719.264	91.822.772	109.680.840	109.001.358

Sources: CFP subsidy disposition 2001 till 2004.

Part of ICCO's work in the South has been performed by other organisations under what was called the so-called *block grants*. By means of this block grants ICCO made money of the Ministry of Development Cooperation available for Dutch Civil Society Organisations, financing qualitative good development projects, which comply with the MFP policy frame work. This so called strategical cooperation organisations on turn would provide ICCO with private means ('particuliere middelen') additionally to ICCO's money out of the CFP. From 2002 onwards ICCO made around € 16 million available for the block grants; ICCO would get some € 5 million of private means in return. Edukans and Prisma were two of the 11 organisations receiving block grants from ICCO (in 2005 resp. € 2,5 million and € 8 million).

In the period covered by the evaluation (2003 – 2006), ICCO, Prisma (Woord en Daad) and Edukans have their own identity (with as common denominator a Protestant character) and their own policies and strategies. Given the fact that under the blockgrants ICCO only gave money to organisations which would comply with the MFP policy framework, it could be assumed that also in the policies of Edukans and Prisma (Woord en Daad), the elements of the CFP framework are reflected, like they are in ICCO's. The policy plans, however, differ in focus, central themes, priorities and plans of action, and the way the three intervention strategies are put into practice.

## Sector Education

Education is an important instrument for sustainable poverty reduction. It gives people the opportunity to participate in economic, political and social development and it empowers them. Since the World Conference on Education for All (EFA) in Jomtien in 1990 basic education has been placed high on the development agenda. The Jomtien Conference defines basic education “as being the foundation for lifelong learning and human development” and recognised that “the diversity, complexity and changing nature of basic learning needs of children, youth and adults necessitates broadening and constantly redefining the scope of basic education” (Declaration 5 of Jomtien Conference).

At the World Education Forum in Dakar in 2000, the broad definition of basic education was reconfirmed. It was observed, however, that the Jomtien objectives had not yet been reached. In a new action plan the following 6 EFA goals were defined:<sup>1</sup>

- Expanding and improving comprehensive early childhood care and education, especially for the most vulnerable and disadvantaged children;
- Ensuring that by 2015 all children, particularly girls, children in difficult circumstances and those belonging to ethnic minorities, have access to, and complete, free and compulsory primary education of good quality.
- Ensuring that the learning needs of all young people and adults are met through equitable access to appropriate learning and life skills programmes.
- Achieving a 50 % improvement in levels of adult literacy by 2015, especially for women, and equitable access to basic and continuing education for adults.
- Eliminating gender disparities in primary and secondary education by 2005, and achieving gender equality in education by 2015, with a focus on ensuring girls’ full and equal access to and achievement in basic education of good quality.
- Improving all aspects of the quality of education and ensuring excellence of all so that recognised and measurable learning outcomes are achieved by all, especially in literacy, numeracy and essential life skills.

Two of the eight Millennium Development Goals (MDG’s) are based on the EFA goals:

- Achieve universal primary education: ensure that by 2015, children everywhere, boys and girls alike, will be able to complete a full course of primary schooling.
- Promote gender equality and empower women. Eliminate gender disparity in primary and secondary education preferably by 2005 and in all levels of education no later than 2015.

---

<sup>1</sup> Factsheet Basic Education –Intranet BZ; Dakar Framework for Action, World Education Forum, Dakar April 2000, UNESCO Education for All.

### 3.1 Technical and vocational education and training.

In the background paper on TVET of the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Kosar Altinyelken 2004<sup>2</sup>) Technical and Vocational and Training is defined as:

“Education which is mainly designed to lead participants to acquire the practical skills, know-how and understanding necessary for employment in a particular occupation, trade or group of occupations” (Atchoarena & Delluc 2001). Such practical skills or know-how can be provided in a wide range of settings by multiple providers both in the public and the private sector. Formal education encompasses technical and vocational streams after primary schooling, and non-formal training includes pre-employment vocational training, on the job training (apprenticeship), and in-service training for workers.”

Ideally, TVET has a great diversity of objectives. It can be seen as a means of providing a second chance to secondary drop-outs, offering an alternative to secondary education and combating youth unemployment and poverty.<sup>3</sup> Through TVET individuals will be better equipped for productive activities and their employment opportunities (such as wage-employment, self-employment and income generation activities) will be enhanced. The critical role of TVET in developing skills that are required to improve productivity, raise income levels and improve equitable access to employment opportunities has been widely recognised (Bennell 1999). Moreover, a number of unprecedented developments in the last three decades made the role of TVET even more decisive. The globalisation process, technological change, and increased competition due to trade liberalisation necessitate higher skills and productivity among workers both in the modern sector firms and in micro and small enterprises. Additionally, workers who are displaced by the structural adjustment programmes in many developing countries pose an important challenge, as they need retraining for new occupations. Skills development has also become crucial as a result of the HIV/AIDS pandemic. AIDS depletes scarce human resources and increases the need for training to replace skills lost across a wide range of occupations, particularly in Sub-Saharan Africa (Johanson 2002). Nevertheless, HIV/AIDS itself reduces the capacity of TVET systems to deliver their services, since it decreases the supply and causes deterioration in the quality of the system.<sup>4</sup>

---

<sup>2</sup> See appendix 3 for background paper on Technical and Vocational Education and Training.

<sup>3</sup> UNESCO-UNEVOC International Centre for Technical and Vocational Education and Training. <http://portal.unesco.org/education> 4/22/05

<sup>4</sup> Paragraph based on Kosar Altinyelken, H (2004) Background paper on Technical and Vocational Education and Training

Provision of TVET constitutes an important component in strategies for achieving EFA. Yet the EFA Monitoring Report 2003/2004 by UNESCO reveals that efforts made by developing countries tend to concentrate on universal primary education and literacy and do not pay sufficient attention to skills training for youth and adults. In the following paragraph several issues will be raised to give some background for this conclusions in the UNESCO report, and some entry points for understanding why TVET strategies as used the last decennia didn't seem to have the effects hoped for.

Several important issues and challenges<sup>5</sup> on Technical and Vocational Education and Training can be distinguished. Effective TVET systems (supply of TVET) still have to be developed in most developing countries. This relates directly to the low status and image that TVET has both in developing countries itself and with the major international donors like the Worldbank and ILO. Of course one important issue considering TVET systems is the cost of delivery of TVET (which is high compared to primary and secondary education systems). Another important challenge is the improvement of access to TVET (girls and women are seriously under-represented in TVET). There are barriers of access (gender, age, literacy, education fees and physical proximity) as well as barriers to participate (range and type of training choices that are offered, the level, the style and language of training, the manner of presentation, the teaching methods used and course schedules). The assurance of quality is a concern. High quality TVET programmes guarantee a strong link between what is learnt and the needs of the labour market, with the result that graduates are more likely to find suitable employment. Given this fact, the remark has to be made that practice has proven that vocational education as such does not equal employment. Education as such does not create jobs. On the contrary, quality and relevancy of basic education, and in particular of TVET, is crucial for beneficiaries on the demand side of TVET. Their aim is to be better equipped with a range of skills which will enhance their employment opportunities at the labour markets, and provides them with an income.

### **3.2 The ICCO Alliance and Education**

ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad consider education as an important instrument for poverty alleviation. They all spent a substantial percentage of their financial support to this sector in the last few years (see table 2 for the year 2003).

---

<sup>5</sup> UNESCO-UNEVOC International Centre for Technical and Vocational Education and Training. <http://portal/unesco.org/education> 4/22/05

**Table 2: Expenses on education in 2003 in percentage of total expenses**

	ICCO	Edukans	Woord en Daad
Education	15%	100%	76 %

Source: annual reports 2003

In brief the intervention logic of the TVET programmes of the three organisations will be sketched. It should be noted that these intervention logics have been reconstructed, since none of the organisations had a full fledged TVET policy during the period covered with this evaluation.

### **ICCO**

ICCO's mission in the period 2003-2006 could be described as to contribute to a world without poverty and injustice. While using a rights-based perspective, ICCO chose to improve the living conditions of the most excluded, such as girls and women, ethnic minorities, children and those living in rural areas. Despite their economic, social and cultural rights, which were acknowledged by most of their governments, these groups still didn't have access to basic social services, like education.

The TVET projects which ICCO supported aimed to contribute to this mission of poverty reduction and/or to the empowerment of the most marginal groups as a precondition for structural poverty alleviation. The idea was that providing marginalized men and women with more and more appropriate skills(both formal and informal) , this would eventually lead to their economic empowerment. They would be able to improve their productivity or quality of labor (greater efficiency) and enlarge herewith the chance to acquire a higher income

Projects contained a wide range of activities, all supporting education opportunities to vulnerable groups (such as women, young ex-combatants and refugees or in other case street children), either to better equip these for the labour market, either to empower these or to contribute to their reintegration in society (and herewith to peace building and reconstruction as in the case of Liberia). Project activities ranged from job counseling, second chance (more relevant) education, the renovation / construction of vocational education centers, short term courses, training of education staff members, development of financial management for vocational education. Some of these activities were combined with psycho social counseling and social skills development. Several projects were supported by ICCO via its frontdesk (Wilde Ganzen, Ex-change, Edukans, PRISMA or other private initiatives such as the Stichting WOL).

This line of thinking in the intervention logic is to be continued in the new subsidy period (2007 onwards) in the Education for Work programme of the ICCO Alliance. Its focus will especially be on an increase of relevancy of (non formal community based) education by adapting approach and content of education to knowledge, abilities and attitudes, aiming to support an increase of productivity (in the formal and informal market) and the generation of income. These issues will be included in new policy documents guiding the work of the ICCO Alliance on TVET.

### *Woord en Daad*

The VET-program of Woord & Daad, started in the '90s and is part of the program for 'Job and Income'. The VET-program prepares students for the labour market and aims to enlarge their chances in finding employment. Woord & Daad uses a so called 'chain approach' in its programs. By focussing on the chain 'Education – VET – Job Mediation – Business Development', the aim is economic independency of the target group. Education turns out to be a necessary but not sufficient premise to prepare people for taking their responsibility – for example in gaining an income. The VET-program focused on abilities of students and links in this way empowerment with development and training of skills and knowledge. However, VET is not enough to help the target group to acquire a strong position in the labour market. The target group often does not have the necessary contacts related to entrance of the labour market. For this reason W&D has developed the concept of Job and Business centres (JBCs). These JBCs built a bridge between VET and the labour market. Furthermore, JBCs are an important tool to make VET more demand driven, for example through feedback of businesses and alumni. Finally, the programs for Micro Enterprise Development (MED) and Small & Medium Enterprise Development (SMED) create possibilities for the poor in acquiring credits and support in starting a business. Also within these programs, the creation job opportunities is a key focus.

### Edukans

For Edukans TVET activities are directed towards income generation cum empowerment of the beneficiaries and their communities. More precisely the beneficiaries are children (boys and especially girls) and youth who don't have access to regular basic education, or aren't able to enter basic education, since they are too old (14+), or dropped out too early. Not having access is further specified as formal education being either substandard, or lacking need-based perspective at all (e.g. in many rural settings in India and Ethiopia). For this group of children generally speaking, formal secondary schooling is no alternative in terms of (cost) effectiveness and follow-up. From 2004 onwards the TVET programme of Edukans is financed out of the Thematic Co-financing Programma budget line (TMF funds). This type of funding didn't really change the TVET policy.

Main intervention strategies are project funding, joint policy development (N-S and S-S) and sharing of

expertise in South and North. In the South exchange is facilitated by so-called Local Expertise Centres (LEC) through exposure visits for staff between and in countries and by staff training. In India the LEC is a local NGO- Development Focus- which was co-established by Edukans. In the North this exchange is directed towards sharing expertise mainly.

Main characteristics of TVET is that this non-formal, flexible vocational training often also will include basic literacy skills or small enterprise skills. Reason for this is that the target group besides basic education skills especially has a need for education which helps them to improve their income position and finally also their social –economic position. Given this in rural settings main activities for TVET will be so-called community based non-formal education and appropriate technology courses; in the urban setting the emphasis is on job-oriented courses for specific groups of youth. For the latter Edukans supports the development of curricula directed towards empowerment and life skills, and the development of non-formal curricula for drop-outs. Where possible integration of NFE programmes in the formal education will make this more relevant and more application-oriented.

#### *ICCO Alliance (2007 onwards)*

The education policies of ICCO, Prisma and Edukans correspond largely with and are directed to contribute to the Jomtien, Dakar and MDG objectives. All these policies are based on the principle that education is a fundamental human right. Although significant progress has been made towards EFA, huge challenges (such as reaching out to the most disadvantaged children) must still be overcome to meet goals set by the world's nations in 2000, including halving adult illiteracy by 2015.

The aim of the joint basic education programme, to be implemented from 2007 on, is quality improvement, including accessibility and relevance of basic education in the South, along the international accepted goals of Education for All (EFA, Dakar 2000) and the Millennium Development Goals (MDG, nr. 2 and 3). One of the coalition's strategic goals for the years to come is to promote *multi-actor programmatic approaches* instead of supporting short term projects, implemented by one organisation. Support efforts will concentrate on the poorest of the poor, and education of girls and groups outside the mainstream. The Alliance will support *local initiatives* and *increase the capacity of local actors* (such as school management committees, local government, churches and NGO's), in order to find relevant, feasible and affordable solutions to durable improvement of the education sector.

In relation to a core program on basic education the alliance selected four connecting themes to focus on in the coming years: Education for Work HIV/Aids & Education, Education in (post) Conflict areas and

Education for Marginalized Peoples. This selection was based on a portfolio analysis within ICCO and Edukans.

### 3.3 ICCO, Woord en Daad, Edukans and TVET

The ICCO Alliance does not yet have specific policies on Technical and Vocational Education and Training, Woord en Daad does. It does, however, consider TVET as an important educational instrument. In the previous section a construction of the intervention logic with regard to TVET has been made for the period 2003 – 2006. An inventory has been made of all activities under execution since 2003, which were supported by ICCO, Woord en Daad and Edukans. The inventory shows that in this period ICCO supported 87 partner organisations (and 127 TVET activities), (See appendix 1 for an overview). Of these, .... projects were projects on the subject TVET of ICCO (and outside the block grant); 80 were projects from Woord en Daad, 77 were projects from Edukans. (both are part of the block grant).

The range and objectives of TVET activities differ. From all financed the TVET activities, a group of activities can be distinguished for which TVET itself is the only or dominant activity of the project or programme and another group of TVET activities, or which TVET is an important element in a larger or integrated project or programme (eg education programme, health programme, rehabilitation programme). Most of the TVET projects and programmes supported by ICCO are non-formal TVET activities. The desk study will give more detailed information on this group of TVET activities, and to which other programmes or projects they mainly belong.

Most projects are aimed at specific target groups. These include marginalised groups like working children, street children, handicapped children etc.

**Table 3: Number of activities aimed at different target groups**

Target group	ICCO*	Woord en Daad	Edukans	Total
Non specific	13	3	3	
Underprivileged youth	23	75	30	
Street children (including drug addicts, juveniles)	18		10	
HIV/Aids children			1	
Refugees/ displaced people	4			
Handicapped	3	7	5	

Girls/ women	17	9	8	
Working Children	4		17	
Sexually abused	3			
Working children	1			
NGOs			3	
<b>Total</b>	<b>86</b>	<b>86</b>	<b>77</b>	

NB table based on preliminary data \* ICCO excluding TVET project in the following countries:

The overall objective of the TVET activities is the improvement of livelihoods by increasing one's job opportunities. In the integrated programmes the activities can have specific objectives, mainly rehabilitation: keeping the youngsters of the street, prevent juvenile delinquency and prostitution.

Most of the TVET activities aim at the availability and accessibility of education to deprived people without any perspective of any other education. Also the quality of TVET plays a role in the interventions by the partner organisations. Actions to bridge the gap between TVET and the labour market by adjusting the curricula to the requirements of the labour market or support graduates in finding jobs are considered by some of the partner organisations.

