



**ACE EUROPE** bvba  
Leopoldstraat 7-9, bus 601  
B-2800 Mechelen  
tel. +32(0)15 34 88 84  
fax +32(0)15 34 88 64  
info@ace-europe.be

# **EVALUATION OF THE TVET POLICY AND PRACTICE OF ICCO, WOORD EN DAAD AND EDUKANS**

## **FINAL EVALUATION REPORT**

### **Team of evaluators:**

Geert Phlix (ACE Europe – main author final report and mission Albania)

Gerda Heyde (independent consultant – mission Kenya)

Clemens Romijn (Ecorys – mission India)

Nuria de la Fuente Teixido (Ecorys – mission Ethiopia)

Ranjana Srivastava (local consultant India)

Lebesech Tsega (local consultant Ethiopia)

Buyela Wepukhulu (local consultant Kenya)

Mimoza Gjika (local consultant Albania)

**APRIL 2008**

*ACE Europe wants to thank everybody that has contributed in a constructive way to this evaluation, in particular all the partners of ICCO, Woord en Daad and Edukans. They have welcomed the evaluation teams in their organisation (sometimes at short notice) and organised the visits to the beneficiaries. We enjoyed the interesting discussions. Lot's of thanks to the staff of the three CFOs in the Netherlands for the pleasant cooperation.*

## EXECUTIVE SUMMARY

In 2007, three co-financing organisations, ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad, committed themselves to execute a joint evaluation of their activities in the field of Technical and Vocational Education and Training (TVET). Focus of the evaluation was the period 2003-2006. In that period part of the ICCO MFS money was invested through the system of the block grants in educational projects of Edukans and Woord en Daad. Since 2007 the ICCO alliance was built (with participation of Edukans). In the new co-financing system, the ICCO alliance presented an alliance programme including a programme 'education for work'. Also Woord en Daad developed a new co-financing programme, including a programme "Job and Income". The three CFOs wanted to make use of the results of a joint evaluation to improve their policy and strategies on TVET. The two main objectives of the evaluation are:

1. To assess the results achieved in a selected number of TVET activities supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad and executed by their partner organisations.
2. To give a judgement on the various strategies used by the partner organisations of ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad in the implementation of the TVET activities

This assignment was committed to ACE Europe. ACE Europe formed a team of 4 international consultants who were supported by local consultants in each of the countries visited. A junior consultant was engaged to develop the database of TVET projects funded by the three CFOs in the period 2003-2006. The evaluation was executed in three phases: (1) an inception phase, (2) phase of data collection, including field visits, (3) phase of analysis, synthesis, reporting and restitution.

The evaluators have broken down the overall evaluation questions into three evaluation questions:

- (1) What are the similarities and differences in policy and practice of the different CFOs?
- (2) To what extent have ICCO, Woord en Daad and Edukans contributed to the organisational and institutional strengthening of their partner organisations and to an improved performance of the TVET activities executed by the partner organisations?
- (3) To what extent did the TVET activities contribute to an improved livelihood situation of the graduates?

16 projects (out of 137 identified TVET projects), implemented by 13 partners, and two local expertise centres were visited in four countries: India, Ethiopia, Kenya and Albania. The selected projects were a good mix of long-term and short term TVET, secondary and post secondary TVET, formal and non formal approaches.

The sample was in coherence with the characteristics of the overall TVET portfolio-o. Additionally, several visits were paid to the participating CFOs in the Netherlands to discuss their policy and practice on TVET.

Policy development on TVET is quite recent for ICCO and Edukans. In the period of evaluation (2003-2006) no specific policy or strategy existed. Interventions were implemented through projects. In 2005 Edukans started to develop a policy on Education for Work with a clear choice to invest in community based non formal vocational training targeting the strengthening of income generating activities. Woord and Daad has a longer experience with TVET and has started to implement a Job and Income programme since 2001. This Job and Income programme is a logical component in the chain approach (with regard to basic education) as implemented by Woord en Daad. In the period 2003-2006 Woord en Daad further developed their policy and strategy (ex. the creation of Job and Business Centres -JBC's). Both strategies, the approach of Woord en Daad and the approach of Edukans, are difficult to compare and primarily reflect strategic choices that are legitimate and in coherence with their respective analysis and policy. Since the creation of the ICCO alliance, ICCO has started to develop further –in collaboration with the alliance partners, such as Edukans - their policy on “education for work”. The three organisations differ a lot when looking at the number of partners they support, budgets spent and way of working.

This lack of policy and strategy influenced the quality of support to their partners (to a lesser extent for Woord en Daad). However, each of the three organisations is clearly evolving from a strategy emphasising input in infrastructure (hardware) to a strategy that pays more attention to the development of the software. To date this evolution is not yet supported by a strategy on capacity building. As a result, most of the current interventions are projectbased and not embedded in coherent and integral capacity building processes. Not much linking and learning activities have taken place. Organisations have met each other but mainly to discuss the policies of the CFOs and their future relationships (except Woord en Daad that organised several expert meetings).

Most TVET partners offer centre based TVET rather than community based services. A minority of the partners visited offered formal, secondary education. The majority was involved in non formal post secondary vocational training, however mostly following the official curricula in order to deliver officially recognised diplomas. Only five partners offered short term post secondary courses. The other partners organised – usually- a combination of long term and short term courses with an emphasis on the long term courses, often to the detriment of the short-term courses. Apprenticeship systems are rarely funded by the CFOs, one apprenticeship project has been visited. Traditional trades are targeted. No innovative approaches regarding the educational process have been identified.

All TVET partners visited offered a considerable level of qualitative and relevant TVET programmes and many of them were perceived as best practices in their region/country.

All projects target lower skilled people, drop outs from the general system, and poor and vulnerable groups. All projects take initiatives to enhance participation of poor people (ex. hostels, scholarships, voucher systems to cover transport costs, collaboration with CBOs and NGOs that work with specific vulnerable groups, delivery of tools, etc.). All projects aim to achieve gender balanced participation, mostly by programming “traditional” courses that attract girls/women. The evaluators did not identify exclusion mechanisms based on poverty but the nature of courses sometimes required a certain interest, educational level or creativity.

The quality of the courses was mostly guaranteed through the quality and motivation of teachers, the quality and appropriateness of the curricula, the infrastructure and equipment of the practical workshops. Obviously the quality of TVET projects supported by external donors is higher than that of the public systems or projects not having access to external donors. A well developed strategy on teacher training and -by extension a human resource policy- are lacking at most cases visited. Only Woord en Daad supported teacher training with their partners (through funding, discussing policy to this regard, exchange of teachers with teachers in the Netherlands). Curriculum adaptations (to make courses more appropriate and practical) are limited due to the official standards set. It is striking that little attention was paid to equipping schools with good textbooks, available for all students (which is not a high cost and highly demanded by the students).

The TVET projects visited are generally quite relevant with regard to the needs of the participants and job opportunities within the region. To guarantee the relevance of the TVET courses with regard to job opportunities the partner organisations had a lot of contacts with employers and the business sector, though contacts were mostly organised in an informal way (through networks of the teachers). This close relationship with employers made it possible to find internships in business and – to a certain extent - to adapt the curricula to the needs of the businesses. However, formal meetings with business representatives to discuss the appropriateness of curricula rarely took place (except at the JBCs). Needs of the labour market are not well analysed. Partners did not have formal contacts with private sector associations nor collaborated with other stakeholders to execute pro-active market development research. Monitoring systems were failing to prevent market saturation. Specific courses were dropped the moment the organisations experienced market saturation.

Relevance of some projects is questioned by the high drop out rate of students. High drop out was particularly evident in the post secondary centre based TVET projects (not at the secondary schools) but also

in the community based projects. The relevance of the training for those who dropped out at early stages is weak since they mostly did not acquire marketable skills and might become disappointed and discouraged. The most important factor explaining this drop out is (beside when beneficiaries fail to see the relevance of a certain course) the length of the training. Little attention is given to people who dropped out or to weaker students who do not take profit of services offered, such as job mediation. No activities have been undertaken to prevent or follow up these drop outs. No specific attention is given to 'weaker' students.

TVET appears to be an effective tool in poverty reduction. The vast majority of students who participated in TVET, acquired skills (soft skills and vocational skills) that enabled them to adequately respond to the demands of the labour market. 70% to 90% (30% in Albania) of the students –who graduated- found a job or became self-employed. There was no distinction with regard to employment rate, between the different courses. The technical courses mainly lead to wage employment. The beauty, hair dressing and tailoring courses lead mostly to self employment (mainly women). Because of the appreciated quality of the performance of ex-trainees, job duration was guaranteed in most cases.

The most important factor for increasing the employment rate is the system of internships. All TVET providers organised short- or long term internships within companies. Trainees afterwards stayed within these companies or could more easily relate to similar companies. All TVET providers (except the community based projects) facilitated these internships, usually through the informal contacts of teachers with business people. In three projects this strategy was more or less formalised. TVET providers had formal and structural contacts with business representatives and training and follow up of the trainees was formalised in an agreement. Regular follow up was done by the teachers discussing performance and progress of the trainees. At the other projects these contacts and follow up were organised in an informal way and depended on the engagement and motivation of the individual teachers.

Another important factor is job-mediation. Only four TVET providers invested in job mediation (which goes beyond facilitating internships). They had contacts with potential employers (developing a database of potential employers), equipped students with solicitation skills and – in one case - intervened when negotiating the contract. Two of the JBCs continued to offer training once students were employed (refreshment courses, retraining). At the other projects, this job mediation was mainly informal and accidentally.

None of the partners visited was involved in pro-active research on job opportunities. The partner organisations did not manage to create new market niches, nor did they develop strategies to look for

business opportunities, in particular new economic activities where gender prejudices are less strong and where wages would be higher.

Attention to entrepreneurship (self-employment) and the creation of a business are weak at all the TVET providers. Not many partner organisations were supporting their beneficiaries with business training, business development advice, seed money or leasing equipment, nor did they cooperate with organisations specialised in business development. Not many students started an own business immediately after graduating. It appeared to be very difficult to start a business and to access credit as the microfinance industry is generally reluctant to give loans to youngsters without business expertise. Only a few partner organisations were supporting these people with alternative instruments, such as seed money or leasing equipment.

Income generated by employment was reasonable with perspectives of a substantial increase for the coming years. Income earned through self-employment was on average lower-at this stage- compared to income generated through wage employment. Unfortunately, this runs parallel with the gender divide as mostly women became self-employed. A well developed strategy to support sustainable self-employment was missing in the sample of partners visited.

The impact of TVET programmes on the communities was limited to a modest economical impact, mostly at individual level (set up of small enterprises; increase of spending power). There was little return of the TVET programmes towards the communities; for example, community development programmes were rarely strengthened by the TVET projects (few exceptions).

Access, quality and relevance of TVET programmes remain a challenge. In the period 2003-2006 support to TVET was very much project based. The challenge for the next period is to implement effectively TVET within a programme approach. ACE Europe has formulated several recommendations that should be taken into account. These recommendations are linked to:

- The development of the TVET portfolio: to include more apprenticeship models, short term post secondary vocational training; link educational programmes more with the economical programmes of the CFOs
- Within a programmatic approach, CFOs should look more for strategic partnerships: to strengthen parents - , teachers- , students- and private associations; to collaborate with organisations that are strong in advocacy and lobby; to invest in internships and job mediation, to collaborate with organisations specialised in small business development and organisations specialised in market needs assessments.

- To stimulate actively innovative approaches and experiments (with regard to the courses and with regard to the creation of new market niches and jobs) and to link partners with national TVET reforms and pilots supported by bilateral or multilateral donors
- To develop a capacity building strategy focussing on the four levels of capacity building: tools (such as curricula and syllabi development); individuals (such as teacher training), organisational development (such as the development of human resource policies to maintain well qualified teachers) and institutional development (see strategic partnerships and networking)
- To look for opportunities to work in closer collaboration with the communities: stronger relationships with local businesses, community based organisations and NGOs involved in local development and livelihood programmes.

## LIST OF ABBREVIATIONS AND DEFINITIONS

CBO	Community based organisations
CFO	Co-financing Organisation
EFA	Education For All
GTZ	Deutsche Gesellschaft für Technische Zusammenarbeit
ICT	Information and Communication Technology
ILO	International Labour Organisation
ISTP	Informal Skills Training Programme
JBC	Job and Business centre
NGO	Non Governmental Organisation
OVC	Orphans and Vulnerable Children
PME	Project Monitoring and Evaluation
TVET	Technical and Vocational Education and Training
VTC	Vocational training Centre
WPF	World Population Fund

Basic education	The whole range of educational activities, taking place in various settings (formal, nonformal and informal), that aim to meet basic learning needs. It has considerable overlap with the concept 'fundamental education'. Basic education comprises primary education (first stage of basic education) and lower secondary education (second stage). Source: Unesco (glossary)
Competence based education	Competency based education and training (CBET) is an education and training system that incorporates the appropriate knowledge, skills and attitudes into the workforce preparation activity. These competencies are based on the specific requirements of the various occupations. Competency-based training implies that the orientation of programmes aims at the development of abilities which may be applicable to a wide range of labour situations involved in the environment of an occupation. Source: ILO ( <a href="http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/ampro/cinterfor/temas/complab/xxxx/37.htm">http://www.ilo.org/public/english/region/ampro/cinterfor/temas/complab/xxxx/37.htm</a> )
Formal education	As normally used, the term formal education refers to the structured educational system provided by the state. In most countries, the formal education system is state-supported and state-operated. In some countries, the state allows and certifies private systems which provide a comparable education. Source: UNESCO

Informal education	Learning that takes place in everyday life without clearly stated objectives. The term refers to a lifelong process whereby every individual acquires attitudes, values, skills and knowledge from daily experiences and the educative influences and resources in his/her environment – e.g. family and neighbours, work and play, the marketplace, the library, the mass media. Source: Unesco (glossary: <a href="http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php">HTTP://PORTAL.UNESCO.ORG/EDUCATION/EN/EV.PHP</a> )
Informal sector	The term was first used by ILO in 1972 to indicate those small scale income generating activities which took place outside the official regulatory framework. A more recent definition (ILO-15 <sup>th</sup> ICLS 2000 – used for statistics and policy making) of an informal sector enterprise is based on the following four criteria. Firstly, they are private and unincorporated which means that they are owned by individuals or households that are not constituted as separate legal entities independently of their owner. Secondly, the goods or services of the enterprise should be (partly) for sale or barter. The activities can be carried out in the enterprise owner's house, in identifiable premises, unidentifiable premises or without fixed location, which implies that self-employed street vendors, taxi drivers etc. are considered as enterprises in the informal sector. Thirdly, the size of the enterprise in terms of employment is below a certain threshold (depending on national circumstances) and the enterprise is not registered under specific forms of national legislation. Lastly, the enterprise is engaged in non-agricultural activities, including secondary non-agricultural activities
Non formal education	Learning activities typically organized outside the formal education system. The term is generally contrasted with formal and informal education. In different contexts, non-formal education covers educational activities aimed at imparting adult literacy, basic education for out-of-school children and youth, life skills, work skills, and general culture. Such activities usually have clear learning objectives, but vary in duration, in conferring certification for acquired learning, and in organizational structure. Source: Unesco (glossary: <a href="http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php">http://portal.unesco.org/education/en/ev.php</a> -)
TVET	Technical and Vocational Education and training: Those aspects of the educational process involving, in addition to general education, the study of technologies and related sciences, and the acquisition of practical skills, attitudes, understanding and knowledge relating to occupations in various sectors of economic and social life. Technical and vocational understanding is further understood to be: (a) an integral part of general education; (b) a means of preparing for occupational fields and for effective participation in the world of work ; (c) an aspect of lifelong learning and a preparation for responsible citizenship; (d) an instrument for promoting environmentally sound sustainable development; (e) a method of facilitating poverty alleviation (UNESCO, ILO, 2002)