The kind of technical and vocational training varies. Most partner organisations offer training in several sectors. TVET includes training and education in administration, services, mechanics, tailoring, knitting, agriculture and personal care.

### **3. Objective of evaluation and evaluation questions**

#### **3.1 Objective**

The two main objectives of the evaluation are:

1. to assess the results achieved of a selected number of TVET activities supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad and executed by their partner organisations.
2. to give a judgement on the various strategies used by the partner organisations of ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad in the implementation of the TVET activities

The results considered in this evaluation are the results achieved at the level of the partner organisations as well as the results achieved at the level of the target group.

The evaluation will focus on the assessment of efficiency, effectiveness, mid term impact, relevance and if possible mid-term sustainability of the TVET activities. The evaluation criteria will be used to assess the

results at both levels (PO- and target group level). Efficiency will focus on the input – output relation. Effectiveness on the relation output – outcome. (mid-term) impact focus on the effects (outcome) for the beneficiaries (CHECK). The first will focus more on the level of the partner organisations, the latter two on the level of the target group. Relevance assesses the extent to which expected impact of the TVET activities was realised. (are they really of use, both to the beneficiaries and according to the demands of the labour market?)

In the judgement a kind of benchmarking is asked on the different strategies in use. The benchmark will be given in relation to the evaluation criteria.

All questions will be assessed in a gender-specific way (where possible the data will be presented gender-disaggregated). Where applicable, also the impact of HIV/Aids on the execution and the implementation of the TVET activities will be sketched.

### **3.2 Evaluation questions**

The key questions are:

1. How efficient were the TVET activities as supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad?
  - 1.1 What was the relationship between the input and the output of the activities (cost benefit analysis)
  - 1.2 In implementing the TVET activities was there a relationship / cooperation with (local ) government (institutions) or other institutions engaged in TVET activities
2. How effective were the TVET activities as supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad
  - 2.1 Did the TVET activities match the educational level of the beneficiaries
  - 2.2
3. What is the (mid term) impact of the TVET activities as implemented by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad?
  - 3.1 Did the jobs found on the basis of the TVET activities contribute to the improvement of the situation of the target group both in terms of socio-economic situation, and of personal development (rehabilitation, income, higher self-esteem)?
  - 3.2 Are the achievements at the level of the target group sustainable?
  - 3.3 Did the spin off of the TVET activities as supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad contribute to the empowerment of the community?.
4. How relevant the TVET activities as supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad?
  - 4.1 did the TVET activities offered match the needs of the target group (differentiate to rural and urban poor)
  - 4.2 did the TVET activities offered match the demand of the labour market / the chances offered by the labour market
5. What is the mid-term sustainability of the TVET activities as supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad
  - 5.1 Did beneficiaries of the TVET activities found a job (self-employment, employment on a commission basis, wage employment) in the field of training?; to what extend did the TVET activities contribute to this.
  - 5.2 Is the delivery of TVET by the partner organisation sustainable?

6. What can be said on the process of working with the financing modality of the ICCO block grants:
- 6.1 What has been its influence on the development of TVET policies and objectives of the individual organisations Woord en Daad, Edukans and ICCO
- 6.2 What has been the role of Woord en Daad on the development of M&E practices of TVET projects as formulated for the new subsidy period?

For these evaluation questions the following key-indicators have been developed.

Execution of TVET supported activities	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Support provided by CFOs to partner organisations.</li> <li>• Policy and approach of partner organisations.</li> <li>• Analysis of regional/local demand for skills.</li> <li>• Selection and communication to potential participants of TVET.</li> <li>• Execution of TVET activities by partner organisations.</li> <li>• Quality of, and access to TVET activities.</li> <li>• Numbers of trainees that started courses/training and drop-outs.</li> </ul>
Outputs	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Numbers of trainees that completed courses.</li> <li>• Level of technical skills (certification/quality guarantees).</li> <li>• Scope of skills.</li> </ul>
Outcomes	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Number of graduates with job (in their field of training) (wage employment, self-employment, work on a commission basis).</li> <li>• Number of graduates employed otherwise.</li> <li>• Duration/prospects of employment.</li> </ul>
Impact	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Income generated by employment.</li> <li>• Livelihood situation of graduates: housing, family situation, participation in community.</li> </ul>
Process	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Cross-fertilisation of policy and practice of TVET activities, financed by Woord en Daad, Edukans and ICCO while participating in the ICCO blockgrant</li> <li>• Influence of successful M&amp;E practices</li> </ul>

## 5. Scope

This evaluation will focus on the TVET activities of partner organisations supported by ICCO, Woord and Daad) and Edukans.

The inventory of TVET activities (see appendix 1) indicates that the three organisations support a total of 171 partner organisations in 46 countries. The range of activities is wide. A selection has thus been made.

In first instance the desk study of this evaluation study will make an overview of all TVET activities of the 3 organisations in the countries where they are engaged in TVET. According to the outcome of this inventory a clustering of TVET activities will be made. Based on this clustering a decision will be made on the sample and countries for the case studies. Most likely criteria will be used like: number of TVET activities in a country, reasonable TVET component in project or programme (TVET component can be clearly defined from other activities, TVET component has to be more than 25%), reasonable financial support to TVET activity (support to TVET component more than €10.000) and the distribution of TVET activities over different continents.

The assessment of the effects of the TVET activities is exclusively focussed on the projects or project phases that have been terminated in the years 2003, 2004 and 2005. The assessment of the impact of TVET will focus on the TVET graduates that completed their course in between 2003 and 2006.

## **Final sample**

The consultants will make a final selection of the sample of activities in the selected countries. They will base their selection on the following criteria: right mix of TVET activities (activities of which TVET component is more than 90% versus activities of which the TVET component is a part of larger activity), right mix of partner organisations of different CFO's, right time frame of project phases, reasonable amount of financial support and ongoing activities (no ending relationships).

## **6. Representativeness**

The activities to be covered in the field analysis will be selected on a basis of an inventory of activities. The selection presents a cross section of organisations involved in the implementation of the TVET activities. The selection is not statistically representative, but is intended to provide a sufficiently illustrative sample of TVET activities supported by the ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad

## **7. Approach and Methodology**

The evaluation will be carried out in three phases using different methods.

- **Desk study**

During the first part of the evaluation a desk study of all activities on TVET carried out by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad will be executed.\* The desk study is carried out to get a more detailed idea of scope, type of TVET and beneficiaries of TVET activities, the objectives of the activities, amount of money involved, the achievements at the level of the partner organisation and the level of the target group, and any possible problems encountered. It gives an understanding of activities on TVET carried out so far by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad. For the desk study a format will be used that includes the evaluation questions and the indicators that will be used for the evaluation. The desk study is based on information available at ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad: project proposals, project appraisals, progress reports and field visit reports. Also recent evaluation reports (if available) will be analysed. Furthermore, interviews at the CFOs will be held to complement the information.

The report of the desk study together with the other findings of the evaluation will serve as background for further developing the sub-programme Education and Work within the ICCO Alliance programme on Basic Education and the Woord and Daad policy on Vocational Education within the programme for Labour and Income.

\* Countries of the desk study are:

- Woord en Daad: India, South-Africa, Ethiopia, Burkina Faso, Colombia, Sri Lanka, Haiti, Bangladesh and the Philippines;

- Edukans: Ethiopia, India, Kenya, and Peru

- ICCO: Albania, Brasilia and Liberia

- **Field study**

During the preparation of the field study the partner organisations concerned will be informed of the evaluation and their part in it. The field evaluation methodology and approaches (interview guidelines, etc) will be further designed during this stage.

During the field study data will be collected to verify and complement the information of the desk study. Information will be collected at the level of partner organisations, at the level of the target group and on the process of working with a block grant. The fieldwork will involve a variety of methods, including review of documents, partner organisation consultation and participation, and interviews with the target group. Depending on the amount and quality of data collected during the desk study, for each individual activity it will be determined to what extent the following methods will be used.

Relevant data at the level of the partner organisations will be obtained by:

- Structured interviews with the staff of the partner organisation
- Additional documentation collection at the partner organisation

Impact data at the level of the target group will be collected by:

- Interviews (individual or in group) with ex-trainees to gather information on their employment and change in their livelihood that can be attributed to the training or education, provided by the partner organisations?. During the interviews use will be made of interview guidelines.
- Structured interviews with other stakeholders: trainees attending training or education at the moment of evaluation, teachers, employers and parents.

- **Reporting**

The final phase of the evaluation involves the integration and analysis of the results of the desk study and the field study in order to prepare the final report.

In appendix 2 of these ToR an overview of the evaluation indicators and sources is given.

## **8. Organisation**

The management and responsibility of the evaluation rests with a coordinating group of the participating organisations, consisting of the policy advisors on TVET / basic education of Woord en Daad and Edukans ,

the programme specialist on basic education of ICCO, and the policy advisor on evaluation of ICCO. ICCO will take the lead of this coordination group.

The desk study will be conducted by a junior researcher (under the responsibility of the consultant), who has good knowledge of the ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad and the activities of the organisations. The preparation of the field study and the field study itself will be carried out by a small evaluation team: the team leader is an evaluation manager, the members are a educational specialist/consultant, assisted by the junior researcher and a local consultant from the countries where activities are studied. The final phase of the evaluation, the analysis and reporting will be carried out by the education specialist, assisted by the junior researcher.

The education specialist/consultant will have extensive experience and expertise in the field of education, preferably TVET, and considerable experience in carrying out evaluations.

Within the participating organisations the evaluation will be supported by a small internal reference group: the education specialist of I/C consult and per organisation a desk officer responsible for programmes with a TVET component. The reference group will be chaired by ICCO. In addition, an external reference group will guide the evaluation by reading and commenting the report of the desk study, and the draft and final reports.

## 9. Projected draft timetable

Review TOR	November 2007/ February 2007
Selection of consultant	March/ April 2007
Desk study	May/ June 2007
Inception Report	July 2007
Go-no-go moment	August 2007
Preparation field study	August/ September 2007
Field study	September/ October 2007
Analysing and Reporting	October/ November 2007
Submission of draft final evaluation report	November/ December 2007

## Appendix 1: Inventory of TVET activities in execution since 2003

	ICCO	ICCO	ICCO	Edukans			Woorden Daad			Total	Total	Total
	POs	Projects	Subsidy	POs	Projects	Subsidy	POs	Projects	Subsidy	POs	Projects	Subsidy
<b>AZEO</b>												
Afghanistan	1	1	12.550									
Albania	4	10	2.347.348	0								
Armenia	2	2	220.000									
Asia Pacific	1	1	66.004									
Bosnia												
Bangladesh	2	2	35.000				1	3	264.932			
Cambodia	2	3	622.370									
Philippines	1	2	168.770				1	12	1.201.107			
India	23	30	1.136.579	21	42	443.286	3	16	356.793			
Indonesia	4	4	163.495	1	1	109.440						
Kirgizie	1	1	270.000									
Moldavia												
Pakistan	1	1	171.099									
Sri Lanka							1	3	135.133			
Tibet	1	1	12.134									
Trinidad												
Vietnam	1	1	55.835									
<b>Total</b>	<b>44</b>	<b>59</b>	<b>5.281.184</b>	<b>22</b>	<b>43</b>	<b>552.726</b>	<b>6</b>	<b>34</b>	<b>1.957.965</b>			
<b>Africa</b>												
Africa region												
Angola	2	3	330.015									
Burkina Faso							1	13	1.836.112			
Ethiopia	1	2	30.675	2	4	62.727	1	5	111.802			
Ghana	3	6	184.365									
Guinea-Bissau	2	3	190.166									
Cameroon												
Kenya	4	10	295.774	5	17	294.223						
Lesotho	1	1	20.823									
Liberia	1	3	234.197									
Malawi	2	2	109.284									
Morocco												
Middle East	1	1	510.000									

Uganda	4	5	105.149	3	5	52.240						
Palestine	1	4	1.773.148									
Senegal	1	2	91.440									
Sudan	2	3	68.058									
Tanzania												
Chad												
Zimbabwe	2	2	485.426									
South Africa	2	5	194.862				1	15	895.225			
<b>Total</b>	<b>29</b>	<b>52</b>	<b>4.623.382</b>	<b>10</b>	<b>26</b>	<b>409.190</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>33</b>	<b>2.843.139</b>			
<b>Latin America</b>												
Bolivia												
Brazil	5	5	354.132	1	1	22.688						
Colombia	1	3	154.312				1	10	1.016.965			
El Salvador												
Guatemala	1	1	109.762				1	5	13.554			
Haiti	1	1	244.321				1	4	263.480			
Honduras												
Peru	5	5	375.868	3	6	82.985						
Uruguay	1	1	25.000									
<b>Total</b>	<b>14</b>	<b>16</b>	<b>1.263.395</b>	<b>4</b>	<b>7</b>	<b>105.673</b>	<b>3</b>	<b>19</b>	<b>1.293.999</b>			
<b>Total</b>	<b>87</b>	<b>127</b>	<b>11.167.961</b>	<b>37</b>	<b>77</b>	<b>1.067.589</b>	<b>12</b>	<b>86</b>	<b>6.095.103</b>			

## Appendix 2: Indicators and sources of information

Execution of TVET activities		
Key indicators	Specific indicators and issues	Resources
Support provided by CFO to partner organisation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- funds</li> <li>- equipment</li> <li>- operational and technical support</li> <li>- strategic support</li> <li>- capacity building for TVET</li> <li>- institutional strengthening</li> <li>- policy dialogue with CFOs</li> <li>- interaction during project preparation phase</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>reports</li> <li>Policy documents</li> <li>Project proposal</li> <li>Project appraisal documents</li> <li>Financial reports</li> <li>Progress reports</li> <li>Field visit reports</li> <li>Evaluations reports</li> <li>Studies</li> </ul>
Policy and approach of partner organisation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- intervention logic of activity</li> <li>- envisaged beneficiaries</li> <li>- consistency of inputs, activities, output and envisaged effects</li> <li>- attention for quality improvement, access improvement, availability improvement</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>interviews</li> <li>Staff CFO</li> <li>Staff partner organisation</li> <li>Beneficiaries</li> <li>Staff of other organisations or stakeholders, like shelter homes, street workers</li> <li>Teachers</li> <li>Beneficiaries</li> <li>Employers</li> <li>External resource persons</li> </ul>
Analysis of regional/local demand for skills	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- demand of labour market (formal/informal sector)</li> <li>- connection of partner organisation with labour market, employers, parents.</li> <li>- knowledge of labour market and community at partner organisation.</li> <li>- training institutions interact closely in the world of work</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- kind of TVET offered (formal TVET, informal TVET, in service training, traineeships)</li> <li>- TVET geared towards informal/ formal sector</li> </ul>	
	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- objectives of TVET activities</li> <li>- numbers of courses and other training presented</li> </ul>	

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- monitoring of activities/achievements</li> <li>- resources used for implementation</li> </ul>	
<p>Execution of TVET activities by partner organisations</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- entrance requirements</li> <li>- selection of participants</li> <li>- equity in access for women/girls</li> <li>- school fees paid/ number of children receiving schooling funds</li> <li>- barriers to access (space, distance, cost to household, insufficient and overworked teachers, education not relevant)</li> <li>- facilities available</li> <li>- equipment available</li> <li>- performance and use of equipment</li> <li>- books/ tools available</li> <li>- professional level of teachers and management of school and adequate performance of all staff</li> <li>- presence of teachers</li> <li>- practical and theoretical elements included in the training</li> <li>- vocational guidance is available from the beginning of the learner's training (the right choice of programme), during the training (learning matters, personal problems, financial difficulties, etc.), and the end of training (finding employment)</li> <li>- balance between technical training and basic skills training like entrepreneurship and how to apply for a job.</li> </ul>	
<p>Selection of participants of TVET</p>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- guidance after training by partner organisation or other organisation in finding a job (introduction to employers, training on how to apply for a job, monitor and support the graduates to expedite the integration in the labour market).</li> <li>- resources offered (tool box, micro credit)</li> </ul>	

Access to TVET	by partner organisation to start own business	
Quality of TVET		
Follow-up of trainees		
<b>Output</b>		
<b>Key indicators</b>	<b>Specific indicators and issues</b>	<b>Resources</b>
Number of trainees that completed courses	- enrolment in courses - drop-out rate / attendance ratio - pass rate/ completion rate - reasons for leaving training	id
Level of technical skills	- certification - quality guarantees	
Scope of skills	- level of skills other than vocational skills (like entrepreneurship, management/administration, etc)	
<b>Outcome</b>		
<b>Key indicators</b>	<b>Specific indicators and issues</b>	<b>Resources</b>
Number of graduates with job (in field of training)	- number of graduates employed (in wage employment, self employment, work on a commission) - number of graduates in informal/formal sector	id
Number of graduates employed otherwise	- number of graduates with job (in wage employment, self employment, work on a commission) - number of graduates in informal/formal sector	
Duration/ prospects of employment	- employment history (duration of employment) - prospects in labour market - satisfaction of employers	
<b>Impact</b>		
<b>Key indicators</b>	<b>Specific indicators and issues</b>	<b>Resources</b>
Income generated by employment	- revenues from employment	id

Livelihood situation of graduates	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>- housing</li> <li>- family situation</li> <li>- participation in community</li> <li>- higher self esteem</li> <li>- self reliance</li> </ul>	
-----------------------------------	--	--

Appendix 3, Logical framework TVET activities Edukans 2003-2008

**LOGICAL FRAMEWORK (3) - Verbetering van de relevantie van onderwijsprojecten en -programma's**

Algemene doelstelling	<i>Ondersteuning van basic education in het Zuiden in het kader van de EFA-doelstellingen</i>	OVI:	BvV	Assumpties
		1. Financiering in € voor projecten 2. Aantallen en soorten gesteunde programma's en projecten 3. Track-record mbt. sector- en doelgroepbereik	Jaarverslagen Edukans, projectadministratie buitenlandafdeling (database) Rapportage van gesteunde CSO's Evaluatierapporten	Geefgedrag en betrokkenheid van donateurs en vrijwilligers Edukans blijven stijgen Betrokkenheid Edukans in EFA-discussie
Programma-doelstelling	3. Verbetering van de relevantie van onderwijsprojecten en -programma's	<b>OVI</b> Landen- en themaspecifieke rapportages (kwantitatief en kwalitatief)	<b>BvV</b> - nat. en internat. onderwijsstatistieken - onderzoeksresultaten - rapportages Zuidel. CSO's - evaluatierapporten	* complementariteit (faciliterend) overheidsbeleid * aanwezigheid van kwalitatief goede CSO's * Inkomsten fondsenwerving Edukans stabiel * Structurele samenwerking met andere CSO's in NL

Intermediaire Resultaten (3)	3.1. <i>Community-based non-formeel beroepsonderwijs met gebruikmaking van aangepaste technologie in rurale settings (CB-NFBO)</i>	3.2. <i>Job-oriented skills training in urbane settings</i>		
OVI's (Objectief Verifieerbare Indicatoren)	3.1.1. <u>2005</u> : in India uitbouw van innovatieve projecten CB-NFBO. <u>ultimo 2006</u> : aanvullend op India uitbreiding via CSO's in Ethiopië, Oeganda en Kenia. <u>2007</u> : uitbreiding naar andere landen in Afrika (op grond van	3.2.1. <u>2005-2008</u> : Grotere inzet op projecten voor <i>job-oriented skills</i> voor stedelijke kinderen en jongeren in risico-situaties. Meetbaar: aantal CSO's, geïdentificeerde & gefinancierde projecten/jaar, doelgroepbereik,		* TMF-financiering maakt financiële en inhoudelijke inzet mogelijk, anders moeten doelen gereduceerd worden. * aanwezigheid van

	<p>evaluatie, aanvullend op projectenpakket India).</p> <p>2008: pilots in Peru (in Sierra en Selva-zône)</p> <p><b>3.1.2.</b> Projectinhoudelijk: * optimaal gebruik lokale hulpbronnen en aangepaste technologie.</p> <p>* vrouwen (groepen) dragers van de projecten en <i>empowerment</i> van de gemeenschap.</p> <p><b>3.1.3.</b> 2005-08: 12 missies voor begeleiding/staftrainingen door consultant India (tevens LEC)</p> <p>2005-08: 4 exposure visits van stafleden van Afrikaanse CSO's aan India, gefaciliteerd door Lokale Expertise Centra (LEC's; zie LogFrame 1).</p> <p><b>3.1.4.</b> 2006: Expert-meeting CSO's Noord-Zuid (zie ook 3.2.4.)</p>	<p>follow-up.</p> <p><b>3.2.2.</b> Aanpassing van curricula aan relevantie Afrikaanse situatie (<i>empowerment</i> en <i>life skills</i>):</p> <p>a. non-formeel curriculum voor drop-outs</p> <p>b. inbedding van job-oriented skills training in bestaande formele en non-formele curricula (complementair aan basisonderwijs)</p> <p><b>3.2.3.</b> 2005-08: 12 missies voor begeleiding/staftrainingen door consultant India (tevens LEC)</p> <p>2005-08: 4 exposure visits van stafleden van Afrikaanse CSO's aan India, gefaciliteerd door Lokale Expertise Centra (LEC's; zie LogFrame 1).</p> <p><b>3.2.4.</b> 2006: Expert-meeting Noord-Zuid (zie ook 1.5.)</p>	<p>kwalitatief goede zuidel. CSO's, bereid tot samenwerking.</p> <p>* goede samenwerking met verwante Noordel. CSO's</p> <p>3.1 en 3.2. zijn twee verschillende programmalijnen (verschil in strategie urbaan vs. ruraal), maar inzet deskundigen verloopt v.a. 3.1.3. en 3.2.3. synchroon omdat beide resultaatgebieden wel in één missie gecombineerd kunnen worden.</p>
<p><b>BvV -Bronnen van Verificatie</b></p>	<p>projectaanvragen, verslagen van exposure visits, onderzoeks- en evaluatieverslagen, geproduceerde evaluatieverslagen, geproduceerde trainingsmaterialen, inhoudelijke financiële rapportages, verslagen conferenties</p>	<p>projectaanvragen, onderzoeks- en evaluatieverslagen, geproduceerde trainingsmaterialen, curriculumverslagen &amp; conferenties</p>	

<b>Activiteiten</b>	<p><b>3.1.1. 2005:</b> plan van aanpak maken met Edukans-LEC's voor: a. uitbreiding projecten in Indiab. inzet in Afrika.</p> <p><b>3.1.2.</b> in Afrika. (in Afrika eerst beginnen met consultancy, monitoring en evaluatie door Indiase experts i.s.m. LEC'sa. meerdere reizen per jaar in India (groot aantal CSO's)</p> <p><b>b. per 2006</b> jaarlijks 2 missies naar CSO's in 2 landen in Afrika</p> <p><b>totaal:</b> 12 missies voor staftraining lokale CSO's en begeleiding (gecombineerd met Result 2 - zie Activ. onder 2.2)</p> <p><b>3.1.3.</b> productie/ aanpassing van trainingsmaterialen en curricula</p> <p><b>3.1.4. 2005-2007:</b> In India ontwikkelde lesprogramma's en trainingsmanuals aangepast aan Afrikaanse situatie, gedistribueerd en geïmplementeerd.</p> <p><b>3.1.5. 2006:</b> organisatie van expert-meeting CSO's N-Z in Zuidel. land</p>	<p><b>3.2.1.</b> 2005: plan van aanpak maken met Edukans-LEC's voor: a. uitbreiding projecten in Indiab. inzet in Afrika.</p> <p><b>3.2.2.</b> consultancy, monitoring en evaluatie door Indiase experts i.s.m. LEC'sa. meerdere reizen per jaar in India (groot aantal CSO's)</p> <p><b>b. per 2006</b> jaarlijks 2 missies naar CSO's in 2 landen in Afrika</p> <p><b>totaal:</b> 12 missies voor staftraining lokale CSO's en begeleiding (gecombineerd met Result 2 - zie Activ. 2.2)</p> <p><b>Overige activiteiten lopen parallel met 3.1.3. t/m 3.1.5</b></p>	<p>Bestaande kennis en ervaring is goede garantie voor succesvolle implementatie</p>
<p><b>Pre-conditie:</b></p> <p>* Aanvullende financiering cruciaal om strategische doelen in de gewenste mate te bereiken</p>			

## **Appendix 4**

Background paper: Technical and vocational education and training in developing countries

Mrs Hulya Kosar Altinyelken

Education and Development Division

Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs

August 2004

### **Introduction**

Technical and vocational education is broadly defined as “Education which is mainly designed to lead participants to acquire the practical skills, know-how and understanding necessary for employment in a particular occupation, trade or group of occupations” (Atchoarena & Delluc 2001). Such practical skills or know-how can be provided in a wide range of settings by multiple providers both in the public and the private sector. Formal education encompasses technical and vocational streams after primary schooling, and non-formal training includes pre-employment vocational training, on the job training (apprenticeship), and in-service training for workers. In recent years, the term ‘skills development’ has emerged in the development terminology as a concept that is synonymous to a broadly defined notion of technical and vocational education and training (TVET). As almost identical to TVET, the purpose of skills development is to provide a range of core skills (including entrepreneurial, communication, financial management skills, and participation in local decision-making processes) so that individuals will be better equipped for productive activities and their employment opportunities (such as wage-employment, self-employment and income generation activities) will be enhanced.

The critical role of TVET in furnishing skills that are required to improve productivity, raise income levels and improve equitable access to employment opportunities has been widely recognised (Bennell 1999). Moreover, a number of unprecedented developments in the last three decades made the role of TVET even more decisive. The globalisation process, technological change, and increased competition due to trade liberalisation necessitate higher skills and productivity among workers both in the modern sector firms and in micro and small enterprises. Additionally, workers who are displaced by the structural adjustment programmes in many developing countries pose an important challenge, as they need retraining for new occupations. Skills development has also become crucial as a result of HIV/AIDS pandemic. AIDS depletes scarce human resources and increases the need for training to replace skills lost across a wide range of occupations, particularly for Sub-Saharan Africa (Johanson 2002). Nevertheless, HIV/AIDS itself reduces the capacity of TVET systems to deliver their functions, since it decreases the supply and causes deterioration in the quality of the system.

The majority of the documents in the development field refer to fundamental importance of skills development and capacity building for economic growth, poverty alleviation, women's empowerment and social inclusion. Nevertheless, the role of TVET is absent to a large extent in most poverty reduction strategies. This neglect is particularly 'puzzling' since governments in the developing world and donor countries consistently emphasize the need for concerted efforts to build the human assets of the poor. Yet, TVET is accorded limited importance in donor financing schemes and discussions since the late 1980s (Bennell 1999).

This paper is intended to provide an overview of main challenges and reform efforts in TVET provision in developing countries. It is particularly concerned with work orientation at basic education level. Additionally, it will present an outline of perspectives of international aid agencies in an attempt to reflect on the recent trends among donor countries with regard to financing TVET in developing countries. In terms of geographical scope, the paper will mainly focus on Sub-Saharan Africa.

### **Main Challenges**

Studies aimed at examining TVET systems in developing countries, particularly in Sub-Saharan Africa, describe the system as being in a state of crisis already for twenty years. Therefore, issues or problems discussed within the context of pressing challenges and urgent reforms cover a wide range of topics. Nevertheless, this paper will only refer to four main challenges: quality, relevance, equity and financing.

For more than two decades (in the 1960s and 1970s), heavy investments in TVET were made; schools were built and teachers were trained. Nevertheless, these investments often exceeded the capacity to establish and maintain efficient TVET systems. As opposed to rapidly increasing enrolments, programme quality and maintenance started to deteriorate gradually (Herschbach 1997). Furthermore, dramatic budget cuts followed by structural adjustment programmes adversely affected public TVET systems to a large extent (Fluitman 1999). For instance, in sub-Saharan Africa, as a result of budget cuts investments were curtailed in TVET systems, and facilities and equipment started to decay. Recurrent budget reductions have also negatively affected the number, qualifications, pay, morale and motivation of teachers and administrators. The lack of qualified trainers with working experience in enterprises has been a chronic problem in training systems. The payment is typically not sufficient to attract or retain the best and experienced trainers. Moreover, reorienting and upgrading training programmes became difficult as a result of financial constraints (Johanson 2002). Some of the common symptoms of erosion in school quality are high drop-out rates, low pass rates, and failure to attract sufficient number of students. Low quality increases the concerns that provision of TVET by the public sector is socially wasteful and ultimately dysfunctional (Bennell 1999: 10)

Many studies refer to an evident mismatch between the training offered and the skills needed in the labour market. TVET systems have been reported to demonstrate declining relevance in recent years, particularly with regard to the informal sector (Gill et al. 1999) and growing need for self-employment (Grierson 2000). Decreasing employment

opportunities in the public sector and growth of informal sector have contributed to the increased irrelevance of TVET (Gill et al. 1999). Now, informal economy is considered to be the key ground by many both for economic growth and poverty eradication. Therefore, the ability of TVET to promote informal sector activities becomes even more important (Singh 2000). It is highly critical to make sure that what TVET institutions are teaching and training coincides with the needs and opportunities in the labour market (Fluitman 1999), since education or training do not create jobs on their own. In many developing countries, training provision is also criticised for failing to reorient its activities towards the poor. A significant proportion of the poor is smallholder farmers. Nevertheless, the provision of training services, most notably agricultural extension, to these individuals is rarely considered in discussions of skills training (Bennell 1999). Furthermore, TVET is considered to be largely irrelevant to the needs and contexts of its learners as well as wage-employment or self-employment possibilities in their environment. As Singh (2000: 599) suggests TVET systems should "...cater to the requirements of local development and be based on an understanding of the kinds of competencies people in the informal economy want, need and utilise, the socio-economic and cultural contexts within which they work, and how they cope and sustain their livelihood strategies".

TVET programmes are reported to often present imposing barriers to access as well as participation. Barriers to entry include gender, age, literacy, education, fees and physical proximity. Whereas, barriers to participation include the range and type of training choices that are offered, the level, style, and language of training, the manner of presentation and the teaching methods used, and course schedules (Grierson 2000). Similar to other sectors of the education system, girls and young women are seriously under-represented in TVET. For instance, TVET facilities are very often structured around male learners, therefore, females as learners, instructors, planners and providers of services lag considerably behind the males. Besides, gender inequality of access to TVET reveals a gender-biased division of labour. Girls who enter TVET are more likely to choose occupational specialities leading to the jobs typically occupied by women, such as hairdressing, secretarial work, health care, hotel work and home economics. In sub-Saharan Africa, young women make up only a small part of enrolments in formal training programmes, between 15 percent and 35 percent. As their access to skills development remains limited, they continue to be stuck in low paying jobs (Johanson 2002).

Inequality in access to TVET also arises from economic and geographical factors. The main beneficiaries in public and private training institutions are urban males who have relatively well-off backgrounds. Farmers' children are reported to be highly disadvantaged (Bennell 1999). Most TVET facilities are also geographically concentrated around the capital (Johanson 2002), imposing serious barriers to access for rural people.

The cost of delivery for TVET provision is much higher in comparison to general education. Infrastructure, equipment, training materials, institutional overheads and personnel costs are all relatively expensive. Besides, a large proportion of these costs is fixed and vocational education tends to be lengthy. These structural factors and the modest scale of many programmes result in high unit costs. This situation is often exacerbated by low and declining levels of

enrolment, high drop-out rates, low post-training placement rates and limited application of the skills taught during training (Gill et al. 1999; Grierson 2000).