## TABLE OF CONTENTS

1. Context and purpose of the evaluation .....	13
1.1. Context of the evaluation .....	13
1.2. Objectives of the assignment .....	13
1.3. The evaluation team.....	15
2. Methodology .....	16
2.1. The elaboration of the four evaluation questions .....	16
2.2. Sample of cases that have been visited.....	19
2.3. Methodology.....	22
2.4. Difficulties encountered during the evaluation assignment .....	25
3. Technical and vocational education and training.....	26
3.1. General introduction to TVET and the issues at stake .....	26
3.2. Overview of the organisations and their policy with regard to TVET .....	28
4. Assessment of the evaluation questions .....	31
4.1. Evaluation question 1 .....	31
4.1.1. The process of policy development on TVET .....	31
4.1.2. Practice on TVET.....	35
4.1.3. Capacity building of the partners .....	41
4.1.4. Advocacy and lobby.....	42
4.1.5. Assessment of the similarities and differences in policy and practice.....	44
4.2. Evaluation question 2.....	46
4.2.1. The accessibility, quality and relevance of TVET .....	46
4.2.2. Involvement of social partners (multi stakeholders approach) .....	65
4.2.3. Advocacy and lobby by partners.....	68
4.2.4. Assessment of the achievements .....	69
4.3. Evaluation question 3.....	76
4.3.1. Outcome – Participants acquired a sustainable level and scope of skills that enabled them to generate an income .....	76
4.3.2. Impact – Improved livelihoods .....	84
4.3.3. Assessment of the achievements .....	89
5. Conclusions and recommendations.....	93

5.1. Nature of the TVET projects visited: conventional projects offering traditional TVET courses.....	93
Recommendations .....	94
5.2. Conclusions with regard to access, quality and relevance of TVET .....	95
Recommendations .....	96
5.3. Conclusions with regard to employment of the beneficiaries .....	98
Recommendations: .....	99
5.4. Conclusions with regard to the collaboration of TVET partners with civil society organisations (including community based strategy) .....	101
Recommendations: .....	101
5.5. Conclusions with regard to the policy and practice of the CFO .....	103
Recommendations .....	104
5.6. Reflections with regard to the evaluation policy .....	107
6. Annexes .....	108

## **1. CONTEXT AND PURPOSE OF THE EVALUATION**

---

### **1.1. Context of the evaluation**

In 2005 the Policy and Operations Evaluations Department (IOB) of the Netherlands Ministry of Foreign Affairs, which is responsible for the evaluation of Dutch foreign policy, planned to execute an evaluation of the involvement of the Co-financing organisations in the field of education. Selected topics for this evaluation were the Technical and Vocational Education and Training activities (TVET) in the co-financing programme. In October 2005, IOB announced it would stop the preparations for this evaluation due to the concentration of the available capacity on the evaluations already in execution.

In the take off of this planned evaluation Woord en Daad and Edukans, through which organisations part of the ICCO MFS money was invested in TVET activities, showed a genuine interest in the evaluation of the topic TVET. Both this interest and the investments already made in the evaluation's preparation were a reason for ICCO to ask Woord en Daad and Edukans to join in an own evaluation. Other reasons lie in the fact that Edukans participates in the ICCO alliance that started in 2007. The ICCO alliance submitted a new subsidy request to the Ministry of Foreign Affairs for the period 2007-2010. One of the areas in which the alliance will work strongly together is basic education (including TVET). Within the programme of basic education four themes have been selected: education for work, HIV/AIDS and education, education in (post)conflict areas and education for marginalized people. Woord en Daad will work together – and in close collaboration – with the ICCO alliance. The purpose of this evaluation is – besides accountability towards donors and other stakeholders - to draw lessons from the past to improve the programmes and the actual policy development regarding the sub-theme Education for Work.

### **1.2. Objectives of the assignment**

The two main objectives of the evaluation are:

3. To assess the results achieved in a selected number of TVET activities supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad and executed by their partner organisations.
4. To give a judgement on the various strategies used by the partner organisations of ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad in the implementation of the TVET activities

The results considered in this evaluation are the results achieved at the level of the partner organisations as well as the results achieved at the level of the target group.

The evaluation will focus on the assessment of efficiency, effectiveness, mid term impact, relevance and if possible, mid-term sustainability of the TVET activities. The evaluation criteria will be used to assess the results at both levels (partner organisation and target group level).

- Efficiency will focus on the input – output relation.
- Effectiveness with regard to the relationship between output – outcome (focus on the level of the partner organisation).
- (mid-term) impact focus on the effects (outcome) for the beneficiaries (focus on the level of the target group).
- Relevance assesses the extent to which the expected impact of the TVET activities was realised (are they really useful, both to the beneficiaries and according to the demands of the labour market?)

In the judgement a kind of benchmarking is asked regarding the different strategies in use. The benchmark will be given in relation to the evaluation criteria.

All questions will be assessed in a gender-specific way (where possible the data will be presented gender-disaggregated). Where applicable, the impact of HIV/Aids on the execution and the implementation of the TVET activities will also be sketched.

The key evaluation questions are (see annexe 1: Terms of reference):

1. How efficient were the TVET activities as supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad?

What was the relationship between the input and the output of the activities?

In implementing the TVET activities was there a relationship / cooperation with (local) government (institutions) or other institutions engaged in TVET activities?

2. How effective were the TVET activities as supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad?

Did the TVET activities match the educational level of the beneficiaries?

3. What is the (mid term) impact of the TVET activities as implemented by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad? Did the jobs found on the basis of the TVET activities contribute to the improvement of the situation of the target group both in terms of socio-economic situation, and personal development (rehabilitation, income, higher self-esteem)? Are the achievements at the level of the target group sustainable? Did the spin off of the TVET activities as supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad contribute to the empowerment of the community?

4. How relevant were the TVET activities as supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad?

Did the TVET activities offered match the needs of the target group (differentiate to rural and urban poor)? Did the TVET activities offered match the demand of the labour market / the chances offered by the labour market?

5. What is the mid-term sustainability of the TVET activities as supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad? Did beneficiaries of the TVET activities found a job (self-employment, employment on a commission basis, wage employment) in the field of training? To what extent did the TVET activities contribute to this? Is the delivery of TVET by the partner organisation sustainable?
6. What can be said about the process of working with the financing modality of the ICCO block grants? What influence did it have on the development of TVET policies and objectives of the individual organisations Word and Dee, Edukans and ICCO?  
What role did Edukans (and Woord en Daad) play regarding/ in the development of M&E practices of TVET projects as formulated for the new subsidy period?

### **1.3. The evaluation team**

This assignment was committed to ACE Europe. Geert Phlix from ACE Europe, in consultation with Gerda Heyde (independent consultant), Clemens Romijn and Nuria de la Fuente (consultants of Ecorys) formed the core group for this evaluation. They were supported by local consultants in each of the countries they visited. The CV's of consultants are available on request. Maayke Nabuurs (junior consultant) was engaged to develop the database of TVET projects during the inception phase.

The evaluation was executed in three phases: (1) an inception phase, (2) phase of data collection, including field visits, (3) phase of analysis, synthesis, reporting and restitution.

The following activities were undertaken to prepare this evaluation report:

- Study of policy documents of the three CFOs
- Interviews with staff of the three CFOs: policy officers, programme/country officers, staff responsible for evaluations
- Meetings within the team of consultants
- Elaboration of a database of TVET projects funded by the three CFOs
- Visit of partners in 4 countries (India, Ethiopia, Kenya and Albania)
- Drafting of 4 country reports (available on request)
- Drafting of 1 organisational report (available on request)
- Drafting of the present synthetic report

## 2. METHODOLOGY

---

### 2.1. The elaboration of the four evaluation questions

Based on the questions and proposals for indicators, as formulated in the ToR, ACE Europe developed an evaluation framework. This evaluation framework consists of evaluation questions that have been made operational by formulating judgement criteria and indicators. ACE Europe has tried to formulate three evaluation questions that address the 6 key evaluation questions and sub questions as formulated in the ToR. The three evaluation questions relate to each other. The first question concerns the policy and practice of the CFOs, hence analysing the CFOs themselves. The second question concerns the partner organisation and the partnership between the CFOs and their partner organisations (results at the level of the partner organisations). The third question is directed towards the beneficiaries, analysing the outcome and impact of the TVET activities (results achieved at the level of the target group).

ACE Europe has broken down the evaluation questions into different judgement criteria – usually worded as operational objectives (or sub-objectives). The achievement of these criteria (or sub-objectives) should be practically observed and assessed. The level of achievement of these sub-objectives allows a judgement to be made on the extent of the achievements. Hence these criteria are judgement criteria. Judgement criteria are sub-evaluation questions. The number of judgement criteria has generally been limited to three. Indicators have been formulated for each judgement criterion. Information gathered on the indicators allows us to assess the particular judgement criteria. Not all judgement criteria have the same importance with regard to the practice of the three CFOs and it is possible that some judgement criteria and/or indicators are not relevant for the practice of a CFO in particular. The evaluation framework including indicators has been added in annex 2.

Table 1: Evaluation framework with reference to the ToR

Evaluation questions	Judgment criteria	Questions in Terms of reference
<p>1. What are the similarities and differences in policy and practice of the different CFOs?</p>	<p>1.1. Policy development regarding TVET</p> <p>1.2. Practice on TVET</p> <p>1.3. Advocacy and lobby</p>	<p>6. What can be said on the process of working with the financing modality of the ICCO block grants?</p> <p>6.1. What has been its influence on the development of TVET policies and objectives of the individual organisations Woord en Daad, Edukans and ICCO?</p> <p>6.2. What has been the role of Edukans (and Woord en Daad) on the development of M&amp;E practices of TVET projects as formulated for the new subsidy period?</p>
<p>2. To what extent have ICCO, Woord en Daad and Edukans contributed to the organisational and institutional strengthening of their partner organisations and to an improved performance of the TVET activities executed by the partner organisations?</p>	<p>2.1. The partner organisations execute relevant TVET programmes that are of high quality and accessible for all (direct poverty alleviation)</p> <p>2.2. Social partners are in a position to play an active and effective role in TVET; a multi stakeholders approach is followed (strengthening of civil society)</p> <p>2.3. Advocacy and lobby activities for relevant, accessible and high qualitative TVET programmes</p>	<p>1. How efficient were the TVET activities as supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad?</p> <p>1.1. What was the relationship between the input and the output of the activities?</p> <p>1.2. In implementing the TVET activities was there a relationship / cooperation with (local ) government (institutions) or other institutions engaged in TVET activities?</p> <p>2. How effective were the TVET activities as supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad?</p> <p>2.1. Did the TVET activities match the educational level of the beneficiaries?</p> <p>4. How relevant were the TVET activities as supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad?</p> <p>4.1. Did the TVET activities offered match the needs of the target group (differentiate to rural and urban poor)</p> <p>4.2. Did the TVET activities offered match the demand of the labour market / the chances offered by the labour market?</p>

		<p>5. What is the mid-term sustainability of the TVET activities as supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad?</p> <p>5.1. Is the delivery of TVET by the partner organisation sustainable?</p>
<p>3. To what extent did the TVET activities contributed to an improved livelihood situation of the graduates?</p>	<p>3.1. participants acquired a sustainable level and shape/scope of skills that enabled them to generate an income (outcome)</p> <p>3.2. Improved livelihoods (impact)</p>	<p>3. What is the (mid term) impact of the TVET activities as implemented by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad?</p> <p>3.1. Did the jobs found on the basis of the TVET activities contribute to the improvement of the situation of the target group both in terms of socio-economic situation, and personal development (rehabilitation, income, higher self-esteem)?</p> <p>3.2. Are the achievements at the level of the target group sustainable?</p> <p>3.3. Did the spin off of the TVET activities as supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad contribute to the empowerment of the community?</p> <p>5.1. Did beneficiaries of the TVET activities found a job (self-employment, employment on a commission basis, wage employment) in the field of training?; to what extend did the TVET activities contribute to this?</p>

## 2.2. Sample of cases that have been visited

A total of 137 projects of TVET activities supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad have been identified for the period 2003-2006. Projects that started in 2006 have been included in the database.

The ToR asked to use following criteria for the selection of projects to be visited: 5 projects per partner; Number of TVET activities in a country; Reasonable TVET component in the project or programme; Reasonable financial support (more than 10.000 EUR); Distribution of TVET activities over different countries; Focus on projects or project phases that have been terminated in the years 2003, 2004 and 2005; No ending relationships.

Process of selection:

- (1) **Identification of the countries to be visited** - Based on the number of TVET activities in a country two countries certainly needed to be visited, namely **India and Ethiopia**. These are the two countries with the most TVET activities and with presence of partner organisations of all three CFOs. These countries had also been proposed during interviews with staff of the three CFOs. Additionally, **Albania** has been selected. This country comes in the third place regarding the number of TVET activities and has been proposed by ICCO (it is the country with the most ICCO projects). Edukans is active in Albania with 1 project.
- (2) It was difficult to select more countries where at least two of the three CFO's are intervening. In particular Woord en Daad is intervening in countries where the other CFOs are not present. During discussions with the CFOs, the CFOs found it relevant to add a fourth country to visit, despite Woord en Daad not having interventions in that country. This fourth country had to be Kenya as this is the country with the most relevant number of projects (and nature of TVET activities) of ICCO and Edukans.
- (3) **Further selection of projects in the identified countries** - when a CFO was only supporting one or two projects, no selection was needed. This was the case for the two projects of Edukans and Woord en Daad in Ethiopia, the project of Edukans in Albania and the project of ICCO in Ethiopia.
- (4) The sample was not big enough to take into account all selection criteria proposed in the ToR. It was not possible to identify projects that had phases terminated in 2003 and 2004 and had not ended the relationship. Eventually we selected those projects with the longest financing relationship but definitely with a financial relationship in 2006 (only indication of no ending relationship).

- (5) There was a big difference between the TVET activities supported with regard to the amount of money received. We tried to identify projects with a reasonable amount of money and with a component of more than 50% of TVET. We did not select very small projects.
- (6) In the final sample we tried to achieve a mix of urban and rural projects and a mix of the different inventory criteria (see database).

It went beyond the possibilities of this evaluation to develop a statistically representative sample of cases. We looked for cases that could be illustrative for the different kind of partners and approaches as supported/implemented by the three CFOs (and as present in the countries selected). The final sample shows characteristics of a stratified sample, based on some specific categories for selection (urban-rural; different intervention strategies; bigger and smaller projects).<sup>1</sup>

Table 2: Overview of partners visited during field missions

	<b>India</b>	<b>Ethiopia</b>	<b>Kenya</b>	<b>Albania</b>
<b>ICCO</b>	Deepalaya	APDA	Nairobits	YWCA  Educational Centre Elbasan (ECE)  EDU-PRO
<b>Woord en Daad</b>	AMG International (+ JBC)  Woord en Daad India (+JBC)	Hope enterprises (+JBC)		
<b>Edukans</b>	Shramdeep  Asha Deep foundation  Development Focus (local expertise centre)	Ethiopian AID  Education expertise centre (local expertise centre)	Undugu Society of Kenya	EDU-PRO

<sup>1</sup> This way of working is relevant in the case of an accountability study. The CFOs could not propose specific projects to be visited. However, in perspective of learning opportunities, it might be more appropriate if CFOs propose to evaluate some specific partners who are representative for an approach in particular.

16 projects, implemented by 13 partners, and two local expertise centres were visited (a brief description of partners visited is added in annex 6):

- 5 partners of ICCO
- 3 partners of Woord en Daad: it was decided to visit three partners as sufficient time also needed to be spent on the visits to the Job and Business Centres (3). As the programmes executed by Woord en Daad are rather big, it was not possible to add more partners. It was only after the inception phase and the proposal of the sample that the evaluation team became aware of the fact that all JBC's were attached to existing partners.
- 7 partners of Edukans: 2 partners concern the local expertise centres recently installed by Edukans. One day was spent visiting these local expertise centres.

Table 3: Overview of the cases selected, with regard to the level of education offered

	<b>Secondary vocational training</b>	<b>Post secondary education and training (15-18 year)</b>	<b>Post secondary education (adults; &gt; 18 year)</b>
<b>Short term</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ UNDUGU</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ NAIROBITS</li> <li>▪ ETHIOPIAN AID</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ YWCA</li> <li>▪ ECE</li> <li>▪ EDU PRO</li> <li>▪ APDA</li> </ul>
<b>Long term</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ EDU-PRO</li> <li>▪ ECE</li> <li>▪ AMG International<sup>2</sup></li> <li>▪ HOPE ENTERPRISES</li> </ul>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Deepalaya</li> <li>▪ Asha Deep Foundation</li> <li>▪ Shramdeep</li> <li>▪ AMG International</li> <li>▪ Woord en Daad India</li> </ul>

Most of the partner organisations selected were involved in post secondary education and training. Only 4 organisations were offering secondary education. ECE is not offering secondary vocational education but did implement actions to improve the quality of secondary TVET (investments in equipment, curriculum development and teacher training). This corresponds with the results of the database, showing that most of the TVET projects were related to post secondary education.

Eight organisations are involved in long term TVET, courses that last one year or more (including offering several grades). Two of them offer long term as well as short term courses. Five organisations offer only short term courses (courses that last several weeks, from one month to six months).

<sup>2</sup> AMG International is offering formal and non formal TVET courses. For this evaluation the non formal TVET courses for adults (projects for tribal women) and the JBC were visited. Less attention went to the programmes for formal secondary education. For this overview to be complete, AMG International is also put in the column of secondary vocational education.

Table 4: Overview of the cases selected, with regard to the kind of TVET offered

	<b>Formal education and training<sup>3</sup></b>	<b>Non formal education and training</b>
<b>Official recognised diploma/certificate</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ ECE</li> <li>▪ EDU PRO</li> <li>▪ AMG international</li> <li>▪ Hope enterprises</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ YWCA</li> <li>▪ ECE</li> <li>▪ EDU PRO</li> <li>▪ AMG international</li> <li>▪ Undugu</li> <li>▪ Deepalaya</li> <li>▪ Asha Deep Foundation</li> <li>▪ Shramdeep</li> <li>▪ Woord en Daad India</li> <li>▪ Ethiopian Aid</li> </ul>
<b>Not officially recognised certificate</b>		<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Undugu (specific trades)</li> <li>▪ Nairobi</li> <li>▪ Deepalaya</li> <li>▪ Asha Deep Foundation</li> <li>▪ Shramdeep</li> <li>▪ Woord en Daad India</li> <li>▪ APDA</li> </ul>
<b>No diploma</b>	/	/

All partner organisations selected deliver a certificate or diploma. All of them organise courses that deliver officially recognised diplomas, recognised by the Ministry of Education, the Ministry of Labour or other relevant Ministries (except Nairobi and APDA). Seven organisations also offer courses that deliver not officially recognised certificates but certificates recognised by a specific professional sector.

Most of the partner organisations selected are involved in non formal education and training. This selection is representative for the TVET partners of the three CFOs (see further, evaluation question 1).

### 2.3. Methodology

ACE Europe used a participative approach. Participation of the different stakeholders has been facilitated as follows:

- An evaluation framework has been developed by ACE Europe and discussed by the CFOs. Indicators proposed by the CFOs have been included in this evaluation framework;
- The report of the inception phase, including the evaluation framework and approach during field missions, was sent to the partners to be visited before the start of the field missions. Partners prepare well for the visit of the evaluation team by collecting relevant information documents and data of interest for the evaluators;

- At partner organisation level, self assessment exercises were held (formal workshop or during interviews);
- Several focus group discussions with different stakeholders were organised. Partners often proposed additional interviews with relevant stakeholders;
- At the end of every visit, a brief restitution was held with the partner organisation to discuss the main findings and provisional conclusions specifically relevant for the partner organisation;
- At the end of each mission (except in India-because of the distances), a restitution meeting was organised for all partners visited to discuss the main findings, conclusions and recommendations;
- Draft field reports were sent to the partners for feedback (correction of factual information and reaction on analyses, conclusions and recommendations)
- A restitution meeting was organised for the CFOs to discuss the draft evaluation report. CFO gave additional written comments on the evaluation reports. Two drafts of the evaluation reports were made, leading to this final evaluation report.

Two to three days were foreseen to visit the partner organisations. Interviews were planned with staff of the organisation as well as with beneficiaries of the TVET programmes implemented by these organisations. A complete overview of the methodological approach is described in the inception report. During all visits and interviews the evaluation team tried to gather as much as information on all the indicators from the evaluation framework. Guidelines for the field visits were developed by the coordinator of the evaluation.

The following stakeholders were interviewed:

- Senior staff of the partner organisations (*factual information on the organisation and the TVET programmes, policies and strategies, quality, relevance and access of TVET courses, advocacy and lobby, collaboration with parents (-associations), employers (-associations), communities (and CBOs), teachers (-associations), relationship with the Dutch CFOs, self assessment of strengths and weaknesses, difficulties and/or self assessment based on the DAC evaluation criteria*)
- Teachers working for the partner organisation (*quality, relevance and access of TVET courses; teacher training, teacher's associations; networking, follow up of students, link with employers, self assessment of strengths and weaknesses of the TVET courses*)
- Current participants of the TVET programmes visited (*motivation to participate at TVET; match of TVET with needs and educational level; plans for the near future; participation in curriculum development; assessment of the quality of teachers, materials, support and approach; barriers to*

---

<sup>3</sup> Formal TVET coincided with vocational secondary education; non formal TVET concerned pre-employment vocational training or on the job training (based on the partners visited).

*access; financial contribution; assessment of the relevance of the TVET; strengths and weaknesses of the TVET courses; impact.*

- Parents of current students (when relevant – only in formal vocational secondary TVET): *(motivation to choose a particular school, participation at curriculum development or school policy; assessment of the quality, relevance and access of the TVET courses; strengths and challenges of the school, parents associations)*
- Ex-students of the TVET programmes visited (at their current workplace): *(impact of TVET with regard to skills, jobs, income, local economic development; assessment of the quality, relevance and access of the TVET courses; guidance by the TVET provider finding a job; strong and weak points of the TVET courses; degree of satisfaction with the TVET courses; spin offs such as ex-alumni meetings or activities)*
- Employers of the students *(description and assessment of the relationship with the partner organisation that is evaluated, assessment of the quality and relevance of the TVET programmes of the partner organisation, assessment of the skills and performance of the employees, strong and weaker points of the TVET programme of the partner organisation, the main challenges with regard to TVET in general and for the partner organisation in particular; assessment of the networking capacity of the partner organisations; role of employers associations)*
- Representative of Ministries (Education and/or Labour) and of deconcentrated state structures (ex; employment office, curricula development institutes) and representatives of other TVET institutions and/or partners of networks: *(description and assessment of the relationship with the partner organisation that is evaluated; assessment of the quality and relevance of the TVET programmes of the partner organisation; strong and weaker points of the TVET programme of the partner organisation; the main challenges with regard to TVET in general and for the partner organisation in particular; assessment of the advocacy and lobby activities of the partner organisation)*

Depending on the opportunities and possibilities for each evaluation team, the following techniques were used: individual interviews; group interviews; focus group discussions; self assessment exercises (at organisational level); observation of classroom teaching and practical workshops. Cross validation of data was guaranteed.

## **2.4. Difficulties encountered during the evaluation assignment**

During this evaluation, the evaluators were asked to experiment with the technique of life stories (or the biographic method). In particular a small number of ex-students were asked to share their life stories and to explain how participation at TVET changed their lives. The aim was to gather additional information and to achieve some additional insights and explanations of the impact and relevance of TVET programmes. The following questions could be used to guide these interviews: (1) describe your educational and job career history; (2) ask for facts, incidents, influence of people, schools, etc.; (3) Ask for emotions, feelings, experiences: how did he/she feel with regard to the incidents described; (4) What made you take certain decisions?; (5) Ask for future plans and the motivation and feelings behind these plans.

It was very difficult in the context of this evaluation to spend enough time on such interviews. One needs at least two hours, preferably more for this kind of interview. This is often not possible because of several reasons: the tight time scheme in which to collect a lot of information; the willingness of a beneficiary to share his/her story; the lack of time to create a feeling of confidence between interviewer and interviewee, etc. It is not a common technique used in this kind of evaluation, hence neither local consultants nor partner organisations were familiar with this method. It was difficult to convince them –during the preparation phase- to foresee sufficient time for these interviews when planning the field visit. The few stories gathered are added in boxes in this report.

No mayor difficulties have been encountered during the field visits and all partner organisations showed a great willingness to cooperate in this evaluation and they all were very open and hospital. They made it possible to interview many students and ex-students. In case translation was needed the local consultant (part of the team) did facilitate the translation. In the majority of cases, students could be interviewed without interference of teachers or project staff.

Due to a severe malaria attack of the international consultant after her mission to Ethiopia, the redaction of the field evaluation report has known a serious delay and could only be finalised in the month of May 2008. We were lucky that the international consultant could join the meetings of the evaluation team in order to discuss and prepare the synthesis evaluation report. Hence, sufficient data with regard to the partners visited in Ethiopia could be integrated in the main evaluation report. It might be possible that not all data –as described in the main evaluation report- are presented in an optimum systematic way in the field report of the Ethiopia mission.

### 3. TECHNICAL AND VOCATIONAL EDUCATION AND TRAINING

---

#### 3.1. General introduction to TVET and the issues at stake

In the background paper on TVET of the Dutch Ministry of Foreign Affairs (Kosar Altinyelken 2004<sup>4</sup>) Technical and Vocational and Training is defined as:

*“Education which is mainly designed to lead participants to acquire the practical skills, know-how and understanding necessary for employment in a particular occupation, trade or group of occupations” (Atchoarena & Delluc 2001). Such practical skills or know-how can be provided in a wide range of settings by multiple providers both in the public and the private sector. Formal education encompasses technical and vocational streams after primary schooling, and non-formal training includes pre-employment vocational training, on the job training (apprenticeship), and in-service training for workers.”*

As already indicated in the inception report, TVET has a great diversity of objectives. It can be seen as a means of providing a second chance to secondary drop-outs, offering an alternative to secondary education and combating youth unemployment and poverty.<sup>5</sup> Through TVET individuals will be better equipped for productive activities and their employment opportunities (such as wage-employment, self-employment and income generation activities) will be enhanced. The critical role of TVET in developing skills that are required to improve productivity, raise income levels and improve equitable access to employment opportunities has been widely recognised (Bennell 1999). Also the returns of TVET for the private sector have been widely demonstrated (CEDEFOP, 1998<sup>6</sup>), although the exact rate of return in relation to the amount and type of investment done is still a subject of discussion.

Also a number of unprecedented developments in the last three decades have made the role of TVET even more decisive. The globalisation process, technological change, and increased competition due to trade liberalisation necessitate higher skills and productivity among workers both in the modern sector firms and in micro and small enterprises.

---

<sup>4</sup> Kosar Altinyelken, H (2004) Background paper on Technical and Vocational Education and Training

<sup>5</sup> UNESCO-UNEVOC International Centre for Technical and Vocational Education and Training. <http://portal.unesco.org/education> 4/22/05

<sup>6</sup> CEDEFOP (1998) Exploring the returns to Vocational Training for Enterprises.

Additionally, workers who are displaced by the structural adjustment programmes in many developing countries pose an important challenge, as they need retraining for new occupations. Skills development has also become crucial as a result of the HIV/AIDS pandemic. AIDS depletes scarce human resources and increases the need for training to replace skills lost across a wide range of occupations, particularly in Sub-Saharan Africa (Johanson 2002). Nevertheless, HIV/AIDS itself reduces the capacity of TVET systems to deliver their services since it decreases the supply and causes deterioration in the quality of the system.<sup>7</sup>

Several important issues and challenges<sup>8</sup> on Technical and Vocational Education and Training can be distinguished. Effective TVET systems (supply of TVET) still have to be developed in most developing countries. This relates directly to the low status and image that TVET has both in developing countries themselves and with major international donors like the Worldbank and ILO. Of course one important issue concerning TVET systems is the cost of delivery of TVET (which is high compared to primary and secondary education systems). Another important challenge is the improvement of access to TVET (girls and women are seriously under-represented in TVET). There are barriers of access (gender, age, literacy, education fees and physical proximity) as well as barriers to participation (range and type of training choices that are offered, the level, the style and language of training, the manner of presentation, the teaching methods used and course schedules). The assurance of quality is a concern. High quality TVET programmes guarantee a strong link between what is learned and the needs of the labour market, with the result that graduates are more likely to find suitable employment. Given this fact, it should be said that practice has proven that vocational education as such does not equal employment. Education as such does not create jobs. On the contrary, quality and relevancy of basic education, and in particular of TVET, is crucial for beneficiaries on the demand side of TVET. Their aim is to be better equipped with a range of skills which will enhance their employment opportunities at the labour markets, and provide them with an income.

Despite all these challenges, however, TVET is being embraced more and more as a means to combat poverty and realise skills development in worker populations. Recent regional and pan-African conferences in 2005 and 2006<sup>9</sup> on the subject for instance, have seen presentations of researchers and project managers from countries in Sub-Saharan Africa (Mauritius, Tanzania, Botswana, South Africa, Zambia, Togo) documenting efforts to implement TVET country-wide where the business world has generally been successfully involved in the design and financing of TVET.

---

<sup>7</sup> Paragraph based on Kosar Altinyelken, H (2004) Background paper on Technical and Vocational Education and Training

<sup>8</sup> UNESCO-UNEVOC International Centre for Technical and Vocational Education and Training. <http://portal/unesco.org/education> 4/22/05

<sup>9</sup> See [www.iveta.org](http://www.iveta.org)

### **3.2. Overview of the organisations and their policy with regard to TVET**

**ICCO** - This inter church organisation for development cooperation has its roots in the Dutch protestant – Christian churches and is one of the biggest NGOs in the Netherlands. ICCO's mission is to work towards a world without poverty and injustice. The work of ICCO consists of financing those activities that stimulate and enable people, in their own special way, to organise dignified housing and living conditions. These long-term objectives have been elaborated along three policy themes: (1) access to basic social services, (2) fair economic development and (3) democratisation and peace building. ICCO deploys its activities in Africa and the Middle East, in Asia and the Pacific and in Latin America. The organisation receives about 120 million euros from the Dutch government and the European Commission, and from organisations participating in the ICCO alliance. ICCO supports more than 800 partners and has a staff of about 240 people.

In 2006 the overall budget for programme implementation was 153 million euro.

For the period 2003-2006 ICCO did not have a formal policy on TVET. TVET was included in the policy related to the theme 'access to basic services' (incl. health, water, education, reproductive health and HIV and AIDS). There were no policy guidelines, and support to TVET programmes was mainly left to the decision of the individual programme officers.

**Edukans** – The Edukans Foundation was founded in June 2002 by the “Unie voor Christelijk onderwijs”. Edukans supports educational projects in favour of unprivileged children and youngsters in developing countries. Edukans also involves children and youngsters in the Netherlands in its development co-operation. Edukans aims at realising this objective by fundraising, publicity and all other possible legal means that can be helpful. Edukans' project funding focuses on projects in the field of education and more in particular on the issues of accessibility, quality and relevance of basic education. Target groups are unprivileged children and youngsters who – for various reasons - lack the knowledge and life skills to break through the vicious cycle of poverty and underdevelopment. Basic education (according to the perception of Edukans) includes all kinds of educational interventions aimed at children and youngsters, both formal and non formal education for children up to 14 years old and extends to non-formal vocational training opportunities for youngsters up to 18 years old (directed towards income earning opportunities). In the period 2003-2006 Edukans supported around 122 partner organisations. Currently, the organisation supports 159 partners (in 6 countries) and has a staff of about 40 people. The overall budget for the period 2003-2006 was 13 million euro.

For the period 2003-2006 Edukans did not have an elaborated and coherent policy on TVET. According to staff interviewed, there was no specific focus on TVET, hence practice on TVET was very much fragmented

and project based. However, Edukans did include a TVET component in the TMF proposal of 2005. One of the objectives of this TMF proposal was the improvement of the relevance of educational programmes and projects. In rural settings this concerned the support of community based non formal technical and vocational education; in an urban setting the focus was on job-oriented skills training for specific target groups such as drop outs (with an increased attention for girls).