In terms of sources of finance and methods of funding, TVET programmes vary considerably. In most developing countries, public sources of finance usually predominate. Nevertheless, many governments have come under intense pressure by the World Bank and the IMF to privatise the funding and provision of TVET as it is not regarded as a 'basic social service'. In recent years, there is increasing calls to diversify the sources of finance to ensure adequacy and sustainability. Currently, the majority of TVET provision in developing countries suffers from chronic levels of under-funding. Some argue that the quantity and the quality of vocational and technical education in most sub-Saharan countries will continue to deteriorate because of decreasing donor financing of TVET and pressures on developing country governments to reduce their funding (Bennell 1999).

### **Reform Efforts**

By the beginning of the 1980s, the momentum to reform TVET provision has increased dramatically, particularly in Africa, partly because of advent of comprehensive structural adjustment programmes and the decline of donor support for TVET. Additionally, increasing unemployment among graduates of TVET, which resulted as a consequence of widespread economic and financial crisis, subsequent structural changes in the production system and the labour market, and the end of guaranteed access to public sector employment, and deterioration of the rate of return on investments have contributed to the impetus for reform (Atchoarena & Delluc 2001). Furthermore, demand side pressures to reform TVET systems worldwide arose as a result of wide spread introduction of new technologies, measures to increase competitiveness in international markets, attempts to make labour markets more flexible, and calls for greater equity in the society (Fluitman 1999).

The restructuring of TVET systems worldwide shows some common trends. Although previously most TVET systems were exclusively controlled by the governments, they started to opening up to a linkage with private TVET institutions and skills development providers. Entrepreneurship in TVET is encouraged through micro financing, greater autonomy to TVET institutions is being granted, the involvement of all partners in the field are encouraged to participate in decision making processes, and new financing as well as certification mechanisms are envisaged, the curricula for the training of trainers and apprenticeship schemes are being revised, and dual forms of training are promoted (Maintz 2004). Furthermore, current policy reforms, particularly in Africa, strongly favour sector approaches characterised by demand-driven training, greater private sector participation in training delivery, greater interaction with the market, strengthening of co-operation between enterprises and TVET institutions, and a significant increased focus on micro-enterprises and the informal sector (Grierson 2000). According to Gill et al. (1999) successful reforms transform school based vocational education into schools which resemble very much of general education in two ways. First, the content becomes more general. The content is a major concern since the content of TVET is becoming obsolete more

rapidly in comparison to general education subjects due to the rapid evolution of science and technology (UNESCO 1991). In recognition of this fact, reforms aimed at reorienting TVET strive to base curricula more on knowledge of science, mathematics and other general education subjects. Second, the vocational-technical track is made less dead-end, opening up the way to higher education. This also helps to improve the low status of technical and vocational education.

As a result of reform efforts, private provision of TVET has increased dramatically. The deterioration of state-run TVET systems in the majority of the countries in sub-Saharan Africa also created a market niche for private providers. Gradually, private providers have emerged in an uncoordinated and unmonitored fashion, and a large number of them operate illegally (Atchoarena & Esquieu 2002). Skills development by the private sector comes from three sources: enterprises; private training providers (including NGOs); and private informal sector apprenticeship (Johanson 2002). In many countries, little is known about the nature and operation of these entities. In Africa, it is assumed that private providers make a significant contribution to training provision. It is hoped that private provision of TVET would help to relieve public finances, promote useful competition, and would eventually contribute to cost reduction, better quality and labour market responsiveness. Nevertheless, for sub-Saharan Africa, there is no evidence that the performance of private providers is on average better than that of public institutions. Quality varies greatly from one institution to another and it is likely that variations in standards are much wider within the private sector than for public institutions (Atchoarena & Esquieu 2002). Since private training institutions mainly operate on basis of tuition fees, this raises equity concerns as well. Those who favour increasing role and participation of private sector vocational training advocate that government's role should be limited to provision of training providers, regulation of private provision, financing skills training for economically and socially disadvantaged groups, and providing skills training where private solutions cannot be found (Johanson 2002).

### **Work Orientation at Basic Education Level**

The introduction of work-oriented programmes into the curricula is advocated on the grounds that it could ease transition from school to work, lead to change in attitudes and facilitate community participation. Many programmes, ranging from introducing periods of productive work into the school curriculum to offering prevocational subjects, have been tried out in the past. Nevertheless, such trials did not always produce the favourable results that were envisaged by their promoters (Caillods, cf. Hoppers 1996). Such programmes that aimed to diversify or vocationalise general education are criticized for being expensive and difficult to implement. Additionally, they are considered to take valuable time away from basic academic skills and not making graduates more employable (Johanson 2002). Yet, the idea of introducing work orientation programmes at basic education level is attracting renewed attention of policy-makers in the light of developments following the first World Conference on Education for All in 1990. The objective is to make students more adaptable and to provide them with the skills that employers expect, such as creativity,

flexibility and a capacity for problem solving (Caillods, cf. Hoppers 1996).

Although policies to ensure universal enrolment of primary-age children have been launched in many developing countries following the World Conference, many of those children will still leave school, after six or nine years, without gaining any type of specific skills. Hence the interest on the part of developing countries in any programme which might facilitate their integration into any form of employment has risen (Caillods, cf. Hoppers 1996). Of particular importance for sub-Saharan Africa and some other countries where HIV/AIDS prevalence is high, teaching basic skills to students at basic education level is crucial, since the number of years that the students will stay at school is diminished whereas their responsibilities at home and within the community have increased as a result of death of parents or loss of traditional social support systems.

This new trend of work orientation at basic education level differs from previous attempts in the sense that although the former trials generally had a narrow 'vocationalist perspective'; the new initiatives have a 'general education perspective'. The former tried to secure an easier entry of students into the labour market by introducing a theoretical and/or practical element in the curriculum, with specific economic objectives in mind. The latter's concern, on the other hand, extends into the social and economic spheres in addition to the economic one. In the new programmes, students are provided with a basic understanding of the key aspects of work and production, as well as a wider variety of skills and attitudes, many of which have only an indirect relevance to work. The aim is to enhance the acquisition of work-related personal competencies, improve relevance by applying concepts and skills to work situations and ensure stronger involvement of the students in the learning process (Hoppers 1996).

It is also recognized that when it comes to effective functioning in the work environment and the capacity to adapt to a rapidly changing economic environment, general competencies (e.g. imagination, creativity, adaptability, problem solving and innovation), attitudes (e.g. self-discipline, tolerance and teamwork) and interpersonal skills (e.g. assertiveness and conflict resolution) are more important than functional technical skills. It is acknowledged that the development of these skills should start early in life (Loose 1988, cf. Hoppers 1996). Similarly, entrepreneurial behaviour in a broad sense is more important for young people in terms of entry into self-employment than excelling at specific vocational practices.

Introducing work-orientation programme at basic education level still remains a fairly controversial issue. The questions such as: 'How work-orientation should be introduced, and how much of it?', 'Should it be treated as a separate subject or should it be an orientation that permeates throughout the whole curriculum?' and 'Should it involve some work experience, and at what age?' (Hoppers 1996) will continue to dominate future discussions on the subject.

### **Views of International Donor Agencies**

Since the 1990s, Programme Based Approaches have become increasingly influential on the policies of many international organisations and donor countries. Avoiding fragmentation of development assistance, achievement of

enhanced co-ordination of financial means, facilitation of donor co-operation, promotion of national ownership, and providing support to partners' institutional development were the reasons behind this move. Programme-based approach and basket funding that are adapted to work towards the fulfilment of the United Nations Millennium Goals, have wide-ranging ramifications on TVET and skills development. Agencies' defined priorities are mainly oriented towards the Millennium Goals, resulting in little investment in TVET. For example, TVET initiatives need to be shown in their connection to poverty alleviation and its crosscutting priorities (Maintz 2004). Social rates of return studies which claim that private and social returns to investment in primary education far exceed those to secondary and higher education constitute another reason for reduced funding for TVET (Gonzales 1999). Basic education is considered to provide the most important skills for productivity and economic growth (Johanson 2002).

The three international organisations -The International Labour Office, the UNESCO and the World Bank, are the most influential organisations with regard to TVET. After the 1960s, through its financial clout and publications, the World Bank has become increasingly more influential than the ILO and UNESCO, which previously had the upper hand in advising developing countries about how to develop their vocational education and training (Takala 2001).

### **The International Labour Office**

Skills development and access to new technologies constitute the focus points of the ILO. Training systems experience increasing pressure due to technological change, the shortening of the product cycle, new forms of workplace organisation, and ever more stringent national and international qualifications for the labour force. Basic education is regarded as a necessary basis for adapting training to the challenges of economic globalisation, but it is not considered to be sufficient. In order to improve return on technical and vocational education, the ILO recommends promotion of partnerships with business, provision of incentives for co-financing, creation of skill-based certification systems, decentralisation and encouragement of the development of the private sector. State should regulate the training market rather than providing training itself. Moreover, certain disadvantaged and marginalized groups (such as women, unemployed young people, the long-term unemployed, older workers or disabled people) and sectors (such as informal sector) need to receive special attention (Atchoarena & Delluc 2001).

### **The UNESCO**

The Organisation has demonstrated a continued interest in the role of technical and vocational education as an integral part of general education (UNESCO 1991). According to UNESCO, vocationalisation of general education would help integrate students into the workforce and expose children to a range of experiences and skills from everyday life. The main recommendations of the Organisation are: establishing more linkages between TVET and other education sectors; better coordination between the formal education and informal training systems; higher private sector participation; orienting TVET towards sustainable development; introduction of new subjects in TVET

programmes such as environmental issues, communication, and acquisition of entrepreneurial, creative and teamwork capabilities; promoting broad access to learning and training throughout life, and making TVET an instrument for social inclusiveness and cohesion (Atchoarena & Delluc 2001). Within the context of the Jomtien Conference, UNESCO strengthened its view of the relevance of technical and vocational education in contemporary society (Hoppers 1996).

### **The World Bank**

The Bank's position on TVET has changed radically in the last two decades. Lending priorities shifted from TVET projects (nearly thirty per cent of its total lending to the education sector by the late 1970s) to basic education (reducing the share of TVET in total education sector lending to five per cent by 1994). Following the Bank's lead other major donors have also reduced their support to TVET.

The effectiveness of TVET was severely challenged on cost benefit grounds and lower social rates of return. The Bank declared the strengthening of primary and secondary general education a priority in order to improve the productivity and flexibility of the workforce (Bennell 1995). It maintains that vocational education and training in developing countries should be left to individuals, enterprises and private sector training institutions and government interventions should be kept at a minimum (Bennell & Segerstrom 1998). With regard to training, the Bank's main recommendations are: encouragement of private training programmes by creating a favourable environment for private investment and easing regulatory controls; promotion of in-firm training; improvement of the effectiveness and efficiency of public training programmes; development of more specific objectives, adapting to change on the labour market, granting autonomy to training institutions, getting employers involved in management of the training system and diversifying sources of finance (Atchoarena & Delluc 2001: 46).

The Bank's policy orientation has been criticised on different grounds. It is considered to be inconsistent over the years. Besides, reliance on the troublesome track record of public vocational schools in African countries and on evidence on general patterns from a few rate-of return studies were criticised since the findings of those researches were not regarded to be as clear-cut as the Bank's various review documents assume (Lauglo 1996). Moreover, the Bank's policy prescription to developing countries is considered to be seriously flawed both conceptually and in relation to the current TVET policies adopted by governments in the Northern industrial economies as well as the high performing Asian economies (Bennell & Segerstrom 1998).

Given the awareness of the developing countries of the urgency and the need to reform TVET systems and their commitment to reform, significant improvements in public sector TVET could be achieved with adequate support from the World Bank and other donors. Therefore, some argue that the Bank should be prepared to respond positively to rapidly increasing requests by governments for policy advice and substantive financial support. Failure to do so would mean disintegration of many public sector TVET institutions in time. Thus, they call on the Bank for fundamental

reappraisal of its TVET policy agenda and resource commitment (Bennell & Segerstrom 1998).

## Conclusion

In addition to the recognized importance of a skilled and productive labour force for development, increasing competition, technological change, the urgent need to raise the incomes of the economically vulnerable groups, and the need to replace workers disabled by AIDS lend TVET a priority status for many developing countries. However, after increasing the share of basic education in their development co-operation budgets following the resolutions of the Jomtien Conference, donors are facing the dilemma of how to prioritise between supporting basic education on the one hand and vocational and higher education on the other (Takala 2001). Within this context, work orientation at basic education level with a 'general education perspective' has attracted renewed interest in recent years. Work orientation is viewed as an essential dimension of a broad-based general education preparing for life, regarding the existing core curriculum as the major foundation for such preparation. This approach seems to reconcile the goal of achieving universal basic education and preparation of children and youth for the life of work through teaching basic skills and developing competencies. It can be viewed as a promising strategy that can improve the quality and the relevance of education and increase the synergy between basic education and TVET. Yet, this does not imply that TVET should be accorded less importance in donor financing, since a country without a skilled, productive labour force cannot achieve economic and social development and would more likely to be trapped in underdevelopment for longer periods.

## References

- Atchoarena, D. & Delluc, A. (2001) "Revisiting Technical and Vocational Education in Sub-Saharan Africa: an Update on Trends, Innovations and Challenges". International Institute for Education Planning. Paris: UNESCO.
- Atchoarena, D. & Esquieu, P. (Eds.) (2002) "Private Technical and Vocational Education in Sub-Saharan Africa (SSA): Provision Patterns and Policy Issues". International Institute for Education Planning. Paris: UNESCO.
- Bennell, P. (1995) "General versus Vocational Secondary Education in Developing Countries: A Review of the rates of Return Evidence." Institute of Development Studies. Working Paper 23: 1-18.
- Bennell, P. (1999) "Learning to Change: Skills Development among the Economically Vulnerable and Socially Excluded in Developing Countries". Employment and Training Papers 43. Geneva: ILO.
- Bennell, P & Segerstrom, J. (1998) "Vocational Education and Training in Developing Countries: Has the World Bank got it Right?" *International Journal of Educational Development* 18(4): 271-287.
- Fluitman, F. (1999) "The Roots and the Nature of Reforms in Vocational Education and Training: An Analytical Framework and Some Examples". *Prospects* XXIX (1): 55-65.
- Gill, I. S., Dar, A. & Fluitman, F (1999) "Constraints and Innovation in Reforming National Training Systems: Cross-

- country Comparisons". *International Journal of Manpower* 20(7): 405-431.
- Gonzales, M.C. (1999) "The World Bank and African Primary Education: Policies, Practices and Recommendations". *Africa Today* 120: 119:134.
- Grierson, J. (2000) "Vocational Training for Self-Employment: Learning from Enterprise Development Best Practice". *Small Enterprise Development* 11(3): 25-35.
- Hoppers, W. (1996) "Searching for Relevance: The Development of Work Orientation Basic Education". International Institute for Education Planning. Paris: UNESCO.
- Johanson, R. (2002) "Vocational Skills Development in Sub-Saharan Africa: Synthesis of a Regional Review". Washington D.C.: World Bank.
- Lauglo, J. (1996) "Banking on Education and the Uses of Research: A Critique of World Bank Priorities and Strategies for Education". *International Journal of Development* 16(3): 221-233.
- Maintz, J. (2004) "Agencies for International Co-operation in Technical and Vocational Education and Training: A Guide to sources of Information". UNESCO-UNEVOC International Centre for Technical and Vocational Education and Training, Bonn.
- Singh, M. (2000) "Combining Work and Learning in the Informal Economy: Implications for Education, Training and Skills Development". *International Review of Education* 46(6): 599-620.
- Takala, T. (2001) "Views of the 'Centre' versus Finland's Support to Prevocational and Vocational Education in Developing Countries". *Journal of Education and Work* 14(2): 251-265.
- UNESCO (1991) "The Role of Technical and Vocational Education and Its Part in and Contribution to the Efforts Undertaken Towards Basic Education for All". General Conference Twenty –sixth Session, Paris 1991.

## ANNEX 2 – EVALUATION FRAMEWORK

---

### Evaluation question 1:

What are the similarities and differences in policy and practice of the different CFOs?