**Woord en Daad** – This organisation was founded in 1973 by a group within the reformed Protestant churches to make a contribution to poverty reduction in developing countries. Woord en Daad developed a network with development organisations in the South working in the following domains: (1) emergency relief, (2) basic education, (3) access to basic services (including health and food security) and (4) job and income (including economic programmes). These programmes have been developed one after the other over the years, starting with basic human needs, over basic education to vocational training, job mediation and MSE development. The main focus however is education, with 50% of the programmes executed in this domain. Woord en Daad also developed an adoption programme, which at the same time is a very effective fundraising instrument. Woord en Daad is largely embedded within the Dutch society and has more than 90 local committees in the Netherlands. The organisation is currently collaborating with 41 partner organisations in the South and employs a staff of 55 people. In 2006 Woord en Daad's overall budget for programme implementation was 20 million euro.

Since 2001, Woord en Daad started putting more emphasis on TVET. TVET is part of the "Job and income" programme. This programme has several objectives and focuses on vocational training and job mediation on the one hand and on the other hand, on support to small enterprises or facilitating access to micro credits. Woord en Daad implements an integrated and coherent programme applying a chain approach. The aim of Woord en Daad is to support its beneficiaries with education (starting in early childhood) until they effectively find a job and can earn an income. Beneficiaries can enter the chain at every point, creating overall opportunities for communities at large in which Woord en Daad is active. Woord en Daad supports the establishment and functioning of vocational training centres (VTC) and has plans to improve the quality of these VTCs through investments in infrastructure, support to curricula development and teacher training. To enhance the link between VET and the labour market, and hence improve the quality and relevance of VET, Woord en Daad started to establish and support Job and Business Centres (infrastructure, capacity development, organisational development). These JBC's have the following tasks: to develop a students tracing system, to develop a network with businesses, job mediation, support to the creation of small enterprises and to support VTC networking.

**ICCO alliance** - In 2005, in perspective of the preparation of a new co-financing programme (in the framework of the new Dutch co-financing system), ICCO started to discuss the creation of an alliance with Edukans, Prisma<sup>10</sup> and Kerkinactie (all partner organisations linked to the Protestant-Christian churches) for the execution of a common financing programme for 2007-2010. The ICCO Alliance that resulted from this developed activities in alignment with the ICCO policy themes (see above). Edukans is participating in the educational programme (under the theme 'access to basic services'). Woord en Daad is not participating in the educational programme of the ICCO Alliance but has introduced its own MFS programme. The programme of the ICCO alliance for education aims to improve the access, quality and relevance of education. Four topics have been identified: (1) education for work, (2) education and HIV/AIDS, (3) education and (post)conflict and (4) education for marginalised groups. With regard to the topic "education for work" the alliance will focus on improving the relevance of education by emphasizing the link between education and the labour market. Content and educational approaches of TVET have to equip beneficiaries with knowledge, skills and attitudes that prepare them for entering the labour market and earning an income. The ICCO alliance would like to build the bridge between basic education and the (informal) labour market. The programme will be implemented in 17 countries. Policy papers/programmes for every country are currently being developed.

---

<sup>10</sup> Prisma is an umbrella of Christian-oriented NGOs (Woord en Daad, Tearfund, ZOA, OREON, BN, ... ) Woord en Daad is one of the biggest members of Prisma.

## 4. ASSESSMENT OF THE EVALUATION QUESTIONS

---

This chapter describes the answers to the three evaluation questions and gives an assessment of the achievements based on the DAC evaluation criteria.

### 4.1. Evaluation question 1

---

Evaluation question 1 - What are the similarities and differences in policy and practice of the different CFOs?

---

In the period 2003-2006 ICCO made money from the Ministry of Development Cooperation available to Dutch civil society organisations to finance qualitative good development projects which comply with the MFS policy framework. Edukans and Woord en Daad were receiving block grants from ICCO for a certain number of their TVET activities. In this period ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad had their own identity, own policies and practices on TVET. The policy plans differ in focus, themes, strategies and priorities. However, certain collaboration does exist between these organisations. The ToR asks for an analysis to be made of the process of working within the financing modality of the ICCO block grant and to analyse the influence on the development of TVET policies and objectives of the individual organisations. Besides an analysis of the policy and practice on TVET, the evaluators have also looked at the perspectives with regard to lobby and advocacy on TVET (although in the past period not much had happened), as this is relevant for further policy development.

#### 4.1.1. THE PROCESS OF POLICY DEVELOPMENT ON TVET

**Policy papers** - Policy development with regard to TVET is fairly recent for all partners: ICCO (since 2007 for TVET and since 2005 for basic education) and Edukans (since 2002). Woord en Daad started to invest in TVET in 2001 and is the only organisation with a separate TVET policy paper (since 2006). However, the ICCO Alliance partners, ICCO and Edukans, are in the process of developing policy papers for the topic “education for work”.

Each of the three organisations currently employs a policy or programme officer who is responsible for TVET: at Edukans a programme officer is responsible for the topic “education for work”, at ICCO a policy officer is

responsible for the larger policy theme of “education”. At Woord en Daad two programme officers are responsible for the programme “job and income” (one responsible for the VTC’s and one responsible for the JBCs). In 2007 an additional staff member of the department “Research and advice” is doing research on TVET. The difference between ICCO on the one hand and Woord en Daad and Edukans on the other hand is that the policy officer at ICCO is attached (since 2007) to the department of research and development (as learning facilitator) and to the Access to Basic Social Services department (as a programme specialist) and is not involved in direct programme management (though responsible for elaborating, in close cooperation with the programme officer at ICCO, the different stages of the programmatic approach), whereas these staff members at Edukans and Woord en Daad also are responsible for partner relations and programme implementation.

**Cross fertilisation of policy and practice between the CFOs** - It is clear that the relationship between ICCO and the other two CFOs during the period of the block grants was primarily a financial relationship. Projects had to fit into the general policy of ICCO and the three intervention strategies and policy themes. Exchange of experiences between the different NGOs rarely took place, the CFOs were not documenting good practices in a structured or systematic way and there was no support to develop or improve monitoring and evaluation systems. Looking at the management of the block grant, the monitoring instruments used by ICCO had to be used by Edukans and Woord en Daad (e.g. korte kenschetsen, voortgangsmemo’s); discussions about the development of adapted PME systems for TVET did not take place. However collaboration between ICCO and Edukans, and to a certain extent with Woord en Daad, has increased since 2005 and there is currently much more policy discussion with regard to TVET.. Common education programmes per country are drafted for ICCO and Edukans. Every month theme workshops are organised for exchanging information and experiences on certain policy issues. A common monitoring protocol has been developed, to be used by all alliance members.

Moreover, representatives of ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad (each as representatives of their own organisation) participate (coordinated by ICCO and Woord en Daad) in the working group on “education for work” which is part of the knowledge forum on basic education, established by the Ministry of Foreign Affairs in 2007.

Some of the people interviewed mentioned that cross fertilisation between ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad is not evident because these organisations differ a lot in size and in their way of working. Responsibilities and tasks are not attributed in the same way which makes it hard to identify and find the appropriate counterpart. For example, since the expertise on education and TVET at ICCO at that time was

limited, collaboration on policy matters tended to be difficult. The nature of the work of Edukans and Woord en Daad, even if both involved in educational programmes, also differs a lot. We could say that for the period 2003-2006, it was clearly too early to expect a genuine dialogue on TVET between the three organisations. It is only recently that common topics have been identified through the discussion in the ICCO Alliance and in the working group for 'education for work' of the Ministry of Foreign Affairs.

**Gender** - ICCO is the only organisation with a separate gender policy and guidelines for gender mainstreaming. Since 2002, ICCO has worked with a gender group and in 2004 the gender screening tool was revised to make it more applicable, useful and explicit. All partners are screened on gender sensitivity, although it is not a criterion for exclusion. When needed, gender training is offered to partners. With regard to gender and education, the focus is very much on the access and relevancy of TVET for girls and young women. In the coming years, the policy officer on education will study in depth the link between gender and TVET in order to formulate guidelines for programme officers.

Edukans and Woord en Daad apply an implicit gender policy. Both organisations emphasise equal access to education for boys and girls and demand sex specific data from their partner organisations. However, no specific interventions have been developed and gender training is not offered to the partners. It depends largely on the gender sensitivity of the programme officers whether or not they address gender in an appropriate way during policy dialogues with their partners.

Besides support to mainstreaming gender in partners' policies and programmes, NGOs usually include the specific support to women's organisations in their gender policy. In 2003 a MBN evaluation was executed on the role of women organisations, recommending that the number of women's organisations should increase to have more impact on the empowerment of women. To that regard we have analysed how many women organisations are targeted in TVET programmes.

*Table 5: number of TVET projects financed by the three CFO's in the period 2003-2006 (projects aimed at men and women and at women)*

<b>CFO</b>		<b>not known</b>	<b>men and women</b>	<b>women</b>	<b>Total</b>
ICCO	N projects	0	40	13	53
	%		75%	25%	100%
Woord en Daad	N projects	1	36	7	44
	%	2%	82%	16%	100%
Edukans	N projects	0	36	4	40
	%		90%	10%	100%
<b>Total N projects</b>		<b>1</b>	<b>112</b>	<b>24</b>	<b>137</b>
<b>Total %</b>		<b>0,73%</b>	<b>82%</b>	<b>17%</b>	<b>100%</b>

Most of the TVET projects, funded by the CFOs in the period 2003-2006, are targeting men as well as women. The number of projects targeting only women is small (17%). The number is even smaller when looking only at Woord en Daad and Edukans in comparison to the number of ICCO projects targeting women (25%).

**HIV and AIDS** - The three organisations intend to mainstream HIV and AIDS, but only ICCO had a HIV/AIDS policy, a HIV/AIDS policy officer and a proper HIV/AIDS workplace policy, in the period 2003-2006. ICCO aims for all its partners to have a workplace policy by 2010. The HIV/AIDS policy also includes guidelines for HIV/AIDS integration in the different ICCO policy themes. Since there was no separate policy on education or on TVET at that time, no specific recommendations were formulated on how to integrate HIV/AIDS in TVET programmes. However, separate budgets do exist to fund specific HIV/AIDS programmes at the level of the partners and some of the TVET partners did apply for these funds. Their focus was very much on HIV and AIDS prevention in schools.

Edukans and Woord en Daad did not have a separate HIV/AIDS policy though both of them included a programme on education and HIV/AIDS in their TMF-programme. The focus was on improving the integration of HIV and AIDS prevention activities in educational programmes (external mainstreaming). No staffs at these organisations were trained on HIV/AIDS mainstreaming and it depended largely on the individual staff capacities to integrate HIV and AIDS in the policy dialogue with partners (which is proven not to be easy).

By the end of 2006, Woord and Daad had recruited a staff member that will be responsible for the HIV and AIDS policy of the organisation. Before that time, Woord en Daad participated at the working group on HIV and AIDS at Prisma and contributed actively to the development of the Prisma HIV/AIDS policy paper. The new HIV/AIDS officer will develop a HIV/AIDS policy for Woord en Daad and support HIV and AIDS mainstreaming processes with the partners. Partners have to integrate HIV and AIDS mainstreaming in their proposals (starting 2008). HIV and AIDS were put on the agenda of partner meetings in 2007. Woord and Daad will give attention to the development of workplace policies by partners and for its own organisations (policy on travelling).

In 2005, Edukans and ICCO initiated Educaids, a HIV/AIDS network with participation of 5 partners which included ICCO and Kerkinactie. Through Educaids, participating organisations pooled budgets to finance HIV and AIDS (pilot) projects of the partners of the respective members of the network and to finance linking and learning. This network focuses on the impact of HIV and AIDS on education and on ways to deal with these impacts (loss of teachers, loss of students, HIV and AIDS prevention, impact mitigation etc.). The current practice apparently shows that currently most attention goes to HIV/AIDS prevention and less to internal

mainstreaming. The added value of the network is that it is bringing together partners who often have a different idea and perception about how to deal with sexuality and HIV/AIDS prevention in education; NGO's and faith based organisations have started to engage in discussions with one another.. Since the co-financing programme 2007-2010 started, Educaids has mainly financed linking and learning events. Projects are now funded through the regular programme financing.

#### 4.1.2. PRACTICE ON TVET

Edukans and Woord en Daad are both specialised in education. Edukans mainly executes educational programmes, at Woord en Daad the educational programme covers 50% of the budget. Both organisations have always been involved in TVET, though until recently in a fragmented way. Since 2001 the organisations have started to reflect on their support to TVET in a more systematic way.

**Some quantitative data** – In the period 2003-2006, ICCO supported 53 TVET-projects, implemented by 40 partner organisations in 24 countries. Woord en Daad supported 44 projects of 14 partner organisations in 12 countries and Edukans supported 40 projects, implemented by 33 partners in 7 countries.

*Table 6 : overview of the total number of TVET projects and partners per CFO, financed in the period 2003-2006*

<b>CFO</b>	<b>n-projects</b>	<b>%</b>	<b>n- partners</b>	<b>%</b>
ICCO	53	39%	40	46%
Woord en Daad	44	32 %	14	16%
Edukans	40	29%	33	38%
<b>Total</b>	137	100	87	100 %

Woord en Daad is working with a limited number of partners, hence every partner is implementing several projects. These projects are related to infrastructure, equipment and/or operational costs for a VTC or JBC. Several projects are part of one programme with the same partner. The projects of the partners of ICCO and Edukans mainly concern consecutive projects or programmes<sup>11</sup>.

Although ICCO does not have a policy on TVET, it nonetheless executes 39% of the TVET projects financed in the period 2003-2006. This is due to the fact that many partners implement integrated programmes related to access to basic services, including educational projects (TVET mostly takes 50% or less of the

---

<sup>11</sup> The database developed for this evaluation is based on TVET projects and not on partners. This gives us insight into the different projects executed by one partner that sometimes target different target groups or implement different kind of TVET. Focussing on partners would make it more difficult to get an idea of the projects funded.

programme). Compared to the overall partnership of ICCO, TVET partners represent not more than 4% of the total partner portfolio. As demonstrated by the table below, the share of TVET partners of the overall portfolio is the highest at Woord en Daad (42%-34%) and very low at ICCO (2%-4%).

Table 7: Overview of the number of TVET partners and total partners of the three CFO's, funded in the period 2003-2006

	ICCO			Woord en Daad			Edukans		
	TVET	total	%	TVET	total	%	TVET	Total	%
2003	29	807	4	14	32	42			
2004	32	832	4	14	32	42	17	99	17
2005	26	885	3	13	33	42	24	109	22
2006	15	938	2	13	41	34	28	159	18

In 2005 I/C Consult analysed the ICCO partner portfolio with regard to educational programmes. The conclusion was that ICCO did not finance many educational partners and that educational activities were mostly integrated in other programmes. ICCO decided to invest more in education in 2005, but apparently the programme officers did not choose for TVET at that time- see the decrease of the proportion of TVET partners to the total number of partners in 2005 and 2006 (the new thematic programme on education, including TVET, was only developed in 2007 and so had not yet been implemented ).

In the period 2003-2006, the ICCO policy was to finance educational projects through the block grant system mainly supporting educational projects executed by NGOs specialised in education. Since educational partners were funded through this system, ICCO itself did not invest much in education.

For Woord en Daad, the number of TVET partners covers 42% in 2003, 2004 and 2005 and 34% in 2006. This overview confirms that Woord en Daad has a very stable partner portfolio with long lasting partnerships. At Edukans, the number of TVET partners increased on a parallel with the increase of the total number of partners (except for 2004-2005 when the number of TVET partners increased more than the total number of partners).<sup>12</sup>

Table 8: Projects with TVET activities, financed by the three CFO's in the period 2003-2006- Overview of the total budget and the share of co-financing

CFO	Total budget	Co-financing budget	% cofinancing budget of total budget
ICCO	10.016.630,1 €	9.331.009,0 €	93,16%
Woord en daad	7.221.876,0 €	3.452.342,5 €	47,80%
Edukans	1.170.181,0 €	514.416,5 €	43,96%
<b>Total</b>	<b>18.408.687,1 €</b>	<b>13.297.768,0 €</b>	<b>72,24%</b>

Source: project documents

<sup>12</sup> Edukans management and bookkeeping systems are adapted to the school years. Data were available for the years 2003-2004; 2004-2005 and 2005-2006.

Woord en Daad and Edukans used the block grant system for the co-financing of their projects, many of them TVET projects. Not all block grants have been used for TVET projects and as far as Woord en Daad is concerned, not all TVET projects were financed through the block grant system as Woord en Daad was also receiving funding from the TMF programme.

In comparison to the other organisations, the budget spent by Edukans is rather low. This can be explained by the fact that Edukans focused more on community based projects or small projects and less on institution based education, requiring large investments in infrastructure.

*Table 9: Overview of the budget for TVET partners and the budget for the total amount of partners financed by the three CFO's, in the period 2003-2006*

	TVET partners			Total of partners		
	ICCO	Woord en Daad	Edukans	ICCO	Woord en Daad	Edukans
<b>2003</b>	3.268.819	1.905.005	125.429.	128.207.948	5.680.914	n.a.
<b>2004</b>	3.205.238	2.017.601	262.558	127.519.873	8.035.857	n.a.
<b>2005</b>	2.184.078	1.753.481	323.903	143.407.422	10.513.542	n.a.
<b>2006</b>	1.358.494	1.545.789	458.291	152.900.961	11.608.117	n.a.

*Source: for ICCO and Edukans information was sent by staff; the source for the overall budget of Woord en Daad were the annual reports.*

*Remark: Woord en Daad- ACE Europe did exclude the budgets related to the emergency programme and the adoption programme in order to have comparable data. The overall budget for Woord en Daad is higher than what is stated in this table.*

Some comments:

- ICCO: the TVET budget is decreasing in the years 2005 and 2006, with the overall budget increasing.
- Woord en Daad: the TVET budget stays more or less stable. Increase of the budget is mainly due to investments in infrastructure in a particular year. The overall budget of Woord en Daad is increasing.
- Edukans: the data show that the budget for TVET partners is gradually increasing. However no comparison could be made with the overall budget per year as this budget is attributed to the book year (June-July).<sup>13</sup> Comparison between the budget for TVET and the overall budget is presented in table 10.

---

<sup>13</sup> Edukans: no data were available per year. However, when developing the database for this evaluation during inception phase, the consultants attributed budget spend for TVET to the year it was actually attributed (and not per book year). This way of working delivered information on the TVET budget per year.

Table 10: Comparison of the budget for TVET projects and the budget for all projects, implemented by Edukans in the period 2003-2006

	Budget for TVET projects	Budget for all projects	Proportion TVET to overall budget
2003-2006	1.170.181	13.439.381	9%

Table 11: Overview of the proportion of the budget for TVET projects in relation to the overall budget for projects, financed by ICCO and Woord en Daad in the period 2003-2006

	ICCO	Woord en Daad
2003	2 %	33 %
2004	2%	25 %
2005	1,5 %	17 %
2006	0.9 %	13 %

The proportion of the TVET budget in relation to the overall budget is very small for ICCO and the highest for Woord en Daad<sup>14</sup>. The share of TVET partners in the overall partner portfolio of Woord en Daad is relatively higher than the share of budget spent for TVET, which can be explained by the fact that many of the TVET partners are also funded by other Woord en Daad programmes.

**Nature of TVET activities** – Originally, the three CFO's were very much involved in support to infrastructure or equipment of vocational schools and training centres. Recently, all of them started decreasing investment budgets and putting more emphasis on the improvement of the quality and relevance of TVET (curricula development, teachers training, capacity building, organisational development, etc.)

Table 12: Amount of TVET projects, financed by the three CFOs in the period 2003-2006, in relation to the types of TVET activities

	Not known	Formal	Non formal	Mobile training	apprenticeship <sup>15</sup>	investment	JBC	Total
ICCO	1 2%	20 38%	29 55%	0	0	3 6%	0	53 100%
Woord en Daad	0	9 20%	14 32%	2 5%	0	11 25%	8 18%	44 100%
Edukans	2 5%	4 10%	28 70%	0	2 5%	4 10%	0	40 100 %
<b>Total</b>	3	33	71	2	2	18	8	137
<b>%</b>	2%	24%	52%	1%	1%	13%	6%	100%

<sup>14</sup> One comment should be made on Woord en Daad: when comparing the total budget for the programme "job and income" to the budget for all the programmes (including emergency aid and adoption programme), the "job and income programme" takes on average 21 % of the total budget.

<sup>15</sup> Apprenticeship is seen here as a particular –in service training- approach, usually in the informal sector, and does not refer to (long term) internships in companies in combination with centre based training.

Most of the TVET projects are non formal TVET. This group represents the biggest share of projects in general, and for each CFO separately. Edukans in particular, is focussing on non formal TVET (70%) which is a clear demonstration of the implementation of their TVET policy. ICCO and Woord en Daad on the other hand support a relatively important share of formal TVET.

Woord en Daad also invests relatively (and highest compared to the two other CFOs) a lot in infrastructure and/or equipment (25%). Only Woord en Daad is financing projects (#2) that experiment with mobile TVET and Edukans is the only organisation involved in the financing of projects (#2) dealing with apprenticeship systems.

*Table 13: Number of TVET projects in relation to the level of education, financed by the three CFOs in the period 2003-2006*

	<b>Vocationalisation of primary education</b>	<b>Secondary technical and vocational education</b>	<b>Post secondary vocational education and training</b>	<b>Total</b>
<b>ICCO</b>	5 9%	6 11%	42 80%	53 100%
<b>Woord en Daad</b>	1 2%	6 14%	37 84%	44 100%
<b>Edukans</b>	9 23%	1 2%	30 75%	40 100%
<b>Total</b>	15 11%	13 9%	109 80%	137 100%

80% of the TVET projects concern post secondary vocational education or training interventions. The three CFO's are primarily supporting this level of TVET, which is quite relevant: this level of TVET targets drop outs from the general education system, employees that need retraining or refreshment courses or unemployed adults who need to acquire new skills to earn an income. Mostly it concerns non formal vocational training.

Edukans is also focusing attention on the vocationalisation of primary education (23%) whereas Woord en Daad prefers to also allocate funds to secondary education (formal vocational education or initial vocational education). ICCO is equally involved in primary and secondary education.

Table 14: Number of TVET projects in relation to the age cohorts of the beneficiaries, TVET projects funded by the three CFOs in the period 2003-2006

	Unknown	0-14 years	15-18 years	+ 15	Total
ICCO	3 6%	8 15%	15 28%	27 51%	53 100%
Woord en Daad	2 5%	5 11%	11 25%	26 59%	44 100%
Edukans	0	17 43%	7 17%	16 40%	40 100%
<b>Total</b>	5 4%	30 22%	33 24%	69 50%	137 100%

The evaluators have identified/specified a separate category of beneficiaries between 15 and 18 years old because many projects were explicitly targeting this group. The group of + 15 years is mainly found in post secondary education or training and represents the biggest group of beneficiaries. The picture is similar for the three CFO's, except for the fact that Edukans is targeting relatively more beneficiaries younger than 15 years old, which can be explained by the attention Edukans gives to primary education – and the vocationalisation of primary education.

Table 15: number of TVET projects in relation to specific target groups, TVET projects financed by the three CFOs in the period 2003-2006

	Not relevant	Street children Child workers	OVC's	Marginalised groups <sup>16</sup>	Not known	Total
ICCO	8 15%	2 4%	19 36%	7 13%	17 32%	53 100%
Woord en Daad	0	0	35 80%	4 9%	5 11%	44 100%
Edukans	0	12 30%	13 33%	8 20%	7 17%	40 100%
Total	8 6%	14 10%	67 49%	19 14%	29 21%	137 100%

Remark: not relevant=educational programmes not targeting specific target groups, mostly this concerned service delivery or capacity building organisations towards the educational sector ex: ECE; not known= no information found in the project files and no information known by the programme officer.

73% of the TVET projects addresses specific target groups, of which 49% OVCs. This group is particularly important for Woord en Daad with a share of 80%. Edukans is also addressing street children and marginalised groups. It is clear that the CFOs are reaching poor and unprivileged people who are often not reached by public vocational schools or training centres.

<sup>16</sup> Marginalised groups: in many project files the target group was indicated as "marginalised group" and not further specified. Projects targeting disabled children have been classified as OVC.

Table 16: Number of TVET projects in relation to their geographical location, TVET projects financed by the three CFO's in the period 2003-2006

	unknown	Capital	Other city	Rural	Total
ICCO	14 26%	12 23%	12 23%	15 28%	53 100%
Woord en Daad	2 5%	15 34%	19 43%	8 18%	44 100%
Edukans	0	8 20%	15 37%	17 43%	40 100%
Total	16 12%	35 26%	46 34%	40 29%	137 100%

In general the TVET projects are situated in urban areas – in particular Woord en Daad projects- though it is possible that they attract beneficiaries coming from rural areas. Edukans is an exception with 43% of their TVET projects located in rural areas.

#### 4.1.3. CAPACITY BUILDING OF THE PARTNERS

The three CFOs all invest in the capacity building of their partners, with a focus on organisational and institutional development. Woord en Daad has formulated explicit objectives and results to this regard (TMF programme 2003-2006 and MFS programme 2007-2010). Woord en Daad adopted the following strategies aimed at strengthening its partners:

- improvement of the quality of the educational process through investments in infrastructure and equipment, training of teachers (including teacher training in The Netherlands or twinning between TVET institutes in North and South);
- support to the organisational development of partners through consultancy, training, midterm reviews and support to strategic planning;
- support to institutional development through the strengthening of networking of VTCs

Edukans and ICCO also invest in capacity building initiatives such as facilitating access to or organising training, consultancy, etc. mainly focussing on organisational development. Capacity building has been integrated explicitly in the new MFS co-financing programme (2007-2010).

The three CFO's regularly organise partner consultations where different partners can meet each other. The CFOs would like to strengthen linking and learning opportunities to promote the exchange of ideas. Although not much linking and learning has happened so far (most of the partners are involved in their own programmes and good practices are not documented in a systematic way), some exceptions should be highlighted:

- Woord en Daad organised three expert meetings on issues related to TVET: a partner consultation in The Netherlands on bridging education and the labour market (2005); a national seminar on Job and Income: bridging the gap between job and income in Burkina Faso (2006) and an expert seminar “Acting in between. The challenges of VET in the South seen from the perspective of different actors” in The Netherlands (2006)
- Woord en Daad encourages its partners (VTCs) to participate in VTC networks;
- Edukans started with the idea to cluster its partners in each country with the aim of enhancing linking and learning opportunities. Each cluster is required to regularly organise exchange forums. This approach has recently been introduced in India.
- Since 2006, Edukans has started to experiment with local expertise centres. These local expertise centres are staffed with educational experts and assume the following roles: consultancy services (incl. TVET), support to monitoring and evaluation, facilitating linking and learning. Currently a local expertise centre has been established in India and in Ethiopia.

All programme officers are involved in a policy dialogue with their partners. Partners are visited once or twice a year. It should be noted that the programme officers of Woord en Daad succeed in having genuine and in-depth discussions and reflections with regard to TVET with their partners. This can be explained by the fact that programme officers are educational experts and the fact that they can spend 4 to 5 days with one partner. This is feasible because Woord en Daad is collaborating with a limited number of partners, with whom it has a long lasting relationship. Programme officers of Edukans and certainly those of ICCO do not attain this level of engagement. Edukans acknowledged this bottleneck (limited support offered from the office in the Netherlands) and therefore decided to start with the above mentioned local expertise centres.

#### 4.1.4. ADVOCACY AND LOBBY

In the period 2003-2006 TVET was not addressed by advocacy and lobby programmes. In the TMF co-financing programmes of Edukans and Woord en Daad no specific objectives were formulated with regard to advocating and lobbying TVET. Advocacy and lobby is explicitly integrated in the new MFS co-financing programmes (2007-2010) of the ICCO Alliance and of Woord en Daad:

- The ICCO Alliance will develop an advocacy and lobby strategy, linked to the campaign “Education for all”. They will lobby at an international level (focus on education in post conflict areas) and at country level (through their partners). No specific objectives are formulated with regard to TVET;
- Woord en Daad will lobby issues related to the different programmes and closely linked to the practice of the partners. Woord en Daad prefers to lobby issues that are not taken up by other

organisations. Advocacy and lobby projects will be mainly initiated and steered by the partners in the South. Woord en Daad will collaborate with Prisma and their lobby office at the EU, EU-Cord. Issues to lobby are: improvement of quality of VET, the facilitation of internships in businesses, stimulation of employment (employment policies) and small business development.

In May 2007, **Woord en Daad** recruited an extra staff member at the department for research and advice, developed a separate programme for advocacy and lobby for 2007-2010 and allocated money to this (before 2007, advocacy and lobby was paid through the overhead means). A separate policy paper on advocacy and lobby was developed in 2006. The policy and strategy will be further developed by the new staff member. **ICCO** intends to recruit an additional staff member for?? the communication and lobby department. **Edukans** implements the advocacy and lobby programme as described in the MFS programme of the ICCO alliance and hence will collaborate with ICCO to this regard. By 2010 20% of the MFS budget is planned for financing advocacy and lobby activities. A specific advocacy and lobby strategy will be developed for every country. The internal working group of Education for work is planning to develop a strategy on supporting the advocacy and lobby activities of the partners.

Clearly, advocacy and lobby was not evident within the ICCO Alliance or for Woord en Daad and most of the advocacy and lobby activities executed in the period 2003-2006 were ad hoc interventions focussing on the MDG's or on basic education and not on TVET as such. The majority of the partners of Woord en Daad and Edukans are not familiar with this kind of intervention. Through partner consultations, Woord and Daad learned that some of their partners are rather hesitant/reluctant to become engaged in advocacy and lobby, fearing that they will be associated too much with left side political parties.

However, some of the CFOs were involved in advocacy activities on TVET. In 2006 Woord en Daad organised an expert meeting on the role of different actors in TVET. The three CFOs participated in discussions on TVET of the "Schokland agreement". Through their participation and coordinating role in the working group "education for work", established by The Ministry of Foreign Affairs, the three CFO's exchange ideas and experiences and have the opportunity to follow up carefully the new policy on education developed by the Minister for Development Cooperation. They are perceived as valuable interlocutors with regard to TVET.

#### 4.1.5. ASSESSMENT OF THE SIMILARITIES AND DIFFERENCES IN POLICY AND PRACTICE

In the period 2003-2006 ICCO sourced out its support in the domain of education. ICCO opted to work with specialised NGOs with a track record in the sector and being able to provide educational experts/expertise, such as Woord en Daad and Edukans. These organisations have a concern in common: all three of them were/are worried about the quality and relevance of education and the number of drop outs in the general education system. Nevertheless cooperation is not that evident: the three organisations differ a lot when looking at the number of partners they support, their budgets spent and their way of working. This explains why their strategies differ a lot, even if they all demonstrate a clear evolution to invest more in technical and vocational education and a strong willingness to make the link between education and the labour market. We highlight the most important differences:

- Clearly, **Woord en Daad** has the longest experience with TVET, a well elaborated strategy and a relevant practice. The importance attached to the domain of TVET is reflected in the share of TVET oriented partners and the share of the total budget allocated to TVET interventions. Woord en Daad has developed clear strategies on the support of vocational training centres and the creation of the link between education and the labour market. Edukans has a long experience in the field of education in general and has only recently paid more attention to TVET. As far as **Edukans is concerned**, policy and practice on TVET used to be very much project based and fragmented but recently, Edukans has been elaborating a strategy on community based education (incl. TVET), mainly based on its practice in India. For **ICCO**, a policy on TVET has yet to be developed. ICCO initiated this programme evaluation to gain insight into the effectiveness of supported programmes and to use the results of this evaluation for further policy elaboration. ICCO also prepared input for the Alliance (also on behalf of Edukans) on the “Education for work” strategy, to be presented in the Knowledge Platform Working Group.
- **Woord en Daad** is supporting a limited number of partners implementing different projects (sometimes only in the domain of TVET). Woord en Daad has developed long lasting relationships with partners (some of them are very dependent on Woord en Daad) and works in close collaboration with its partners (unlike the partner relations of **Edukans and ICCO**). Policy development is very much a bottom up approach, involving the partners as much as possible. Programme officers do spend a lot of time with partners and manage to have a genuine policy dialogue. **ICCO and Edukans** are supporting many more partners and have looser relationships.