#### Rationale

In the period 2003-2006 ICCO made money of the Ministry of development Cooperation available for Dutch civil society organisations to finance qualitative good development projects, which comply with the MFS policy framework. Edukans and Woord en Daad were receiving block grants from ICCO for a particular amount of their TVET activities.

In this period ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad have their own identity, own policies and practices on TVET. The policy plans differ in focus, themes, strategies and priorities. However, certain collaboration exists between these organisations, not at least to strengthen mutually the monitoring and evaluation system related to TVET.

In the ToR is asked to analyse the process of working within the financing modality of the ICCO block grant and to analyse what has been the influence on the development of TVET policies and objectives of the individual organisations. It will be interesting to analyse to what extent cross fertilisation of policy and practice of TVET has happened between the CFOs (although this never has been an explicit objective in the partnership between the three CFOs).

Besides an analysis of the policy and practice on TVET, it will be interesting to analyse the perspectives with regard to lobby and advocacy on TVET. Although not much has happened, it will be interesting - for future policy development - to analyse what lobby and advocacy activities have been developed on the theme “education for all” and what could be the place of TVET in this perspective.

Since 2007 the ICCO alliance with participation of –amongst others- Edukans has been created. In relation to a core program on basic education the alliance selected four themes to focus on in the coming years: (1) education for work, (2) HIV/AIDS and education, (3) education in (post)conflict areas and (4) education for marginalized people. TVET activities will be part of the theme “education for work”. Woord en Daad is not participating in the programme on education for work but did submit an own subsidy request to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs. However, the ICCO alliance and Woord en Daad agreed on a strategic partnership on this topic. Results of this evaluation need to foster the further policy development of TVET of all three organisations.

Judgement criteria	Indicators	Sources of information
1.1. Policy development regarding TVET	1.1.1 Existence of TVET policy paper with clear strategic choices and selection criteria	Analysis of policy and strategic documents
	1.1.2. Evidence of cross fertilisation of policy and practice of TVET activities between the CFOs	Interviews with staff at CFOs
	1.1.3. Development of suitable PME systems	Reports of capacity building initiatives
	1.1.4. Efforts to mainstream gender and HIV/AIDS into the programmes and strategies of the CFO with regard to TVET	Analysis of the PME system
1.1. Practice on TVET	1.2.1. number of partner organisations	Analysis of partner

	supported for TVET activities (+ indication of proportion of TVET in relation to the overall partners portfolio)	portfolio: project proposals, project appraisal documents, financial reports and progress reports
	1.2.2. Budget spend for TVET programmes (total budget + co-financing budget and proportion to the overall budget)	Interviews with CFOs and partner organisations
	1.2.3. Kind of TVET activities supported	
	1.2.4. Evidence of capacity building activities for partner organisations (ex. linking and learning, stimulating partnerships, policy dialogue, institutional strengthening, organisational development)	
1.3. TVET has been integrated in advocacy and lobby activities with regard to "education for all" of CFOs (national and international campaigns)	1.3.1. Advocacy and lobby has been integrated in policy plans of the CFOs	Policy documents Interviews with staff of CFOs
	1.3.2. Evidence of support of advocacy and lobby campaigns in collaboration with like minded organisations (on TVET)	Interviews with relevant stakeholders Reports of meetings
	1.3.3. CFOs are perceived as valuable interlocutors to advocate for TVET in a developing context	

## Evaluation question 2:

To what extent have ICCO, Woord en Daad and Edukans contributed to the organisational and institutional strengthening of their partner organisations and to an improved performance of the TVET activities executed by the partner organisations?

### Rationale

The evaluation will focus on the assessment of efficiency, effectiveness, mid term impact, relevance and sustainability of TVET activities. In this evaluation question we'll focus on the input-output relation. This evaluation question concerns the performance of the partner organisations, supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad and to what extent the policy and practice of the partner organisation has been efficient, effective, relevant and sustainable.

ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad consider education as an important instrument for poverty alleviation and in particular TVET. Through participation at TVET, people will acquire necessary skills and competences that enable them to generate an income and to combat poverty. The three CFOs want to invest in the improvement of the access, quality and relevance of education, including TVET.

The policy and practice of ICCO were/are based on three intervention strategies: poverty alleviation, civil society strengthening and advocacy and lobby. Woord en Daad and Edukans mainly worked on poverty alleviation. The most important judgement criterion for evaluation question 2 is JC 1, focussing on relevant and qualitative TVET programmes as a strategy that contribute to poverty alleviation. However, we also did formulate two judgement criteria that refer to the intervention strategies civil society strengthening and advocacy and lobby. As these two intervention strategies will also be part of the intervention framework for the next financing period, we will analyse as well the state of affairs with regard to civil society strengthening and advocacy and lobby. The

evaluators will take into account the fact that the involvement of ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad in civil society strengthening activities and advocacy and lobby differs between them. However in the policy documents and interviews (with the CFOs during desk study) some examples of activities related to these intervention strategies were mentioned by all CFOs.

Several important issues and challenges on TVET are at stake: (1) effective TVET systems still have to be developed in most developing countries, (2) TVET has a low status and image, (3) financing of TVET (cost of delivery of TVET is high compared to primary and secondary education), (4) barriers of access and barriers to participation, (5) the assurance of quality. We will analyse to what extent partner organisations cope with these challenges.

The partner organisations operate in a changing context. Current policy reforms, particularly in Africa strongly favour sector approaches characterised by demand driven training, greater private sector participation in training delivery, greater interaction with the market, strengthening of cooperation between enterprises and TVET institutions and a significant increased focus on micro-enterprises and the informal sector.

In this context the CFO's started to adapt their programmes. We see an evolution of less investment in infrastructure and a shift in the focus on secondary vocational training to post secondary vocational and technical education and vocational skills training. We noticed a bigger attention to job mediation and investment in improvement of TVET activities (quality and relevance). Edukans started to create *local expertise centres* and Woord en Daad has created *job and business centres* We will analyse the advantages of these approaches.

<b>Judgement criteria</b>	<b>Indicators</b>	<b>Sources of information</b>
2.1. The partner organisations execute relevant TVET programmes that are of high quality and accessible for all (direct poverty alleviation)	2.1. Consistency of inputs, activities, output and envisaged effects	Analysis of policy, practice, financing and results of the partner organisations (inputs and outputs):
	2.1.2. TVET executed by partner organisations is cost-effective and sustainable	policy documents evaluation reports
	2.1.3. Attention for quality improvement with regard to the input, process and output of the TVET activities	interviews with staff Interviews and/or focus group discussions with relevant stakeholders (teachers, beneficiaries, employees)
	2.1.4. Attention for access and participation improvement: principles of equity are followed (access of the poor, access of women, access of vulnerable groups)	
	2.1.5. Connection of partner organisation with employers, parents and participants (good knowledge of labour market and the community and adaptation of TVET towards demands of the labour market and needs within communities)	
	2.1.6. TVET activities are complementary to national initiatives and sector wide	

	approaches.	
	2.1.7. Evidence of innovative approaches	
4.1. Social partners are in a position to play an active and effective role in TVET; a multi stakeholders approach is followed (strengthening of civil society)	4.1.1. Evidence of activities to strengthen active and effective involvement of teachers associations, parents associations and private sector in TVET programmes	Project documents Interviews with staff Interviews with relevant stakeholders (state, teachers, employees, parents)
	2.2.2. Participation of partner organisation at (public-private) partnerships	
	2.2.3. Evidence of networking, linking and learning between partner organisations, private sector, public sector and/or CBOs	
2.3. Advocacy and lobby activities for relevant, accessible and high qualitative TVET programmes	2.3.1. Advocacy and lobby has been integrated in policy plans of partner organisations	Policy documents Interviews with staff
	2.3.2. Evidence of activities of partner organisations to strengthening claim making power of stakeholders (beneficiaries, employees) for relevant, accessible and qualitative TVET	Interviews with relevant stakeholders (state, private sector, beneficiaries)
	2.3.2. Participation of partner organisations at advocacy and lobby campaigns or activities	
	2.3.4. Partner organisations are perceived as valuable interlocutors to advocate for TVET	

### Evaluation question 3 :

To what extent did the TVET activities contributed to an improved livelihood situation of the graduates?

#### Rationale

This evaluation question concerns the outcome and mid term impact of TVET activities. Did graduates of TVET find employment (wage or self employment) and are their revenues sufficient to improve their livelihood?

Practice has proven that vocational education as such does not equal employment. Education as such does not create jobs. Some of the CFOs (ex. Woord en Daad) started to develop a chain approach, supporting job mediation or private sector development (ex. through collaboration with micro finances institutes). In this evaluation we will analyse (1) to what extent participation at TVET activities has resulted in employment or income generating activities. Employment will be seen as wage employment or self employment, (2) what kind of skills and competences participants have acquired and (3) to what extent participation at TVET activities has had an influence on the environment (and communities) of the participants.

To analyse the effects of TVET activities, we have to take into account some points of attention:

(1) In recent years, it is recognized that when it comes to effective functioning in the work environment and the capacity to adapt to a rapidly changing economic environment, general competences, attitudes and interpersonal skills are more important than functional technical skills. In recent years, revisiting the way in which vocational curricula are designed motivated many TVET reforms. Introducing a competence based approach to curriculum reform is seen as a key principle to reduce the gap between the school system and the labour market. Competence based education and training includes specific occupational skills but also attitudinal and behavioural characteristics. There is a strong belief that graduates educated through this principle are better prepared to meet the requirements of the employers or the demands of the informal market (D. Achoarena, p.49, 2007).

(2) In many developing countries the informal sector represents the major share of employment in urban settings and job creation mainly takes place there. In particular, technical skills are crucially needed for diversification of products range to avoid saturation of conventional informal sector markets. Training for the informal sector largely depends upon traditional forms of apprenticeship.

(3) The performance record of vocational agricultural schools has been rather disappointing in most developing countries (D. Achoarena, p.64, 2007). Excessive focus on public sector jobs and on farm employment, lack of consideration for new areas such as environment and natural resources management, biotechnology or agribusiness are some of the limitations often mentioned. Nevertheless, TVET in rural settings is a key area in addressing the challenges of poverty reduction and development in rural areas. Hence, it will be important to select projects in urban as well as in rural areas.

These issues can be explicative factors of the attained or not attained outcomes and have to be taken into consideration.

#### Judgement criteria

3.1. participants acquired a sustainable level and shape/scope of skills that enabled them to generate an income (outcome)

#### Indicators

3.1.1. Skills acquired respond to the demands of the labour market and to the capacity and interest of the beneficiary

3.1.2. Guidance is available after training in finding a job (by partner organisation or an other organisation)

#### Sources/evaluation instruments

Employment histories

PME system of partner organisations

Interviews of staff

Interviews of beneficiaries

	3.1.3. Resources (ex. micro-credits) are offered to start an own business (if relevant)	
	3.1.4. Number of beneficiaries employed (formal or informal sector, wage employment or self employment)	
	3.1.5. Employers are satisfied with the graduates that have been trained (perspective on sustainable employment)	
3.2. Improved livelihoods (impact)	3.2.1. income generated by employment is sufficient and sustainable	Interviews of beneficiaries Interviews with relevant stakeholders
	3.2.2. improved self esteem and self reliance of beneficiaries	Focus group discussions
	3.2.3. improved housing condition and positive influence on the family situation	PME system of partner organisations
	3.2.4. Improved participation/integration of beneficiaries in the community	
	3.2.5. Evidence of influence of income generating activities by ex-trainees on the economic development of their communities.	

## **ANNEX 3 – CHRONOGRAM OF THE EVALUATION**

---

- A. Inception phase (May 2007 – August 2007)
  - A.1 Study of documents
  - A.2 Visits to the three CFOs (24/05/07 – Woord en daad and ICCO; 25/05/07 – Edukans)
  - A.3 Development of database to analyse TVET portfolio
  - A.4 Analysis of TVET portfolio: deskwork at the offices of the CFOs by a junior consultants (June 2007)
  - A.5 Development of an evaluation framework
  - A.6 Redaction of inception report
  - A.7 Discussion with CFOs on the inception report
  
- B. Overall preparations for the field visits (September 2007)
  - B.1 Internal meeting team international consultants (10 September 2007)
  - B.2. Development of tools for data collection (interview guidelines, questionnaires, formats for reporting, etc)
  - B.3 Practical organisation of each field mission by local consultant and coordinator of the evaluation
  - B.4 Preparatory study by local consultant in each country to be visited
  
- C. Field missions (September 2007 – November 2007)
  - C.1 Mission to India from 16.09.07 till 6.10.07
  - C.2 Mission to Ethiopia from 29.09.07 till 12.10.07
  - C.3 Mission to Kenya from
  - C.4 Mission to Albania from 30.10.07 till 10.10.07
  - C.5. Drafting of field reports
  
- D. In depth interviews with the CFOs in The Netherlands
  - D.1 One day visit per CFA
    - 04.10.07: Edukans
    - 08.10.07: ICCO (half day)
    - 16.10.07: ICCO (half day)

- 13.11.07: Woord en Daad

+ additional interviews by phone

D.2 Drafting of organisation report (November 2007)

E. Final phase of evaluation (Januari 2006)

F.1 Internal restitution between the international consultants (15 and 16 November 2007)

F.2 Drafting of synthetic report (November- 5<sup>th</sup> of December 2007)

F.3 Restitution on synthetic report with the CFOs on 17<sup>th</sup> of December 2007

F.4 Second draft of synthetic report and field reports (1<sup>th</sup> of February 2008)

F.5. Final draft synthetic report and field reports (20<sup>th</sup> of march 2008)

Detailed information on the programmes of the missions are added to the country reports (which are available on request)

## **ANNEX 4 – OVERVIEW OF WORKING DOCUMENTS**

---

Inception report

Field report mission India

Field report mission Ethiopia

Field report mission Albania

Field report mission Kenya

These documents are considered as working documents and are available upon request (ICCO).

In these documents lists are added of persons met and documents consulted.

## **ANNEXE 5 – BRIEF DESCRIPTION OF PARTNERS VISITED**

---

### → **Albania**

**YMCA** – is a small women organisation, part of the international YWCA, aiming the empowerment of women. They developed 5 programmes: (1) women, youth and health, (2) human rights, (3) anti-trafficking, (4) vocational training and (5) services to women and children (day care centre and parents counselling). YWCA is based on a large membership and many of the beneficiaries become also a member of YWCA. YWCA developed two professional training courses: babysitters and janitor courses. They organise the trainings in house of at the centres of collaborating NGOs and CBO. YWCA also installed an employment office looking in a pro-active way for job opportunities for their beneficiaries.

**Educational Centre Elbasan** – is a resource centre with the objective to improve the quality of the VET system and the VET providers and to democratise education. ECE currently has a staff of 4 people (full-time) and 1 part-time (project base). ECE interventions focus in particular at input and process aspects of VET system. They want to support and stimulate good practice of VET course that can be used to influence the national qualification system, curriculum development and teacher training policy. To improve quality ECE enhances practice based education, provides schools with adequate equipment, develops qualitative courses and learns teachers to use the modern materials. They link VET providers with businesses. There institutional partners are the two VET schools, the VET centre of Elbasan and the university of Elbasan. ECE has good relations with businesses and with the Ministry of education and the Ministry of Labour. The centre also has an information centre where own short term courses are organised. To be a gateway of information ECE has developed a data base “Info-Kurse” that gives information on all VET providers and courses in Albania and ECE adapted SASH software to spread information on schools and inform the public on the schools in their community.

**EDU-PRO, Progradec** – EDU-PRO is an NGO, registered as a foundation, which aims to participate and assist in the transformation process of the Albanian Society through the transformation of the education and other areas connected to it. Currently the organisation implements two projects, a project directing kindergarten and elementary schools and a project with regarding to introducing counselling services in the school system. These projects (mainly financed by EED Germany) will not be taken into account in this evaluation. With regard to TVET the NGO has constructed a private vocational school, offering three and five years vocational education according to the official curriculum and a vocational training centre, offering short term courses from 3 to 6 months. The school and training centre are involved in following branches: hotel-

kitchen-restaurant; electric and car mechanics. The short term courses also offer plumbing. EDU-PRO is also involved in advocacy and lobby activities with regard to the projects they are involved in.