**Edukans** decided to address this point, for e.g. by the creation of local expertise centres that can facilitate more relevant and qualitative support to its partners.

- Whereas **Edukans** is very much involved in non formal TVET (mainly in rural areas), Woord en Daad and ICCO also support a relatively significant share of formal and/or institution based TVET (in urban areas). Edukans also puts more emphasis on the vocationalisation of primary education and experiments with models of apprenticeships.
- Of the three partners, ICCO is the only one with a elaborated policy and strategy in the field of gender and HIV/AIDS mainstreaming. There is a great deal to be learned from the experience of ICCO for the other partners.

The CFOs all invest in the capacity development of their partners, putting the focus on organisational and institutional development and aiming at the improvement of the quality of TVET (through strengthening teacher training and curriculum development). The three organisations are clearly evolving from a strategy emphasising input in infrastructure (hardware) to a strategy that pays more attention to the development of soft skills (software). To date this evolution is not yet supported by a strategy on capacity building (clarifying exactly how the processes of capacitating partners will be executed). As a result, most of the current interventions are project based and not embedded in coherent and integral capacity building processes.

## 4.2. Evaluation question 2

---

*Evaluation question 2 - To what extent have ICCO, Woord en Daad and Edukans contributed to the organisational and institutional strengthening of their partner organisations and to an improved performance of the TVET activities executed by the partner organisations?*

---

In the ToR an assessment was asked of efficiency, effectiveness, mid term impact, relevance and sustainability of TVET activities. In this evaluation question, the focus is on the input-output relation. This evaluation question concerns the performance of the partner organisations, supported by ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad and on the contribution of the CFOs to the performance of their partners.

We shall begin by presenting a state of affairs with regard to the three judgement criteria:

- The accessibility, quality and relevance of TVET projects (poverty reduction)
- Involvement of social partners (civil society strengthening)
- Advocacy and lobby

This description of the state of affairs will be followed by an assessment of the effectiveness, efficiency, relevance and sustainability of the achievements and performance of the partner organisations.

### 4.2.1. THE ACCESSIBILITY, QUALITY AND RELEVANCE OF TVET

#### → Access

TVET projects often target lower skilled people, drop outs from general education, and poor and vulnerable groups. Different factors play a role in enhancing or hampering access of the target groups, such as selection criteria, level of education, participation fee, location of the centre and kind of TVET offered. In most of the projects visited access apparently did not pose any problems. Partner organisations did invest in stimulating access for the disadvantaged and poor youth. Many partner organisations even implemented a pro-active approach to facilitate access of poor and unprivileged target groups:

- Nine partner organisations collaborated with *community based organisations or NGO's* that were working with vulnerable groups in order to stimulate these target groups to participate in courses and/or to select future participants based on the criteria of the training organisations. Through these collaborations TVET providers could reach easily poor and/or vulnerable people.
- Sometimes TVET *programmes are integrated* in a much larger system of support to poorer families (e.g. Undugu, APDA, Asha Deep Foundation and Deepalaya) so that the selection of the neediest groups is already done ahead of the TVET training.

- Three organisations *paid house visits* in rural areas or slums (Shramdeep, Asha Deep Foundation and Hope Enterprises).
- Four organisations created residential courses, *offering hostels or lodging accommodation* (ADPA and Hope enterprises in Ethiopia, AMG and Woord en Daad India).
- For the training courses focussing on the informal sector, access to the training was made easy for poor youth *by offering them a set of tools*<sup>17</sup>. In fact, many trainers would require their trainees to bring their own set of basic tools, which represents an important investment (e.g. Undugu).

The evaluation team is convinced that no exclusion existed based on poverty. On the contrary, partners were targeting and succeeding in reaching poor and unprivileged groups (with one exception: EDU-PRO). However exclusion might exist, based on religion (e.g. Hindus and Muslims in India) or HIV status (exclusion from HIV infected people), but these exclusion mechanisms are more difficult to document (evaluators received some indications with regard to these hidden exclusion mechanisms from some stakeholders interviewed).

However, access could be hampered by personal and social factors, such as the required basic level of education, motivation and creativity and existing gender norms:

- *Distance* between the home and the venue of the training (e.g. Nairobi Kenya). In the case of Nairobi, students indicated the high transport costs and time was a major bottleneck for students from poor families. The CBOs were asked to cover the cost of the transport, but the evaluators cannot confirm that they actually paid these costs every day. Three partners visited covered transport costs to the vocational training centre and/or to the companies when doing internship in order to facilitate access (ECE, Hope enterprises and Ethiopian Aid).
- *Required basic skills or level of education*: three partners were training people for jobs that demanded higher skilled and motivated people, such as the babysitter training of YWCA, some of the ICT courses of ECE and the ICT and web design courses of Nairobi. Participants needed to have completed secondary education and to have a minimum of basic and social skills.
- *Entrance tests*: only seen in one organisation: Woord en Daad India. Students indicated it was quite difficult to access the course because they were subjected to an entrance test and only the best students were given access to the courses. This policy was necessary due to the fact that the demand is much higher than the capacity of Woord en Daad India, in particular the limited capacity of the hostel.

---

<sup>17</sup> In some particular periods (when the donor was not funding this part of the programme), Undugu was not able to deliver necessary tools for certain courses; students therefore did not choose to be trained for this particular sector.

- *Participation fee*: at most of the organisations participants had to pay a fee, however very small (and not indicated to be a problem). Only at EDU-PRO was the fee very high, excluding poor students from participation.
- All organisations accept both men and women (some projects were explicitly targeting women such as YWCA, AMG-International and Shramdeep). The main barrier with regard to gender is related to *the nature of the TVET-courses* offered and *industry-social discrimination* for accepting female ex-students as employees. This explains why in some TVET courses mainly boys/men were participating.

Most of the projects visited were urban based and attracted urban as well as rural target groups. Access of students coming from rural areas was encouraged by covering transport costs or the availability of the lodging accommodation. Partners targeting rural areas (exclusively or in combination with urban programmes) were organising the TVET courses within the rural communities. TVET courses (urban and rural) were adapted to the needs of the target groups and the market (see further). No specific exclusion mechanisms (others than those listed in the above) have been identified for TVET programmes in the rural areas but more in depth investigation could prove interesting.

### **Support by the CFOs with regard to access to TVET**

*Access to TVET is a concern of the three CFOs as it is a point of attention during policy discussions in the Netherlands. It is also taken up during policy dialogue with partners but these discussions appear to be limited to financial issues: covering transport costs, financing of hostels. CFOs also ask for information on selection criteria but when consulting the TVET project files (by the evaluator), often no information was available. The evaluators have no evidence of in depth discussions on facilitating access to TVET for poor and unprivileged people in urban and/or rural areas nor has specific research been done to this regard (exception: Woord en Daad recently started a research on the role of hostels). With regard to gender, discussions with partners were apparently limited to encouraging partners to look for courses/trades that would attract girls but not on the dominating gender roles.*

### **→ Quality**

Improvement of the quality of education is one of the main objectives, as formulated in the policies, of the three CFOs. The evaluators have looked at the quality of the inputs, processes and outputs of the educational process. We could say that the overall quality of TVET was good with almost all partner organisations (exception Shramdeep and APDA, see box). This was confirmed by interviews with all kinds of stakeholders and by comparison with experiences of the evaluators with regard to other TVET programmes. Below, we will

highlight aspects related to the quality of TVET: teachers, curriculum, equipment, syllabi, the educational process and link with the employment market.

Table 17: Brief overview of how the different partner organisations pay attention to the quality of the TVET offered.

<b>Partner organisation</b>	<b>How partners control quality of the educational process; input and output</b>
YWCA	Quality of trainers – careful selection (all are good professionals); regular revision of the curriculum; evaluation of the courses by the participants; follow up by staff of new contracted teachers, standardised tests of participants and development of professional and personal profiles of participants
ECE	Is core business: want to improve the quality of TVET through inputs in curriculum, textbooks and practical workshops (infrastructure) and upgrading technical knowledge of teachers through own organised courses;
EDU PRO	Training of teachers based on needs, assessment of teachers; investment in well equipped practical workshops; no investment in textbooks; limited input by parents, students and employers but not clear to what extent the school is receptive for comments
UNDUGU	Trainers are carefully selected; regular meetings with trainers and trainees; 3-day initial workshop to make sure that trainees choose the right trade; organises weekly theoretical classes for the trainees; these theoretical classes enable trainees to compare their own progress with that of their classmates; every trainee is given a set of tools (when donor funding is available), use of official test. Contracts with trainers are not renewed when they do not perform well or when their trainees do not easily find a job after the training (because of poor skills). The trainers of the weekly class-room training had formal degrees, the informal sector trainers were invited once a year to a session to upgrade their training skills.
NAIROBITS	Quality of trainers (some of them are ex-trainees); continuous learning process on part of the staff; and continuous review of the curriculum to match market demands. Regular contacts with professionals and enterprises. Up to date material (hardware and software). Students are tested after the second course and have to do a practical test to complete the training.
Deepalaya	Quality of trainers (all are good professionals with formal qualifications); Regular revision of the curriculum; evaluation of the courses by the participants and employers, no specific teacher training strategy
Asha Deep Foundation	Quality of trainers (all are good professionals with formal qualifications); no specific teacher training strategy; Regular revision of the curriculum; evaluation of the courses by the participants and employers
Shramdeep	Quality of trainers (all are good professionals with formal qualifications); no specific teacher training strategy; No revision of courses, more evaluations by participants needed
AMG International	Quality of trainers (all are good professionals with formal qualifications + teacher training facilities); Regular revision of the curriculum; evaluation of the courses by the participants and employers
Woord en Daad India	Quality of trainers (all are good professionals with formal qualifications + teacher training facilities); Regular revision of the curriculum; evaluation of the courses by the participants and employers
Hope enterprises	High quality of trainers. Peer to peer training and continuous mutual support, continuous revision of the curriculum; external recognition (in company practice for students) of student's performance; national examination competition results.
Ethiopian Aid	Continuous control process for external training centres –subcontracted based on competence and experience- Visits from training coordinator to subcontracted VTC Visit of civil society associations representatives to own training centre (quality check)
APDA	Internal control, no formal monitoring of quality.

**Teachers** – All organisations manage to recruit qualified teachers and, as proven by many interviews with students, the quality of teachers is very much appreciated. Most of the teachers have formal qualifications, are professionals in the subject they teach and are well motivated. It was beyond this evaluation to conduct an in-depth analysis of the human resources policies of the partners (salary, involvement of teachers in policy, incentives, etc.). All organisations monitor their teachers and eight of them assure teacher training. Teacher training is organised by the organisations themselves and can take different forms: participation in classes conducted by the training coordinator and/or other teachers (YWCA, ECE, EDU-PRO, Hope Enterprises, Ethiopian AID), peer to peer learning (ECE, EDU-PRO, Hope Enterprises) or officially organised meetings or workshops with teachers (at regular base). In two projects teacher training was based upon a needs assessment of the teachers (EDU-PRO and Hope Enterprises). Partner organisations of Woord en Daad all have teacher training facilities. These partners invest in a more systematic approach to teacher training and receive support from Woord en Daad to this regard. Teachers, especially those working for AMG international –where courses are recognized by Indian authorities- are kept updated about the latest developments in curricula and the labour market, fully assisted in this by material coming from the Indian Government. The evaluators have seen many motivated teachers who invest a lot of time in curricula development, elaboration of educational materials and not in the least in the follow up of their students. With most of the partners, teachers had a close link with their students, as they often lived in the same community. It was mainly through the networks of teachers that students found a job (see further).

**Curricula** – It should be noted that so far none of the countries visited elaborated a national qualification framework for TVET. All partners, except APDA in Ethiopia and Nairobi in Kenya, were offering formal or non formal courses that lead to officially recognised diploma's or certificates. These partners needed to follow official curricula and standards set by the government and did not have much room in which to manoeuvre. TVET curricula were often theoretically driven and not sufficiently adapted to the needs of the market, or to the needs of the participants. In Ethiopia - although curricula were more practically oriented - the fact that they changed every year made it difficult to maintain quality. In all countries partner organisations could adapt a part of the curricula (15%-30%) to make them more relevant. In instances where the non formal training was not leading to an officially recognised diploma, teachers developed courses themselves, sometimes not using existing knowledge and expertise in their area (ex; EDU PRO, ADF). All organisations, except Shramdeep and APDA, revised their curricula at a regular base. The quality of adaptations to the curricula (formal and non formal) was higher when organisations were helped by external experts or consultants (ex. ECE, Nairobi, AMG, Woord en Daad India, Deepalaya).

In some cases, alumni and ex-alumni were giving feedback on the training and the curricula used, although not organised in a very systematic way (YWCA, Undugu, Nairobi, Hope Enterprises, Shramdeep).

Ten of the thirteen partner organisations have good contact with businesses and industries (except for Shramdeep, Ethiopian aid and APDA), though mostly in an informal way. Business representatives were not formally involved in curriculum revision but could make recommendations (during formal meetings and visits of teachers to the business to discuss progress of trainees). It depended on the receptivity of the organisations and the limits of the national framework to what extent partner organisations effectively included suggestions of business representatives. However, interviews with stakeholders confirm that the relevance of the trainings was high (except at Shramdeep, APDA). Worth mentioning is the role of the job and business centres (JBC) supported by Woord en Daad. One of their functions was to close the gap between the vocational training centre and the labour market. Hence, these centres established formal contacts with businesses. At the JBC of AMG International in India, sessions were organised at a regular base (formal meetings) with employers to discuss the content of the curricula and the performance of the students. Any need or desire for changes in the curricula is thus communicated. At the JBC's of Woord en Daad India and Hope Enterprises, contact with businesses was more informal, when visiting students during their internship.

The case of Undugu is exceptional because this organisation is the only organisation visited using the apprenticeship model of training. All trainers are themselves entrepreneurs operating in the informal sector. In Kisumu (Kenya) trainers of Undugu had formed an association "Kisumu trainers of Undugu" and this association gave some valuable comments with regard to the adaptation of the trainings.

**Syllabi** – the weakest element with regard to the quality of TVET (in all countries and with almost all partners) is the quality of the syllabi - if they exist at all. Official textbooks were mostly outdated and of bad quality. Often there were no textbooks or not enough textbooks. Participants had to take notes during the courses. In many cases teachers adapted existing textbooks and manuals, with varying quality as a result. The quality of these textbooks was higher when organisations had received support from external experts (ex. ECE, Nairobi). It was obvious that insufficient attention was paid to the quality of textbooks, not by the partner organisations and not by the CFOs.

**Infrastructure and equipment** – From their observations, the evaluation teams can conclude that generally speaking the quality of the TVET facilities was quite adequate. All partners visited had well equipped practical workshops. Equipment, although sometimes outdated (mostly computer software), appeared to be operational and the buildings were well kept and in good order, this in contradiction to organisations that offer TVET but are not supported by external donors. Maintenance of equipment and continuous availability of necessary products however depend on the funds of either donors, the government or own income generating activities.

All these resources are not always guaranteed or sufficient. This has an impact on the quality of the training and forms the major obstacle for joint partnerships with regard to the use of infrastructure and equipment.

**Educational process** – the teaching process was often very classical and the evaluators did not see any innovative approaches. However, in almost all organisations attention was not only given to technical and vocational skills but also to the so called soft skills (working attitude, communication skills, etc.) The evaluators did not see much evidence of group work, integrated project based approaches, problem solving exercises or competence based education. All organisations combined classroom teaching and practice in the workshops with internships in business (short term or long term). The JBC established a structural approach to manage these internships; the other organisations had a more loose or informal approach. Some of the trainees received a stipend, some did not. Undugu is an organisation implementing the apprenticeship system. This approach has been considered as innovative in its kind.

#### *Box 1 Undugu Society of Kenya*

*Undugu's approach builds on the traditional system of apprenticeship that is largely practiced in the Kenyan informal sector. Under this system, the cost of the training for the employer is compensated by the trainees' contribution to the enterprise's production at no or very low cost. The involvement of Undugu represents an increase in the efficiency of this system for the trainee because of the following:*

- *better selection by the trainee of a trade that offers good employment perspectives;*
- *quality check of the capacity of the trainer;*
- *payment of a contribution to the trainer to compensate for the time spent supervising the trainee and for the consequent loss of benefits;*
- *follow-up of the trainers to make sure that there is a real transfer of 'marketable' skills to the youngster;*
- *on-the-job training is combined with technical/theoretical training to allow to pass grade III tests.*

*Training started with a three day initial workshop in order to inform the students on the most common trades so as to make sure students would choose the right trade to be trained for. Trainees spend the whole week with their entrepreneur/trainer and joined theoretical class once a week (during 6 to 12 months). Staff of Undugu paid regular visits to the training sites, mainly situated on informal markets and production areas. During the theoretical classes, experiences were shared and trainees could check with their peers if their own trainer was doing a good job.*

*As a result, youth quickly become acquainted with real work conditions and have practical, useful skills because what is taught depends on what is produced and in demand.*

**Output:** 11 of the 13 partners delivered officially recognised diplomas or certificates (with official evaluation and testing of students) which are important for students to find jobs in the private and public sector. Diplomas were recognised by the government (civic effect) or a particular sector. Most of the organisations were applying for official recognition of their –non formal- courses and yet implementing the official curricula. The distinction between formal and non formal TVET needs to be reconsidered. All TVET courses were basic

courses often with the possibility for further education and matched the educational level of the participants (as confirmed in interviews with students). Drop out rates differed between the organisations visited, as shown by the following table.

Table 18: overview of the number of students that have enrolled in TVET courses and have dropped out from TVET courses, organised by the partners visited.

	2003 or 2003-2004		2004 or 2004-2005		2005 or 2005-2006		2006 or 2006-2007	
	Enrolled	Drop out	Enrolled	Drop out	Enrolled	Drop out	Enrolled	Drop out
YWCA	125	0	89	0	161	0	305	0
ECE	n.r.	n.r.	60	0	160	0	113	0
EDU-PRO	190	1	163	1	138	3	98	0
USK	156	4	152	4	173	5	430	13
Nairobi	<b>73</b>	<b>41</b>	<b>91</b>	<b>59</b>	<b>83</b>	<b>51</b>	<b>160</b>	<b>128</b>
Deepalaya	<b>Period 2003-2006 : enrolment of 1446 students ; drop outs 771 (53%)</b>							
ADF	n.r.	n.r.	n.r.	n.r.	n.r.	n.r.	<b>149</b>	<b>49 (30%)</b>
Shramdeep	<b>No data available for 2003-2005. Two courses in 2006: 50 participants for cutting and tailoring; 50 participants for bamboo. Drop out of all participants at the bamboo art course (100%); drop out of 20% of the cutting and tailoring course</b>							
AMG+JBC	325	<5%	325	<5%	325	<5%	325	<5%
WDI	260	<5%	260	<5%	260	<5%	290	<5%
Hope enterprises	111	0	147	1	82	2	82	9
Ethiopian aid	40	0	38	3	30	3	40	0
APDA	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

Source: data delivered by partner organisations during evaluation; n.a.= data not available; in bold partners with high drop out rates

Three organisations (EDU-PRO, AMG and Hope Enterprises) were formally recognised by the government to deliver formal secondary technical and vocational education. These programmes were characterised by a low drop out rate. AMG-international, Woord en Daad India (not yet officially recognised) and Hope enterprises, all partners of Woord en Daad, manage to control the drop out rate of their programmes (formal secondary as well as non formal secondary and post secondary education and training) because of the chain approach (long term support for students) and good quality of the programme. The low drop out rate for the school of EDU-PRO can be explained by the fact that it is a private school with high fees (sometimes paid by the students themselves) and the good quality of the school as compared to the public school. This school is the last chance for students that have dropped out of the general education system but who are still motivated to get a diploma.

Four organisations, offering non formal post secondary TVET, have a high drop out rate. Drop out was caused by several factors:

- Length of the training: as soon as they acquired some basic skills, beneficiaries started to look for a job or started an income generating activity (e.g. ADF, Shramdeep, Deepalaya, Nairobits). Drop out rate is higher in long term courses compared to short term courses (except for the long term courses offered by partners of Woord en Daad – see above)
- Level of the training: weaker and/or less dynamic participants dropped out and not much guidance was foreseen to increase the employability of this group (ex. Niarobits)
- Relevance of the training (ex: Shramdeep – bamboo training)

#### *Box 2 Nairobits-drop out rates*

*The TVET programme from NairoBits seeks to offer ICT education to youths from the informal settlements i.e. slums. The core business is training the beneficiaries on web-design through four levels of courses which are run progressively. Each level is meant to achieve its specific objectives. Besides the computer training, NairoBits pays attention to entrepreneurship and business management skills, life skills and HIV/AIDS. At the end of the first course, only half of the (+/-40) trainees are allowed to proceed to the second course. The fact that NairoBits' training is very demanding on creativity and drawing skills, self-management and motivation, results in a higher drop-out rate after the first part of the course, but poverty appears not to be the determining factor. For the drop-outs it appears difficult to find gainful employment, mainly because there are many computer literate people on the Nairobi labour market. Furthermore, prospects of starting self-employment after 5 weeks are too weak. All trainees who go to the second stage proceed to the third course. Only a minority (+/-4) are dropped at the end of course 3 but they appear to have adequate skills to be able to get into gainful employment in i.e. cybercafé and ICT companies.*

*The entrance education level could have been a factor limiting access of the poorer youngsters. Trainees in NairoBits have completed Form 4 of the secondary level (4 years post-primary = Kenya's Certificate of Secondary Education - KCSC).*

**Support by the CFOs with regard to quality improvement of the TVET courses** – above all, the CFOs have invested in good infrastructure and equipment of practical workshops. Input with regard to curricula and syllabi development, teacher training and the educational process was very limited. Edukans and ICCO did support partners upon request (re-active approach), mostly via financing of external experts. It should be acknowledged that questions from partners were primarily related to financial management or gender strategies and much less to the quality of the TVET offered. Woord en Daad had a more pro-active approach. They invested in teacher training (supported by TVET schools in the Netherlands or members of their business platform) and developed the concept of JBCs that should enhance –amongst other things - the involvement of businesses with regard to curriculum development.

The CFOs organised several partner meetings, but mostly the focus was more on discussing the policy of the CFO and less on a particular aspect related to the quality and relevance of TVET. Woord en Daad did organise several expert meetings (since 2005) discussing the quality and relevance of TVET.

→ **Adaptation of TVET towards demands of the labour market and needs of participants and communities**

Here we highlight one factor that contributes to the quality and relevance of TVET, namely the receptiveness of TVET providers to the demands of the labour market and the demands/needs of beneficiaries.

Most partners visited were organising centre based TVET-courses in traditional sectors that were relevant with regard to job opportunities. Curricula were adapted, mainly based on feedback of the business sector. Curricula were dropped (ex. car mechanics at EDU-PRO) or started according to job opportunities in a particular sector (ex. secretariat at Hope enterprises). Following this we describe how partner organisations link up with businesses, parents, students and communities.

Table 19: Brief overview of how partner organisations link up with the private sector

<b>Partner organisation</b>	<b>How organisations link up with businesses/private sector</b>
YWCA	Own employment centre: advertising babysitting and janitor services, job mediation of ex participants; facilitating contracts between employers and employees. Through these contacts employers give feedback on the quality of the skills acquired.
ECE	Informal contacts with businesses. Facilitating cooperation between public VET school and business (resulted in a formal agreement: objective it to increase the relevancy of the VET courses to the demands of the industry – to be started in 2008)
EDU-PRO	Informal contacts between teachers and employers (when looking for internships; when supervising trainees at the workplace) Formal contacts through “open day” activities: employers are invited to the school Employers participate in examination juries to assess performance of students
UNDUGU	There is an intrinsic link with the private sector since all the trainers are themselves entrepreneurs operating in the informal sector. UNDUGU organises yearly meetings with all trainers; those who are involved in the theoretical training courses also actively participate in the 3 days preparatory trade-selection seminar. In Kisumu, the trainers have created their own association ‘Kisumu trainers of UNDUGU Kenya Society’ and give feedback on the programme. There is no structured link with the informal sector professional organisations nor with the formal sector industries
Nairobits	Built up a network with entrepreneurs in the formal and informal sector. Trainees in the final stage of the NairoBits programme have to fulfil an internship in a business. Informal meetings during follow up of students or during individual meetings at the centre. There is need to strengthen the links with the industry further by e.g. inviting ex-trainees to stay involved with NairoBits and inform them of the changes in the industry so that NairoBits can respond by adapting its curriculum. Now this happens accidentally.
Deepalaya	Informal contacts with employers thru C.E.O and board members facilitating contacts between employers and students
Asha Deep Foundation	Informal contacts with employers thru C.E.O and board members facilitating contacts between employers and students

Shramdeep	NA: villagers are predominantly self-employed
AMG international	Own job and business centre with formalized contacts with employers concerning traineeships and employment
Woord en Daad India	Own job and business centre with relatively informal contacts with employers concerning traineeships and employment
Hope enterprises	JBC: formal and informal contacts between teachers, JBC and business sector. Formal agreements with business sector exist with regard to internships. Curricula are discussed during these contacts.
Ethiopian AID	No direct linkage with business sector (is starting -new staff addressed to it.
APDA	No linkage with business sector

**Link with business** - All organisations do collaborate with the private sector (formal and informal sector) except Shramdeep in India (focus on self employment) and Ethiopian AID and APDA in Ethiopia (both focussing more on facilitating access to micro finances and stimulating self employment). Most of the contacts are rather informal and based upon the network of the teachers, trainers, staff and board members. Through these informal contacts, businesses could comment on the quality of the training and express their needs; the teachers could find places for traineeships and employment after graduating (see further).

Effective contribution to curriculum development in a systematic way has hardly taken place and has only been seen at four organisations: (1) the JBC of AMG-international and of Hope enterprises organised formal discussions with business representatives to discuss –amongst others- the relevance of the curricula; (2) at Nairobi, business representatives were invited to the centre to give a lecture to the trainees regarding their field of expertise. This was often an occasion to discuss the training contents; (3) at Undugu the association of trainers, all themselves entrepreneurs, did comment at regular base on the content of the trainings.

*Box 3 Linking schools with industry is not easy – case ECE-Albania*

*The example of ECE in Albania shows how difficult it is to convince businesses and industries to invest in their relation with TVET providers. ECE is an intermediate service delivery organisation, implementing programmes to increase quality and relevance of TVET courses in public TVET service providers.*

*ECE facilitated contacts between VET providers and business:*

- *the 2 VET schools of Elbasan, the VET centre and the association of constructors have been put in contact by mediation of ECE*
- *ECE organised a meeting with 12 business representatives, the two VET schools and the VET centre, the Ministry of Education and the Ministry of Labour. The purpose was to sensitize VET providers on the importance of developing ICT and automatisation courses that are adequate for the industry. A video was made to show ICT applications in the automatisation systems used by the industries.*

*Through these meetings, ECE and the VET schools established good contacts with different businesses. One of the concrete results is the signing of a formal agreement with two construction companies and 1 metal-mechanics industry and the schools to organise in close collaboration specific courses that match with the demands of the companies. The companies will deliver materials (equip workshops), the school will develop a specific course. This project is to be started. Another result is the opportunity for 7 students to do an internship in these industrial companies.*

*However, it is a slow process. . Contacts between business and schools are still fragile. At the moment not many students are doing internships in business and so far there is no t frequent interaction between schools and business to adapt curricula to the needs of the business. ECE formulated following hampering factors: (1) schools (formal) are a difficult partner. Schools in Albania are managed top-down. According to ECE it is difficult to change the school mentality. (2) Schools have to follow the official curriculum. Teachers cannot easily integrate new knowledge in their courses or adapt the courses to the needs of the business. (3) the legislative environment is not conducive to stimulate industrial companies to invest in trainees.*

*Because it is not easy to intervene with school management and in order to have an entry door in schools, ECE started its interventions in the first place with provision of equipment, materials or support in the modification of the school infrastructure. In a second phase ECE introduces new approaches, teachers training and enhances the link between schools and business. Unfortunately, most of the programmes of ECE are still limited to the first phase.*

**Link with parents** - There is an overall limited input from parents and students in curriculum development or the policy of the TVET providers. Mostly this target group has no capacity to claim their rights or give inputs to these organisations and most of the organisations did not develop strategies to improve participation of parents and students. Involvement of parents was not always relevant: many children did not have parents any more and most of the organisations were offering non formal TVET targeting young adults. One exception: Undugu's ISTP programme was linked to their family programme through which Undugu also reached the parents of the students.

Two organisations – Hope enterprises in Ethiopia and EDU-PRO in Albania, both organising secondary education - did collaborate with parents, inviting them to school to discuss progress of their children (monthly meetings). In both cases, they claimed higher qualitative textbooks and gave comments on the quality of the courses and the skills acquired by their children. It is not clear to what extent suggestions of parents had been taken into account. No evidence was found at EDU-PRO or at Hope enterprises to this regard.

**Link with students** – None of the organisations organised evaluations of the programme by the students (except YWCA and ECE). Feedback on the curriculum and quality of training was mainly given by ex-students. Four organisations kept contact with ex-students and even organised meetings with them (YWCA, Undugu, Nairobi, Hope enterprises). In some cases, mainly with the partners of Woord en Daad but also at Undugu, ex-students became employers themselves and recruited trainees from their own old schools or training centres. No needs assessments of future students has been done (except at EDU-PRO). Based on the experience of EDU-PRO we could remark that the results of needs assessment of students do not always coincide with job opportunities.

**Link with communities** – Two community based (Undugu and Shramdeep) and two centre based TVET providers (Nairobits and Hope enterprises) collaborated closely with community based organisations or organised groups within the communities in order to create relevant TVET courses for the beneficiaries, with a return effect on the community. Though relevance was not always guaranteed (case Shramdeep). The other organisations did collaborate with community based organisations mainly for the identification and selection of students.

**Role of the CFOs with regard to increasing relevance of TVET** - *Both Woord en Daad and Edukans did reflect with their partners how to improve the relevance of the TVET courses by adapting them more to the needs of the labour market, participants and communities. Woord en Daad started to experiment, in close collaboration with their partners, with the set up of job and business centres. A staff member at Woord en Daad in particular is studying on this issue and supporting the partners. Several meetings have been organised to discuss this approach. Edukans started to invest more in a community based approach of TVET, in particular in India, trying to increase the involvement of communities into TVET and hence to increase the relevance of TVET. One partner of ICCO, ECE in Albania, is focussing on the collaboration between TVET schools and the industry and is promoted by ICCO as a good example/practice. However, not much support from ICCO was given to this regard.*

→ **Cost-effectiveness and relation input-activities-output**

To analyse cost-effectiveness of TVET projects lots of data are needed: cost for infrastructure, equipment, training materials, administrative overheads, salaries of teachers and trainers, transportation costs and meals. One has to take into account the income incurred by individual and training duration. Another factor influencing cost-effectiveness and formulated by Woord en Daad: “one also has to take into account the loss of investment already put into students if drop outs from the general system will not be further trained and find a job”. In the scope of this evaluation it was impossible to gather all these data. Not least because budgets were including many times more activities than just the TVET activities. Nor has any information been found in the few existing evaluation reports. It is impossible to compare different approaches and conclusions drawn would not go beyond what is already general accepted.

All projects showed sufficient consistency between the inputs, activities and outputs (for details see field reports). However, in some projects the drop out rate was rather high (30%-60%) and not much follow up was given to these drop outs. This reduces the cost-effectiveness of these projects.

→ **Complementary to national initiatives and sector wide approaches**

All countries visited are starting to increase their attention to TVET. In Albanian and Ethiopia, a general educational reform process is going on, including TVET. In Kenya government attention to TVET is rather limited and only focuses on formal TVET.