→ **Kenya**

**UNDUGU Society Kenya, Nairobi and Kisumu** – is a NGO that started with youth recreational centres for street children in the 1970s. It has evolved into a street children rehabilitation agency. Besides the provision of food, clothing and health care services to street children and youth from disadvantaged families, UNDUGU tries to empower these target groups. By education and training UNDUGU hopes to eliminate the option of returning or resorting to street life. The UNDUGU Basic education Programme (UBEP) enables children from the streets and slums to enrol in a three-year programme followed by a year of exposure to basic skills in order to receive some basic education.

**NairoBits, Nairobi** – is a NGO that offers ICT training to youth from disadvantaged areas since 2002. These youth are mainly from the slum areas of Nairobi and are selected by CBOs and NGOs working in the slums. Through four courses these youth are equipped with multimedia, social and business skills, which should increase their chances on the job market. The first course focuses on basic computer skills and the second course on the basic use of the internet. The third and fourth courses are equipping the trainees with the skills to design websites and to manage projects. The trainees are encouraged to do the work themselves with guidance of the trainers. At the end of the courses, trainees are ready to work as web designers.

→ **India**

**Woord en Daad India** - Provides vocational training to school drop outs many of whom have failed to complete the 10th grade of secondary school examination. Most of the students come from poor families and the courses offer better employment opportunities to them through residential training which otherwise would not have been possible. The courses are of one year duration, are largely informal in nature and are not recognised by the government but have support of a number of companies who provide on-the-job training for a month for students of select courses as part of their work experience with the related industries. The Vocational Training Centre (VTC) of WDI offers 10 courses based on assessment of industrial needs and its recently established Job and Business Centre (JBC) is making attempts to establish contacts with ex-student beneficiaries and assist the graduating students in finding appropriate jobs through mediating with the industries.

**Deepalaya** - A pro-poor and secular organisation is committed towards achieving universalisation of education, ensuring quality, reducing gender bias and improving accessibility for disabled and girl children. It works with the economically and the socially deprived sections of the Indian population and serves all communities rural or urban from whatever caste or creed. Its seven major developmental programmes pertain to education, health care, disability, institutional care, income generation & self help groups, gender equity, and advocacy. During the past 27 years of its existence, it has gained vast experience in the area of social development and has established good collaboration with government departments, institutions, service providers and other non-profit organisations. In the recent past, Deepalaya has worked on vocational education and training with assistance from ICCO which has nurtured both its institutional base and its TVET programme at Mewat, Haryana. Its TVET centre at Kalkaji, New Delhi supported by many donors apart from its own resources was evaluated by GTZ to be one of its best practice models for training and development in the informal sector. The model is further replicated and extended in the rural settings of Haryana.

**AMG India International** - Is an organization that is successfully implementing programmes in the field of education and health care. Its various projects and centres (including schools and hospitals) are spread across 9 districts of Andhra Pradesh and are managed by specialised staff. In Hyderabad itself, AMG runs an elementary school, a B. Ed training college, a T.B. hospital, and provides housing and rehabilitation facilities for 5,000 polio affected children and an equal number of leprosy affected persons. In the vocational stream, AMG runs an Industrial Training Centre (ITC) that is fully recognized by the government and is run on the course structure and pattern of government ITI's. Vocational education strategies supported by Woord and Daad are geared towards:

- (a) the development of livelihood skills among illiterate and semi-literate rural tribal women. In all, there are two programmes supporting the rural tribal women- one for the self- help groups established by AMG comprising mainly the illiterate women, and the other for the school dropouts and leavers at the secondary level of education.
- (b) the secondary school leavers and products of the AMG run ITC on the other. In the evaluation the team has focused on the JBC feature of the programme as this feature is funded by Woord en Daad.

**Ashadeep Foundation** - As part of Delhi Brotherhood Society- had been implementing developmental programmes in education, health care and rural and urban development for the past 24 years. However, as an independent organisation, it came into existence quite recently during the year 2005. The Foundation continues to cater to holistic development of all its target groups of all ages and is working towards bringing a positive change in the socially deprived minority communities of Delhi and Ghaziabad. Apart from its various formal and non-formal programmes in education, it supports residential homes for children at high risk, day care centre for senior citizens and for physically challenged children, community health and women's

empowerment programmes, programmes for early childhood care and those for rural and community development and personality training. The vocational and technical training programmes of the Foundation were started with support from Edukans to provide training to the unemployed youth from under-privileged communities in various trades in demand that could help them earn a decent living.

**Shramdeep** - Has been running vocational education and training programmes at its Technical Institute for the past 10 years prior to its association with Edukans. The organisation works for the overall development of poor masses of tribal, rural and weaker sections of the community and has programmes in various core fields of economic, social and community development. Its main training centre at its Headquarters in Nagpur caters to youth and women from urban slums that are semi literate and elementary / secondary school drop outs. Shramdeep is providing affordable training to the under-privileged so that they can live in dignity and can have a means to earn their livelihood. Edukans supported programmes of Shramdeep are located in the rural areas 200 Kms from the headquarters at Nagpur. The organisation has identified very backward and remote areas and tribal population depending largely on agricultural farming for their living. The targeted Korku tribe has young girls/women with little exposure outside their homes that are given very few opportunities for schooling beyond the elementary stage. Lack of education and health provision is the general tendency in these areas. Geographically the areas are cut off from major cities due to lack of transport, electricity/ power and other development facilities. Shramdeep supports vocational training programmes in two villages on Tailoring and Sewing and in Bamboo Art. The Diocesan Association has integrated the vocational programmes with its other developmental programmes under implementation in the villages. The approach thus followed is development and rehabilitation of the poor and the under-privileged through training on identified vocational skills.

#### → Ethiopia

**APDA** – APDA was initiated by a group of volunteers with the mission of *“Empowering Afar women, men and children through education, health care, natural resource management and access to markets and information so that they will be able to actively participate in all decisions that affect their lives and culture.”*<sup>6</sup> The main objectives of APDA are focused on Education and Health. They include creating a literate base through Non-formal education and developing the Afar language to enable it to be used in daily transactions; reducing infant and maternal mortality as well as morbidity rates; and improving the health and social status of Afar pastoral communities. The livelihood of the people of Afar is heavily dependent on livestock. The people have to move frequently in search of water and grazing land for their livestock. As a result, the system of service

---

<sup>6</sup> Afar Pastoralist Development Association, Ethiopia, Good Practices in Literacy/Non-Formal Education and Primary Health care Programs.

delivery through fixed institutions does not comply or meet the terms of pastoral societies' life style like the Afar except those settlements/towns situated on the main roads connecting Afar with the hinterland.

The operational area of APDA is one of the peripheral regions with poor basic services and inadequate social and economic infrastructure. As a result of the implementation of the decentralization process, Afar has become an autonomous region with a certain level of power and authority to plan and implement its own development needs. In spite of this, the lack of institutional capacity (shortage of qualified human resources) and other factors like remoteness of the region have constrained the regional government from implementing responsive development programs. Provision of conventional education, health, water and other necessities by the government is limited.

APDA has adopted a strategy that fits into the pastoralist way of life (characterized by mobility) as an overriding mechanism for implementing its programs. Together with the formal government authorities, the traditional leaders are playing a critical role in the project implementation processes. The following is a summary of the approach:

*Agreement of collaboration is reached with the communities; Community Development committees are formed; the community then selects a community teacher and a health worker; development workers move with the communities; development activities are reviewed and planned on quarterly basis; all equipment and facilities are portable/movable.*

Given the shortage of trained human resources and the low level of literacy, it is difficult to find adequate number of candidates with the required qualification and that are literate in Afar language. In such situation non-literate persons are selected but have to be made literate. *"The important criterion is that they are highly motivated to facilitate development and change within the community."*<sup>7</sup> Residential TVET programs are organized (not on regular basis though) as income generating schemes to help trainees to help themselves. During the time of the evaluation, a residential training was being executed outside Afar using a private venue. A private training institution was in charge of the training on leather craft and textiles, as well as tie and dye.

**Ethiopian AID** – Ethiopian Aid (EA) was established in the mid 90's and currently operates in three regions (Addis Ababa, Amhara and Oromiya). The main trust of Ethiopian Aid is *"to enhance the capacity of individuals (marginalized women, children and men), families and communities to develop their potential for sustainable livelihoods and to access basic human development services."*<sup>8</sup> EA implements one Integrated

---

<sup>7</sup> Afar Pastoralist Development Association, Ethiopia, Good Practices in Literacy/Non-Formal Education and Primary Health care Programs

<sup>8</sup> Ethiopian Aid, (EA) Programs, July 2003 (brochure).

Urban Development Program in Addis Ababa and two Integrated Rural Development Programs in Oromiya and Amhara regions. In general, integrated development activities are undertaken in all the operational regions depending on the needs of the areas.

Numerous objectives are stated under the various activities and the different program areas of EA. Among the program activities are vocational training; health in general and reproductive health, family planning and HIV/AIDS in particular; physical infrastructure upgrading; street children rehabilitation; small scale irrigation and environmental rehabilitation, water, Savings and Credit as well as livestock development. Not all the programs are implemented in all the program areas however. The Vocational training and the physical upgrading of infrastructure are specifically implemented in Addis Ababa. The overall objective of this vocational training is to reduce the problems of youth unemployment by providing marketable skills and enable the trainees to become self reliant.

**Hope Enterprises** – Hope Enterprises was established over 35 years ago (1971) to help the poorest sections of the population “to get to a place where they are able to help themselves and to support their families unaided.”<sup>9</sup> The ‘four ladders of hope’ are the basic principles and strategies of Hope Enterprises (HE):

- The “*basic needs*” of the target groups are fundamental (they are addressed by providing food, counseling and related services).
- “*Basic education*” is the next step in the ladder and it is addressed by providing schooling (beginning from kinder garden up to high school level and skills training).
- The third step of the ladder is “*competence*” that helps generate employment and livelihoods.
- The fourth step is “*sufficiency*”. This is the ultimate target of HE - enabling young persons (students) to become self reliant. This logical build up of the intervention is based on the principle of developing “*Value Maturity*” and a strong sense of purpose in their life.

As mentioned above, the target groups of HE are the poorest households whose economic capacity does not permit them to send their children to school. Beneficiaries (students from these households) are selected in a transparent manner through a committee composed of the local administration (kebele) and relevant authorities as well as representatives of the poor residents and based on clear criteria among which gender is one. The list of the selected target students is posted in a public place to enable the residents to express their complaints, if any, concerning the selection.

---

<sup>9</sup> Hope Enterprises, Annual Report of 2005.

## Overview of the TVET courses offered by the partners visited

<b>Partner organisation</b>	<b>Content of courses + level of skills</b>
YWCA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Baby sitting (basic skills)</li> <li>▪ Janitor (basic – low level skills)</li> </ul>
ECE	<p>Own courses</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ ICT</li> <li>▪ Languages</li> <li>▪ Autocad</li> </ul> <p>Support to public service providers (school and VET centre)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Car mechanics (basic skills)</li> <li>▪ Electricity (basic skills)</li> <li>▪ Kitchen (basic skills)</li> </ul>
EDU PRO	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Car mechanics</li> <li>▪ Electricity</li> <li>▪ Hotel</li> </ul>
UNDUGU	<p>About 25 different trades (basic skills) including :</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Motor repairs (paint spray, wire winding,...)</li> <li>▪ Carpenters</li> <li>▪ Computer and mobile phone repairs</li> <li>▪ Hairdressers &amp; beauty care</li> <li>▪ Tailoring</li> <li>▪ Electricians</li> </ul>
NAIROBITS	Website design
Deepalaya	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Computer Hardware</li> <li>▪ Computer Software</li> <li>▪ Electronics</li> <li>▪ Electrical</li> <li>▪ Air conditioning and Refrigeration</li> <li>▪ Photo lab</li> <li>▪ Cutting and Tailoring.</li> </ul>
Asha Deep Foundation	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Computer Hardware</li> <li>▪ Computer Software</li> <li>▪ Electronics</li> <li>▪ Electrical</li> <li>▪ Air conditioning and Refrigeration</li> <li>▪ Cutting and Tailoring</li> <li>▪ Mobile repairing</li> <li>▪ Beauty Culture</li> <li>▪ Textile designing</li> <li>▪ English Language Speaking</li> </ul>
Shramdeep	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Cutting and Tailoring</li> <li>▪ Bamboo art</li> </ul>
AMG international	<p>A Job Placement Centre (JBC) for students having followed courses in the ITC (TVET courses)</p> <p>Vocational education projects for tribal women. Concerns training in tailoring, sewing, embroidery, stitching of garments and making of home decoration items.</p>
Woord en Daad India	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Tailoring</li> <li>▪ computer</li> <li>▪ automobile mechanics</li> <li>▪ electronics</li> <li>▪ electrical and electronics, motor rewinding</li> </ul>

	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ welding</li> <li>▪ carpentry</li> <li>▪ refrigeration &amp; air-conditioning</li> <li>▪ Fitter and plumber</li> </ul>
APDA	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Leather (basic skills)</li> <li>▪ plain stamping (basic skills)</li> <li>▪ crafts (low skills)</li> <li>▪ leather shoe making ( autonomous work skills)</li> </ul>
Ethiopian AID	<p>Own courses (own VET centre)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Leather</li> <li>▪ Electricity (basic skills)</li> </ul> <p>private service providers (subcontracted VET centres)</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Hair dressing</li> <li>▪ Kitchen (basic skills)</li> </ul>
Hope enterprises	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Metal-Mechanics (basic and superior)</li> <li>▪ Electricity(basic and superior)</li> <li>▪ Hotel and Catering (basic and superior)</li> <li>▪ Construction</li> <li>▪ Wood</li> </ul>

## ANNEX 6 REACTION OF ACE EUROPE ON COMMENDS OF THE CFOS WITH REGARD TO THE FIRST DRAFT OF THE EVALUATION REPORT

---

We gaan in deze korte nota voornamelijk in op die opmerkingen die niet verwerkt werden in de tweede draft van het evaluatierapport en op enkele vragen ter verduidelijking.

### Commentaar opdrachtgevers

- Onderbouwing van een aantal uitspraken: (p.60) er staat dat men “on average” een acceptabel inkomen verdiende, hier worden alleen helemaal geen gegevens over vermeldt. En geldt dit voor alle opleidingen in gelijke mate?;

*In de tweede draft van het synthese rapport geven we gemiddelden aan (tabel 24 – een fout bij Kenya; de laatste zinnen betreffen de studenten van Undugu en niet Nairobi) en maken we een onderscheid tussen wage employment en self employment. De gegevens zijn gebaseerd op de interviews met ex-studenten aangezien hierover geen data worden bijgehouden. Daarom dat we schrijven “on average”. Er was geen tijd om systematisch te onderzoeken wat de verschillen zijn tussen de verschillende opleidingen/beroepen. CFOS zouden kunnen afspreken met hun partners welke gegevens er best systematisch worden bijgehouden in een goed student’s tracer system. Het inkomen kan daar een onderdeel van uitmaken.*

- Graag willen wij (nog eens?) een kritisch commentaar van de TVET specialist uit het team op de geconstateerde werkelijkheid van opereren van ons drieën. Is elke aanpak goed?

*Zoals we in het syntheserapport schrijven is de aanpak van Woord en Daad verschillend dan die van Edukans en ICCO. Met name de chain approach, de sterke relatie tussen de partner in het zuiden en Woord en Daad, het gebruik van de beurzen, overwicht aan secundair onderwijs, enz. We zijn van mening dat we ons hier niet over kunnen/willen uitspreken. Elke aanpak past in het beleid en de filosofie van een organisatie en is niet zomaar “kopieerbaar”. Bijvoorbeeld de rol van JBC’s: we bevelen aan dat alle organisaties de relaties met de private sector meer formaliseren (i.f.v. afstemmen curriculum op de noden van de arbeidsmarkt, zoeken en vinden van stageplaatsen, opvolging van stagiairs en het bemiddelen in het vinden van een job) en eventueel iemand vrijstellen die zich hier mee bezig houdt. Maar dat hoeft niet in de vorm van een JBC te zijn. Een JBC is bijvoorbeeld niet relevant (te duur) voor kleine partners. Er bestaan allicht verschillende alternatieven of combinaties: vb. samenwerken met een partner die vooral sterk staat in het bemiddelen tussen scholen en de arbeidsmarkt (vb. ECE), en/of meer samenwerken met partners die economische programma’s uitvoeren (zie aanbevelingen hieromtrent), samenwerken met partners die lobbyen om bij bedrijven de aandacht voor TVET(studenten) te verhogen, enz. Dus een pleidooi voor meer (strategische partnerschappen).*

*De keuze om te werken dmv LEC (edukans) is ook niet zomaar kopieerbaar. Dit past niet echt in de aanpak van Woord en Daad (ze hebben al een sterke en dichte band met partners en de partners worden van nabij opgevolgd). Het is bovendien te vroeg om de meerwaarde en effectiviteit van deze LEC te beoordelen. In India hangt de werking sterk af van één persoon, in de andere landen zijn ze nog in opstartfase. LEC’s lijken een antwoord op de vraag van partners naar meer ondersteuning en op het feit dat programma medewerkers verder afstaan van hun partners (dan in vergelijking de programma medewerkers van Woord en Daad). LEC’s kunnen een rol spelen in een strategie voor capaciteitsopbouw, het zoeken naar strategische partnerschappen en advocacy en lobby. Dit alles moet echter nog uitgewerkt worden. Het zal belangrijk zijn om dit ook binnen de alliantie een plaats te geven.*

- Wat betekent het bijvoorbeeld als de projecten redelijk geïsoleerd functioneren (geen banden met de community, de business community, de teachers of de ouders?) Wat is het verschil tussen een community aanpak van TVET versus de centre-based aanpak?

*Community based aanpak: aansluiten van TVET projecten op ontwikkelingsprogramma's in een bepaalde gemeenschap; bijvoorbeeld het ondersteunen van income generating activities, ondersteunen van lokale economische plannen, het ondersteunen van self help groups, het aansluiten op bepaalde ontwikkelingsinitiatieven zoals bijvoorbeeld het bouwen van een waterput*

*Centre based aanpak: TVET betreft een bepaald aanbod van kort of langlopende cursussen die aangeboden worden in een centrum. Daarbij kan het project ook aansluiten op noden van een bepaalde gemeenschap. Dit laatste hebben we echter weinig gezien. De bezochte projecten bieden voornamelijk klassieke opleidingen aan die naar klassieke jobs leiden waarvan de meeste niet echt aansluiten op bepaalde ontwikkelingsinitiatieven in een gemeenschap. Maar ook deze opleidingen hebben hun waarde en zijn zeer belangrijk voor de deelnemers.*

*We hebben vooral centre based approaches gezien en slechts twee community based approaches en het apprenticeship model van undugu. De twee community based approaches (Shramdeep en APDA) waren bovendien de zwakste TVET projecten (ivm kwaliteit, relevantie, jobs en income). We kunnen dus moeilijk uitspraken doen over "community based approaches".*

*Op basis van de ervaringen in deze evaluatie menen we wel te kunnen besluiten dat een centre based aanpak perfect kan aansluiten op de noden van een gemeenschap maar alleen onder voorwaarde dat er nauw samengewerkt wordt met CBO's of NGO's. Waarbij de samenwerking verder gaat dan het identificeren van beneficiaries. Een goed voorbeeld hiervan is de werking van YWCA. Zij werken nauw samen met organisaties die zwakke doelgroepen begeleiden bij ene herintegratie in de samenleving waarbij een TVET opleiding een onderdeel vormt.*

- Wat zou de link moeten zijn tussen TVET en economische projecten (seed Money verstrekken etc). Wat is de rol van versterken van personal skills en TVET?

*In het synthese rapport geven we aan dat we dit heel belangrijk vinden. Er zijn verschillende voorbeelden (zie een box met lifestory India) die tonen hoe belangrijk de economische steun is om met een eigen zaakje van start te gaan. Daarbij is seed money belangrijk omdat uit onderzoek (zie bron) blijkt dat de toegang van jongeren tot MFI moeilijk is. Aangezien alle CFOs (edukans minder maar lid van de ICCO alliantie) ook economische programma's ondersteunen, zou het mogelijk moeten zijn om hier meer linken te vinden. Het kan al gaan van het doorsturen van adressen lijsten van afgestudeerden aan partners die gesteund worden in deze programma's (zodat deze kunnen instromen in programma's van deze partners). Men zou ook verder kunnen gaan en intensere samenwerking kunnen zoeken. Woord en Daad is daar volop mee bezig. Samenwerking met economische programma's kan ook verder gaan, de private sector is in de meeste landen volop in beweging. Het ondersteunen van associaties van bedrijven, bepaalde sectoren, vakbonden e.d. zou een onderdeel kunnen zijn van een economisch programma waarbij de aandacht voor TVET opgenomen zou kunnen worden (vb. bedrijven warm maken voor TVET, afgestudeerden die een job vinden in de informele sector in contact brengen met vakbonden van de informele sector, vb in India; enz.). Een goed georganiseerde private sector biedt ook voordelen aangezien je dan een gesprekspartner hebt om mee te onderhandelen op sectorniveau.*

*In alle projecten was er aandacht voor het ontwikkelen van personal skills (behalve EDU-PRO). Studenten en ex-studenten gaven aan dat dit belangrijk was voor het zoeken van een job. Men kende meer zijn/haar rechten, had bepaalde communicatie skills verworven, enz. De intensiteit en de manier waarop deze personal skills geïntegreerd worden, verschilt van project tot project. TVET projecten die ingebed zijn in een algemeen empowerment programma besteden hier meer aandacht aan dan projecten waar dit niet het geval is. Dat hebben we ook aangegeven in het syntheserapport, namelijk deze programma's versterken elkaar. (vb. YWCA)*

*Competence based education hebben we nergens aangetroffen. Dit zou een onderwerp kunnen zijn om samen met de partners verder te bediscussiëren en uit te werken. ECE in Albania heeft hier al eerste stappen*

toe ondernomen. Maar dit lijkt niet vanzelfsprekend en is vooral mogelijk wanneer aansluiting gezocht kan worden bij het hervormingsproces inzake TVET op nationaal niveau. Zie link advocacy en lobby.

- Wat zou de link moeten zijn tussen basic Education en TVET;

*De deelnemers aan de TVET projecten moeten beschikken over een aantal basisvaardigheden inzake lezen en schrijven. Anders kom je bij een ander soort projecten uit, namelijk projecten inzake functionele alfabetisering waarbij alfabetisering en TVET gecombineerd kunnen worden. Dergelijke projecten zaten niet in de sample.*

*Goede basiseducatie is een natuurlijke voorwaarde voor goede TVET, maar de link in het bijzonder maakte geen deel uit van de ToR en werd als dusdanig niet onderzocht.*

*Aangezien TVET een slecht imago heeft is het belangrijk om al in het basisonderwijs promotie te maken voor TVET. Dat hebben we alleen gezien bij EDU-PRO in Albania. De link tussen basiseducatie en TVET is meer vanzelfsprekend in de aanpak van Woord en Daad.*

- de invulling van lobby op TVET gebied.

*We menen dat er meer moet ingezet worden op lobby, maar niet zozeer op partner niveau. De meeste TVET partners zijn niet gespecialiseerd in advocacy en lobby en lobby is niet iets dat je er zomaar bijneemt. Ook hier moet gezocht worden naar strategische partnerschappen met organisaties die dit wel kunnen opnemen.*

*Een LEC zou deze taak eventueel ook kunnen opnemen maar dan moet hierin specifiek geïnvesteerd worden. Advocacy en lobby inzake TVET richt zich voornamelijk tot nationale overheden. Samenwerking of afstemming kan gezocht worden met stakeholders die zich op dat niveau begeven: de Nederlandse overheid, GTZ om er enkele te noemen. Partners op lokaal niveau zouden voornamelijk informatie kunnen aanleveren om lobby dossiers te versterken.*

- Gender en HIV/AIDS: We zijn het er niet mee eens dat gender aandacht in het rapport m.n. vertaald wordt als kwantitatieve aandacht voor meisjes in TVET trainingen. De aandacht voor gender blijft zo te algemeen; er is meer over te zeggen in relatie tot TVET (bij de aanpak van de YWCA in Albanië, waar empowerment en skills training gecombineerd worden) .

*Wij menen dat we in het rapport verder gaan dan aandacht voor het kwantitatieve. We schrijven zelfs expliciet dat gender meer moet zijn dan toegang van meisjes tot onderwijs. We willen erop wijzen dat we in de beleidsdocumenten van de CFOs voornamelijk aandacht hebben gevonden over deze gelijke toegang van meisjes en jongens.*

*In het rapport hebben we het ook over impact van TVET op gender relaties in het gezin; het belang van gender based needs analysis, het belang van een aangepaste strategie om meisjes/vrouwen toe te leiden naar de arbeidsmarkt, enz. De meeste partners hebben geen goed uitgewerkt gender beleid dat verder gaat dan aandacht voor gelijke toegang van meisjes/vrouwen. We hebben weinig vernomen over initiatieven van de CFOs om het genderbeleid van partners te versterken. Wij menen dat dit uit het syntheserapport naar voor zou moeten komen.*

*Er kan inderdaad meer gezegd worden over de link tussen TVET en empowerment van vrouwen. Dit zou dan bijkomend onderzocht kunnen worden maar was niet mogelijk binnen de limieten van deze evaluatie.*

- Ook voor HIV Aids geldt dat niet echt duidelijk is wat vgs de evaluatoren nu de relatie tussen TVET en dit onderwerp zou moeten zijn.

*Hebben we in het syntheserapport verder toegelicht. De CFOs ondernemen reeds initiatief op het gebied van HIV en AIDS maar de link met TVET zelf is nog niet uitgewerkt: noch beleidsmatig; noch in de praktijk. In het rapport geven we aan waar de mogelijkheden liggen. Hier zouden de drie CFOs intenser op kunnen samenwerken aangezien er bij ICCO al meer ervaring is dan bij de andere twee organisaties + het feit dat de drie NGOs samenwerken met christelijke geïnspireerde organisaties waarbij het debat over HIV/AIDS niet altijd vanzelfsprekend is*

- Efficiency: De invulling en uitwerking hiervan is wel heel beperkt, de vraag wordt zeker niet beantwoord. Er is heel wat meer informatie beschikbaar waardoor hier meer over gezegd kan worden (Woord en Daad heeft hierover voor de veldstudie documenten opgestuurd met gegevens over kosten en aantallen leerlingen, etc. Ook in de dossiers is meer informatie beschikbaar waarvan niet aangegeven is waarom dit buiten beschouwing gelaten is).

*We hebben het stuk over efficiency herwerkt. Feit is dat we geen kosten-batenanalyse kunnen doen. In het inception report gaven we aan dat we dit konden doen in de mate van het mogelijke. In dit soort programma evaluaties moeten we dan kunnen terugvallen op bestaande evaluaties of beschikbare documenten en data aangezien er geen tijd is om een goede kosten-batenanalyse te doen per organisatie. Deze informatie was niet aanwezig, wel in zekere mate bij de partners van Woord en daad (zij het ook niet altijd volledig). We wilden geen kosten-baten analyse doen alleen voor de partners van Woord en Daad.*

*Het komt er ook op aan om af te spreken welke factoren in rekening gebracht moeten worden bij het bereken van kosten-baten. Blijft de moeilijkheid dat verschillende partners verscheidene programma's uitvoerden waarbij het moeilijk was om het TVET budget af te zonderen. We hebben bij elke partner de financiële gegevens opgevraagd en dat was al bijzonder moeilijk. We kregen niet altijd betrouwbare gegevens.*

#### Terug naar evaluatievragen

- effectiveness: wordt niet onderbouwd en gespecificeerd naar verschillende soorten activiteiten/ beleid

*We hebben de indruk dat de opdrachtgevers hun beleid met elkaar willen vergelijken. Het is echter appels met peren vergelijken. Je kan bijvoorbeeld secundair vocational education (vooral Woord en Daad) moeilijk vergelijken met post secondary vocational education and training (vooral Edukans). En de aanpak van Woord en Daad moeilijk vergelijken met ICCO en Edukans (uitgezonderd opmerkingen ivm JBC). Alle bezochte initiatieven ivm post secondary education (ook de projecten gesteund door Woord en daad) leiden tot dezelfde sterktes en zwaktes. Indien toch nog gewenst, horen we graag wat precies de CFO's zouden zien ivm verschillende resultaten van hun beleid. Het beleid van ICCO en Edukans was in de periode 2003-2006 ook voornamelijk project based. Het nieuwe beleid moet nog verder uitgewerkt worden.*

- 2.1. educational level beneficiaries: wordt niets over gezegd.

*We hebben alleen kunnen nagaan in hoeverre de studenten vonden dat een opleiding aansloot bij hun "educational level" en tot welke niveau de studenten worden opgeleid (basic level, opportunity for further education). Deze informatie werd verwerkt in het syntheserapport. Maar dit zou verder onderzocht kunnen worden.*

- 3.1. verbetering socio-economic situation: beter uitwerken en onderbouwen, huidige vorm voldoet niet

*We hebben informatie verzameld voor de geformuleerde indicatoren: Bijvoorbeeld 3.2.5. Evidence of influence of income generating activities by ex-trainees on the economic development of their communities Deze informatie hebben we verwerkt in het sytheserapport. Indien nog niet voldoende onderbouwd horen wij graag welke informatie en evidence jullie precies willen.*

- 3.3. empowerment community: onderbouwing; er staat bijvoorbeeld een uitspraak over dat studenten die in hostels leven niet terug keren naar eigen community, waarop is dit gebaseerd?

*In het rapport hebben we de bron van deze uitspraak aangegeven: Development focus en ervaringen van de lokale consultant. We blijven voorzichtig met uitspraken over de hostels in het syntheserapport. Meer onderzoek naar voor- en nadelen van hostels kan interessant zijn (en wordt blijkbaar nu opgenomen door*

*Woord en Daad). Voor sommige vragen moet eerder gericht onderzoek gedaan worden of een thematische evaluatie. Binnen deze programma evaluatie was daar weinig ruimte voor. Er werd ook niet specifiek naar gevraagd in de ToR; We moeten ons dan beperken tot een aantal uitspraken op basis van de uitspraken van de stakeholders bevraagd en de ervaring van de evaluatoren (en onderzoek mocht dat bestaan).*

- 5.2. sustainability of TVET: alleen in financieel opzicht beantwoord

*Dat is volgens ons niet waar. Bij vraag twee gaan we vooral in op institutionele duurzaamheid, bij vraag drie op de duurzaamheid van de effecten.*

### **Commentaar van dr. J.L.P. Ooijens en prof. dr. A. de Ruijter**

3. Wellicht hebben de evaluatoren zich te stringent gehouden aan de Terms of reference, waarin juist het accountability aspect sterk de nadruk krijgt. (Overigens missen wij in de Tor indicatoren als: duur van de cursussen en mening over deze duur, omvang van de onderwijsgroepen, betaling van docenten, type opleiding qua niveau, stijl en taal). Wij hadden verwacht dat de evaluatoren aandacht gevraagd zouden hebben voor bv. de relatie tussen algemeen onderwijs (basisonderwijs) en beroepsopleiding, het omgaan met lobby en advocacy (belang van goede systematiseringen van de ervaringen hiermee, lobby in relatie tot de naar voren komende angst voor politiek), de gewenste/noodzakelijke aandacht voor follow-up activiteiten, de mate van intensiteit van de relaties met de partners in het veld (immers: Woord en Daad: intensief en structureel en Educans: extensief en los) de voor- en nadelen van non-formal versus formal TVET, hoe een juiste gender en HIV/AIDS aanpak te realiseren, de community based TVET versus 'centre-based TVET en right based TVET). Voorts zou het nuttig zijn als de evaluatoren een korte uiteenzetting over het Local Expertise Centre geven en dan de vraag aan de orde stellen of het goed is dat Educans werkt met het Local Expertise Centre of moet juist naar een bredere alliantie met andere NGO's gezocht worden?  
Een reflectie vanuit het als annex aan de TOR toegevoegde paper was zinvol geweest. Het nieuwe beleid van de ICCO-alliantie voor de komende periode komt nu onvoldoende uit de verf.

*Als evaluatoren hebben we ons aan de ToR te houden. Een evaluation framework maakt dan nog eens duidelijk welke informatie verzameld zal worden en welke niet. Op een aantal van de gestelde vragen in deze commentaar zijn we dus inderdaad niet ingegaan. Een aantal zaken hebben we wel aangeraakt (lobby en advocacy; follow up activiteiten, relatie CFOs en hun partners, gender en HIV en AIDS, community based en centre based.*

*Het verschil tussen formal en non formal stellen we ter discussie omdat partners die centre based - post secondary training aanbieden ook het officiële curriculum willen volgen en als dusdanig even strikt het opgelegde leerplan volgen.*

*Het is nog te vroeg om uitspraken te doen over de LEC. We hebben dit verder uitgewerkt in het syntheserapport. We vinden het vooral belangrijk dat er meer gezocht wordt naar strategische partnerschappen in een bepaald land, dat een goede strategie voor capacity building wordt uitgebouwd en meer ingezet wordt op advocacy en lobby. LEC zouden hierin een rol kunnen spelen.*

*Het nieuwe beleid van de ICCO-alliantie inzake TVET was-op het moment van de evaluatie- nog zeer algemeen. Het is dan moeilijk om dit te beoordelen. We hebben in het syntheserapport wel aanbevelingen gedaan aansluitend op de keuzes die we in het nieuwe beleid hebben teruggevonden (vb. doelstellingen i.v.m. versterking civiele maatschappij).*

5. In het voorstel op basis waarvan deze evaluatie opdracht is gegund wordt het participatieve karakter van deze evaluatie genoemd. Ons is niet duidelijk geworden op welke wijze en in welke mate aan dit participatieve element aandacht is geschonken. We ontkomen niet aan de indruk dat zich dit heeft beperkt tot het hier en daar voorleggen van het verzamelde materiaal aan de partners/onderzoekten. (als mogelijke check op data) maar dit is dan toch wel een zeer beperkte invulling van 'participatief karakter'.

*Participatief hebben we als volgt ingevuld: ontwikkelen van een evaluatiekader dat bediscussieerd wordt met betrokken CFOs. Opnemen van de indicatoren die door de CFOs werden voorgesteld (reeds in ToR). Het evaluatiekader werd niet meer ter discussie gesteld aan de partners (aangezien de focus hier het beleid van de CFOs was). Het evaluatiekader werd wel voor het bezoek aan de partners gestuurd zodat ze zich konden voorbereiden en wisten welke informatie we zouden verzamelen. Bij de partners werden zelf – evaluatiesessies gehouden – soms tijdens een formele workshops, soms tijdens de interviews met staf. Op het einde van elk bezoek aan een partner werden de belangrijkste bevindingen/analyses kort gesloten en bediscussieerd. Op het einde van elke missie (uitgezonderd India wegens de afstanden) werd een restitutiemeeting georganiseerd waarop de belangrijkste conclusies bediscussieerd werden. De partners kregen nadien de kans om feedback te geven op de veldrapporten (check factual information en reageren op analyses en conclusies). Verschillende focus groep discussies werden georganiseerd. Partners deden zelf nog voorstellen van stakeholders die bevestigd zouden kunnen worden. Wij horen graag op welke manier het participatief karakter van dit soort evaluaties nog verhoogd kan worden.*

### **Specifieke opmerkingen Edukans**

- De definitie van vocationalisation van primary education wordt niet gegeven.

*We hebben dit nog opgenomen. We kregen graag van jullie een definitie. Primary education is niet aan bod gekomen in deze evaluatie.*

- Impact op community is klein. Jongeren zijn weg uit community, maar krijgen wel een baan. Maar wat wil of moet je met TVET? Waar kies je voor als Edukans? Liefst nog antwoorden op deze vraag.

*Dit is een beleidsdiscussie voor Edukans. Vanuit het licht op armoedebestrijding is het goed dat vulnerable groups een opleiding krijgen en een baan vinden. Als je echter als doelstelling hebt dat je gemeenschappen willen versterken en impact wil op gemeenschapsgerichte ontwikkeling, moet je andere projecten steunen.*

- Moderne markt makkelijk te bereiken? Is nog niet zo makkelijk.

*Nee, dat is niet gemakkelijk maar wel mogelijk (zie voorbeeld in rapport). Het is niet omdat het moeilijk is, dat je er niet op moet inzetten.*

- Constatering in rapport: publieke sector wordt niet benaderd. Die witte boorden banen zijn juist zo moeilijk te bereiken door gemarginaliseerde kinderen. Waarom wil je daarop focussen?

*We willen er niet op focussen. We hebben het anders geformuleerd in het syntheserapport. We willen vooral aangeven dat partners actief minder vanzelfsprekende markten zouden kunnen aanboren: bijvoorbeeld toeleiden naar andere social profit organisaties (vb home base care programma's) of -indien mogelijk- samenwerking met lokale besturen (mochten deze een lokaal economisch ontwikkelingsplan hebben).*

- Pagina 43: Cost-effectiveness. Financiële data ontbreken nu, maar deze zijn juist heel relevant.

*Zie opmerking hierboven*

- Aanbevelingen voor monitoring en resultaatgericht werken binnen TVET. Welke instrumenten moeten bij partner 'in place' zijn.

*Een goed student's tracer system waarvoor is afgesproken welke informatie verzameld moet worden;*

- Aanbeveling: Hoe kunnen de organisaties, gebaseerd op die conclusie, complementair zijn aan elkaar?

*Bedoel je de CFOs? Welke complementariteit zoek je? We vinden dat in de landen vooral gezocht moet worden naar partnerschappen en gezamenlijke lobby*

Specifieke opmerkingen n.a.v. de hoofdstukken:

- p.37: Curricula: 8e regel wordt gesproken over curricula are either old, changed every year or theoretically oriented. Dat het elk jaar aangepast wordt is toch niet per definitie slecht?

*Wanneer curricula elk jaar grondig gewijzigd worden, zorgt dat niet voor stabiliteit en rust in het onderwijs. En dat werd als negatief ervaren door de partners in Ethiopia.*

- p. 66 – voorlaatste alinea: die conclusie kun je niet trekken (dat courses supported by external donors higher quality zijn ...want er is geen controlegroep zonder TVET)

*We konden projecten die bezocht werden (1) onderling vergelijken (vb. hogere kwaliteit indien externe steun of technische assistentie gekregen), (2) met andere (publieke) initiatieven (vb. in Albania hebben we zowel publieke als private scholen bezocht en het verschil kunnen vaststellen) en (3) de ervaring van de consultants met onderwijsprojecten.*

- p 68: most partners offer centre based TVET? Niet waar voor Edukans.

*Shramdeep (community based), Asha Deep (centre based), EDU-PRO (centre based), Ethiopian AID (centre based, Unudgu (apprenticeship model). Misschien klopt het plaatje niet voor de hele portfolio maar we doen hier een uitspraak over de bezochte projecten.*

- p.28: Vergelijk van Table 12 en 13 zorgt voor een vraag. Hoe kan Edukans 75% van de projecten in post-secondary VET (table12) hebben en tegelijkertijd 43% van de projecten richten op de leeftijd 0-14 (table 13)?

*Zoek ik nog uit met Maayke. Het heeft waarschijnlijk te maken met (1) het feit dat leeftijden niet altijd overeen komen met primary – secondary education -post secondary education en (2) dat er soms geen gegevens waren over de leeftijdscategorieën van een bepaalde doelgroep.*

- p.28: in the upper row of table 13 is mentioned +15, while +18 is meant?

*Nee, het klopt, +15 is de groep die ouder is dan 15 en wanneer niet gespecificeerd staat hoe oud de doelgroep is maat het duidelijk om post secondary education gaat. We hebben een aparte categorie 15-18 jaar ingelast voor die projecten die zich specifiek op die groep richten.*

### **Specifieke opmerkingen ICCO**

- De definitie TVET die in het eindrapport wordt gebruikt is een andere dan die in de TOR. Waarom is hier voor gekozen?

*We hebben de definitie uit het inception report overgenomen.*

## Specifieke opmerkingen Woord en daad

### **Per bladzijde:**

1. p. 49: er staat dat er geen uitwisseling was tussen AMG en W&D India onder 'Networking, linking and learning'. Is dat nagevraagd? Er is namelijk bekend dat de directeurs elkaar wekelijks belden, maar de thema's daarvan weten we niet. Het klopt dat er geen geformaliseerde uitwisseling was, maar informeel naar ons idee wel. Ook zijn er meerdere partnermeetings geweest in India, waarbij de organisaties elkaar hebben ontmoet.

*Klopt, maar de uitwisseling blijft op het niveau van de directeurs. De board, de CEO en de staf zijn niet op de hoogte van deze gesprekken.*

2. pagina 51: wat wordt er precies bedoeld met het versterken van associations met de private sector? Opzetten VTC-netwerken was wel onderdeel van het beleid van W&D. Er was in 2006 1 VTC-netwerk opgezet.

*We bedoelen hier het versterken van associaties van bedrijven en niet van VTC netwerken. Wij hebben VTC netwerken verstaan als samenwerking tussen instellingen en niet als samenwerking met bedrijven.*

3. P.53: sustainability is er nauw gedefinieerd (financiëel, donors)

*Zie opmerking hierboven*

4. p. 67: Conclusies over job duration: kunnen die worden onderbouwd?

*We kunnen alleen afgaan op wat studenten en bedrijfsleiders ons zeggen. Er zijn geen data beschikbaar noch specifiek onderzoek. Zie opmerking elders*

## ANNEXE 7: COMMENDS OF THE EXTERNAL REFERENCE GROUP ON THE FINAL EVALUATION REPORT

---

### EINDRAPPORT TVET EVALUATIE (Prof.dr. A. de Ruijter en dr. J.L.P. Ooijens)

Na grondige bestudering van de documenten (eerste en tweede versie eindrapport, en het hieraan gerelateerde inception report, organisation report en de beschikbare fieldreports) komen wij tot de volgende constatering:

1. Tot ons genoegen kunnen wij concluderen dat het eindrapport zeker kwaliteiten heeft en talrijke aanknopingspunten biedt voor de verbetering van de TVET praktijk van de 3 CFOs. Op hoofdlijnen is sprake van een adequate beschrijving en analyse van materiaal, waarbij de onderliggende deelrapporten goed zijn gehanteerd. Als zodanig komt met name de eerste doelstelling van de evaluatie (*accountability*) goed uit de verf. Naast het uitspreken van waardering plaatsen wij echter ook op onderdelen kritische kanttekeningen.
2. De hoofdconclusies zijn heel algemeen en nuancering zou zinvol zijn. De *fieldreports* en de meer gedetailleerde analyses van de verschillende hoofdvragen bevatten naast positieve ook relatief veel negatieve uitspraken. Deze komen in de algemene conclusies onvoldoende terug.
3. Wij achten het van belang dat de aanbevelingen concreter worden uitgewerkt en waar mogelijk met duidelijkere adviezen (te ondernemen stappen, hoe, wanneer) voor de CFOs en partners. Meer concreet uitgewerkte aanbevelingen zijn bijvoorbeeld welkom ten aanzien van het stimuleren van innovaties voor de verbetering van de kwaliteit van het onderwijs, de inhoud van de teacher training, de aanpassing van het curriculum, het systematiseren van *good* en *worst practices*, het duurzaam maken van TVET voor arme groepen, de aandacht voor gender (vooral in het onderwijsproces zelf), de gewenste duidelijke strategie voor *capacity building*, 'the initial start up support (micro finance) by the TVET provider', de noodzakelijke samenwerking met de gemeenschappen en de koppeling van de TVET programma's aan *community development* programma's. Ook enkele richtlijnen met adviezen voor een goed *student's tracer* systeem waren zinvol geweest.  
Over bepaalde probleemsituaties konden de evaluatoren met vele informanten van gedachten wisselen en met hen zoeken naar concrete oplossingen. Wellicht hangt de algemeenheid van de aanbevelingen wel samen met het onvoldoende doorvragen en gezamenlijk bespreken van mogelijke oplossingen.

4. De evaluatoren hebben o.i. enkele belangrijke vragen die voor de tweede doelstelling van de evaluatie – het leereffect - essentieel zijn, niet gesteld. Zij hadden aandacht kunnen geven aan de relatie tussen algemeen onderwijs (basisonderwijs) en beroepsopleiding, de complementariteit met de Nederlandse ambassade voor wat betreft *advocacy* en lobby inzake TVET, het beleid van de ICCO Alliantie inzake TVET. Overigens merken wij op dat het beleid van de ICCO Alliantie inzake TVET op het moment van de evaluatie nog zeer algemeen was. Dat laat o.i. echter onverlet dat de evaluatiemissie mogelijk meer door had kunnen vragen en op basis van de hele evaluatie en de gevoerde gedachtewisseling concrete adviezen had kunnen geven.
5. De kwaliteit van de veldrapporten verschilt aanzienlijk. Dit is waarschijnlijk het gevolg van (a) de interpretatie en toepassing van het methodologisch proces zoals beschreven in het *inception report*, (b) het ontbreken van bepaalde gegevens bij de partners, maar zeker ook van (c) het onvoldoende kritisch doorvragen door de evaluatoren. (We ontkomen niet aan de indruk dat de evaluatoren zich meer dan eens snel tevreden hebben gesteld met de gegeven antwoorden). Zo is in de meeste landenrapporten onvoldoende ingegaan op belemmerende factoren voor *access*. Ook had in sommige landen meer naar het ontbreken van een gender-beleid bij enkele (CFO's en hun) partners doorgevraagd kunnen worden.

De Albanië-studie voldoet aan alle eisen en getuigt van goede materiaalverzameling. Daarentegen is de India-studie duidelijk minder van kwaliteit.

6. In het voorstel op basis waarvan deze evaluatieopdracht is gegund, wordt het participatieve karakter van deze evaluatie genoemd. Ons is niet duidelijk geworden op welke wijze en in welke mate aan dit participatieve element aandacht is geschonken. We ontkomen niet aan de indruk dat zich dit heeft beperkt tot het hier en daar voorleggen van het verzamelde materiaal aan de partners/onderzochten (als mogelijke check op data). Maar dit is dan toch wel een zeer beperkte invulling van 'participatief karakter'. Een uiteenzetting van de wijze waarop de evaluatoren vorm hebben gegeven aan het participatieve karakter van de evaluatie zou in het hoofdstuk over de methodologie op zijn plaats zijn.

Bovendien menen wij dat het belangrijk zou zijn geweest dat in het eindrapport iets meer had gestaan over de in het veldwerk gebruikte methode, de gevolgde werkwijze en de ondervonden problemen.

7. Wij begrijpen uit het eindrapport (paragraaf aanbevelingen met betrekking tot de evaluatie) dat de evaluatoren onvoldoende tijd hadden voor hun contacten met de partners. Wij denken dat die opmerking terecht is, maar dit hadden zij kunnen vermelden bij de inschrijving voor de evaluatie..

Ook geven de evaluatoren aan dat zij op bepaalde thema's van deze programma-evaluatie geen antwoord kunnen geven, omdat daar specifieke onderzoeken voor nodig zijn. Een kleine opsomming van deze onderzoeken was voor de CFOs handig geweest.

Utrecht, 12 februari 2008