Challenges for TVET in the different countries: some keywords			
Kenya	Ethiopia	Albania	India
<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Coordination and linkages to enhance synergy (public and non public)</li> <li>▪ Qualifications framework</li> <li>▪ Stop exodus of qualified teachers (attraction and retention strategy)</li> <li>▪ Infrastructure</li> <li>▪ Access for people with disabilities</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Policy framework to give direction and stimulate cooperation (public and non public)</li> <li>▪ Teacher training</li> <li>▪ Retention strategies for teachers</li> <li>▪ Infrastructure</li> <li>▪ Changing negative image of TVET</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Policy framework (integrated approach)</li> <li>▪ Improve performance of (newly created) policy bodies/institutions</li> <li>▪ Teacher training</li> <li>▪ Provision of didactical materials</li> <li>▪ Rehabilitation of infrastructure and facilities</li> <li>▪ Changing negative image of TVET</li> </ul>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>▪ Focus on unemployment in rural areas</li> <li>▪ Expansion of service providers (increase absorption capacity)</li> <li>▪ Development of flexible and adapted TVET strategies</li> <li>▪ Develop wider offer</li> </ul>

*Source: context study field reports*

All partner organisations largely support the government policy in their formal and non formal structures and modalities (to achieve qualitative and relevant TVET) and are also complementary to government policy (in particular with regard to non formal courses). They all received official licences to execute TVET (except Nairobi and APDA) and collaborate with official government structures, such as employment offices. The partner organisations fill a gap in the sector for TVET as the official technical institutes or vocational schools are not covering the demand for TVET, in particular the demands of poor and unprivileged people. In all countries visited there is a large market of private TVET initiatives. However, these initiatives are not always of a good quality and mostly very expensive. Access from poor people to these private initiatives is not guaranteed.

However, legislation (and the political context) is often failing to give TVET providers the opportunity to improve the quality of their courses or to enhance collaboration with the labour market (ex. incentives for employers to attract trainees).

Bilateral donors play an important role in supporting the TVET reform processes, like the European Commission, GTZ, Kulturcontact, Swiss contact, etc. (in particular GTZ played a leading role in the countries visited). These international donors are involved in pilot projects and have access to government structures.

They are in a position?? to influence policy with regard to curriculum development and the elaboration of a qualification framework. The partner organisations visited often have no contacts with these donors or are not well informed on the reform processes. They are first and foremost implementing organisations (except ECE and EDU-PRO in Albania and Hope enterprises in Ethiopia).

→ **Gender**

All partner organisations are targeting men as well as women, except YWCA (Albania) which is a women's organisation. Three of the partners have separate TVET programmes directed towards women (Shramdeep, Deepalaya, AMG-International).

*Table 20: Brief overview of the gender approaches of the partners visited (in general- not limited to TVET)*

<b>Partner organisation</b>	<b>State of affairs with regard to gender policy</b>	<b>Percentage of female participation</b>
YWCA	A women's organisation, focus on empowerment of women (incl. TVET); including men in meetings but no focus on changing gender roles explicitly	100%
ECE	Gender neutral – no specific actions; use of sex disaggregated data	40%
EDU-PRO	Gender neutral – use sex disaggregated data; no specific gender policy (except that girls can enter the school for free). School with male image. Looking for trades that attract girls (traditional trades). No gender sensitive needs assessments.	10%
UNDUGU	Gender sensitive organisation, but they still face the challenge of orienting girls towards non-traditional occupations They have a gender policy and a lot of female staff in all sections of the organisation.	37%
NAIROBITS	Gender sensitive organisation. Gender policy drafted with support of ICCO local consultants; the general staff consists of women. Some of the trainers are men;	50%
Deepalaya	Gender sensitive organisation. Formal gender policy. Aspires to equal access for men and women, looking for trades that attract girls. Specific programme on gender equity.	20%
Asha Deep Foundation	Gender sensitive. Formal gender policy. Aspires to equal access for man and women. No active policy to look for trades to attract more girls. Also implements a women empowerment programme.	20%
Shramdeep	Gender sensitive: In one village only women are targeted by the TVET, in the other villages both women and men. Active policy to engage more boys in training. Formal gender policy	80%
AMG international	Gender sensitive: ensures equal access for man and women. No active policy to look for trades to attract more girls. Formal gender policy Specific programmes targeting (illiterate) girls and women (education, support of self help groups, etc.).	100% (women project) 10% (JBC activities)
Woord en Daad India	Gender sensitive: ensures equal access for men and women. No active policy to look for trades to attract more girls. Formal gender policy	20%
Hope enterprises	Gender sensitive: Gender policy is well defined and all their initiatives are gender balanced. Sex disaggregated data with regard to enrolment, drop out, labour insertion.	50%
Ethiopian Aid	Gender sensitive: equal access of men and women and gender disaggregated data regarding labour insertion. No written gender policy but specific programme on reproductive health.	50%

APDA	Gender sensitive organisation: no written gender policy but specific programmes on gender and women empowerment. Actions focus on women as key agent for change	80%
------	---	-----

Four organisations have a well designed gender policy that is put into practice: YWCA, Nairobi, Undugu and Hope enterprises. Two of them are partners of ICCO. Undugu received a gender training, financed by ICCO. Hope enterprises did develop a gender policy recently as was recommended by the evaluation of 2005.

The other partner organisations are gender neutral or gender sensitive<sup>18</sup> and do not have active gender policies. The attention to gender is limited to the delivery and monitoring of sex-disaggregated data and the attention for access of girls/women to TVET (mostly by organising specific curricula that attract girls). The evaluators have not seen pro-active strategies to attract girls/women. Girls and women are trained for traditional female professions such as tailoring, beauty culture, textile designing, janitors, hairdressing, etc. This is partly due to the fact that the girls still prefer these professions. But it also illustrates that most of the partner organisations are not promoting actively enough girls' participation in relatively new economic activities where gender prejudices are less strong, such as computer and mobile repairs or ICT in general.

Participation at TVET contributes to the empowerment of women, giving them access to education and the possibility to earn an income. Participation of women at TVET has a positive influence on their self-esteem and confidence as confirmed during focus group discussions and individual interviews. This impact is even strengthened when TVET courses are part of a larger women empowerment programme, such as implemented by YWCA, APDA, Deepalaya, ADF and AMG-international (e.g. in combination with self help groups).

However, gender roles are not discussed nor do partner organisations have an internal gender policy with regard to their own staff. None of the organisations is working towards transforming gender roles or changing the perception of gender roles. Mainstreaming gender in all activities requires much more than setting targets for equal participation of boys and girls. It should also take into account systematic gender-needs analysis of target groups and an analysis of how TVET activities affect gender relations within the families.

---

<sup>18</sup> Gender neutral = no specific attention to the differences between men and women (needs, motivation, etc.), gender sensitive= gender sensitive approaches respond to the different needs and constraints of individuals based on their gender and sexuality. Women's practical needs are identified and attempts are made to meet those needs through service delivery.

We do not have much data on the drop out of women as this is not systematically followed up by partners. Interviews indicated that there was a general feeling of a higher drop out amongst women (e.g. because of marriage, pregnancy). No specific attention is given by the partners visited to follow up the drop out of female students.

#### → HIV and AIDS

HIV and AIDS can affect TVET programmes in different ways: loss of students, loss of teachers, difficulty in combining education with care taking tasks, difficulty in participating in all classes, stigma and discrimination, etc. Furthermore, educational settings are appropriate places to invest in information on sexuality and HIV and AIDS prevention, particularly in regions with high HIV/AIDS prevalence. We analysed to what extent partner organisations integrated HIV and AIDS into their workplace (internal mainstreaming) and in their programmes (external mainstreaming).

*Table 21: Brief overview of the HIV/AIDS policy of the partner organisations visited*

<b>Partner organisation</b>	<b>State of affairs with regard to HIV/AIDS policy</b>
YWCA	External mainstreaming: training courses on HIV/AIDS for staff and members; including HIV/AIDS prevention in other activities; condom distribution; collaboration with PLWHA; discussing discrimination of PLWHA with members and parents of the day care centre No workplace policy
ECE	No policy and no actions. ECE refers to HIV/AIDS focussed organisations in Albania (some of them funded by ICCO)
EDU-PRO	External mainstreaming: HIV/AIDS programme separately funded by ICCO. Prevention activities towards students (leaflets, seminars, competition). Collaboration with HIV/AIDS focussed organisation in Tirana; no condom distribution at school Internal mainstreaming: only informal information session to staff; no workplace policy
UNDUGU	Many of the youngsters that are in UNDUGU - ISTP programme are orphans whose parents died of AIDS. Some have to take care of their younger brothers and sisters. A number of the trainees are affected by AIDS and are supported to access free medicines. During the initial 3-days workshop, due attention is given to the youth reproductive health and to the HIV/AIDS issues.
NAIROBITS	NairoBits recognized the need to sensitise its employees on the negative impact HIV/AIDS pandemic can have on them and the institution. Consequently a workplace policy and a comprehensive HIV/AIDS policy was put in place to guide all its employees (with support from ICCO). The policy is being reviewed to include trainees and other persons associated with the institution. With the World Population Fund, NairoBits has set up the "world start with me" programme (part of the Educaids network).
Deepalaya	Education on HIV/AIDS for staff and students. No workplace policy
Asha Deep Foundation	Education on HIV/AIDS for staff and students. No workplace policy
Shramdeep	Education on HIV/AIDS for students. No workplace policy
AMG international	Education on HIV/AIDS for students. No workplace policy
Woord en Daad India	Education on HIV/AIDS for students. No workplace policy
Hope enterprises	No workplace policy for staff but training courses and campaigns-activities on HIV/AIDS for staff and beneficiaries
Ethiopian aid	No workplace policy for staff but programmes on reproductive health and integrated HIV and AIDS programmes; integration of HIV/AIDS prevention activities in TVET programme
APDA	No workplace policy for staff but training courses on HIV/AIDS for beneficiaries. Implement a health programme including attention to HIV and AIDS

**External mainstreaming**<sup>19</sup> - all organisations<sup>20</sup> integrated HIV and AIDS in their programme, in particular focussing HIV and AIDS education and prevention. They all deliver information on HIV/AIDS infection, discrimination and stigma and how to prevent infection. One organisation (YWCA) explicitly discussed discrimination against PLWHA with their beneficiaries after being confronted with a particular case of discrimination. The partner organisations collaborate with HIV/AIDS focussed organisations that deliver sensitization materials.

Condoms are rarely distributed and voluntary counselling and testing not actively offered. Only one organisation was actively facilitating access to medicines for infected students (Undugu, Kenya).

Six partners visited also implement health programmes. Three of them, all Ethiopian partners, explicitly include HIV and AIDS in these health programmes (Hope enterprises, Ethiopian AID and APDA). This can be explained by the higher prevalence rate in Ethiopia as compared to India. None of the partners effectively mainstreamed HIV and AIDS in their policy and TVET programme and went beyond information delivery (except Undugu and Nairobi).

**Internal mainstreaming**<sup>21</sup> – is weak and does not go beyond informing staff on HIV/AIDS. None of the partner organisations has developed a HIV/AIDS workplace policy (except Nairobi, Kenya). No human resources policies have been adapted to mitigate the loss of or decreased engagement of teachers because of HIV/AIDS or to fight stigma and discrimination at the workplace.

### **Support by the CFOs with regard to gender and HIV and AIDS mainstreaming**

*Gender- In particular ICCO is supporting partners that have developed women empowerment programmes (YWCA, APDA) and facilitates gender training when needed (ex. Nairobi, Undugu). Gender is part of the policy dialogue with partners. Focus of discussion is still on equal access of men and women to TVET. It depends largely on the capacity of the programme officers how to discuss gender with the partners.*

---

<sup>19</sup>External mainstreaming : adapting development and humanitarian programme work in order to take into account susceptibility to HIV transmission and vulnerability to the impacts of AIDS. The focus is on the core programme work in the changing context created by AIDS. Various degrees of mainstreaming (separate HIV and AIDS work; integrated AIDS work or mainstreaming HIV and AIDS in all programme components (Sue Holden, 2003).

<sup>20</sup> ECE is the only organisation not implementing HIV/AIDS awareness activities. ECE is not implementing TVET itself but investing in the improvement of quality of TVET through curriculum development and teacher training (technical knowledge of teachers).

<sup>21</sup> Internal mainstreaming: changing organisational policy and practice in order to reduce the organisation's susceptibility to HIV-infection and its vulnerability to the impacts of AIDS. The focus is on AIDS and the organisation. It has two elements: AIDS work with staff, such as HIV prevention and treatment, and modifying the ways in which the organisation functions (Sue Holden, 2003).

*Gender policy of Edukans and Woord en Daad is more implicit and probably translated into the support for specific women programmes, as seen at Shramdeep and AMG-international in India. Gender is part of the policy dialogue. Hope enterprises, for example, was encouraged to develop a gender policy, based on a recommendation of an evaluation. None of the CFOs reflected with their partners on the usefulness of gender-needs analyses or impact assessments of TVET on gender roles, etc. The CFOs did not discuss in depth with their partners how job opportunities for girls/women could be increased and how to fight gender prejudices with regard to women employment.*

*HIV and AIDS - Most of the partners of the CFOs are linked to the Protestant-Christian religion and are looking for the most appropriate way to address HIV and AIDS with respect for Christian values. All CFOs are stimulating this discussion. As seen in the above, Edukans and ICCO are involved in the network Educaids (that goes beyond TVET partners), through which they try to stimulate the dialogue on HIV/AIDS between NGOs and faith based organisations.*

*Woord en Daad is in a process of developing a HIV and AIDS policy (base on the policy developed by Prisma- with active collaboration of Woord en Daad) and has recently brought HIV and AIDS discussions in the regional partner meetings (2007). In the coming years partners will be stimulated and supported to mainstream HIV and AIDS in the workplace and in their programmes.*

*ICCO has developed a HIV and AIDS policy with clear guidelines for programme officers to integrate HIV and AIDS in policy dialogues. Separate funds exist to fund training programmes for partners or the elaboration of HIV/AIDS workplace policies. Consultants of I/C consult can assist partners when asked for. However it depends largely on the motivation and capacities of programme officers how they discuss HIV and AIDS with their partners. ICCO has set the objective that all partners will have developed a workplace policy by 2010. Only Nairobits has yet to develop a workplace policy.*

#### 4.2.2. INVOLVEMENT OF SOCIAL PARTNERS (MULTI STAKEHOLDERS APPROACH)

##### → **Strengthening of civil society organisations**

Partner organisations visited were not much involved in collaboration with or strengthening of teachers associations, parents associations and private sector associations. No strengthening of these kinds of civil society organisations was included in the TVET policies of ICCO, Edukans and Woord en Daad for the period 2003-2006. In the new co-financing programme of the ICCO alliance, objectives to this regard have been included.

The evaluators did not analyse the whole portfolio, hence it could be possible that these kinds of associations are supported through other programmes of the three CFO's (educational programmes, livelihood programmes and economic programmes).

**Teachers associations** – no evidence was found of collaboration between teachers associations and partner organisations involved in TVET in the visited countries, though in every country teachers associations did exist (but often very weak or politically dominated). For the partners, the biggest challenge is to find good qualified and motivated teachers. Hence, many of the partners took good care of their teachers. EDU-PRO in Albania was organising specific activities for their teachers on teacher's day; Undugu in Kenya actively collaborated with the trainer's association in Kisumu.

**Parents associations** – no evidence was found of collaboration between partner organisations and parents associations. Two organisations had regular contact with the parents of their students (EDU-PRO and Hope enterprises) but did not stimulate parents to form an association; neither did they link these parents with existing parents' associations at local or national level. Most of the partner organisations were offering TVET courses at post secondary level, targeting (young) adults. It seems evident that the organisations involved with parents are particularly those organisations offering secondary education.

**Private sector associations** – in all countries visited employers were not well organised or chambers of commerce were not very vibrant. Apparently chambers of commerce see TVET more as education and not as "job preparation" and they were not interested in linking up with TVET providers. The evaluators did not find evidence of collaboration between private sector associations and the partners (except some recent efforts of Hope Enterprises to link up in an informal way with some members of the Chambers of Commerce). Stakeholders interviewed explained this situation as follows: (1) private sector associations are a recent phenomenon. Employers used to see each other mainly as competitors, (2) employers do not want to share confidential information with their competitors when discussing the contents of new training programmes and

(3) most of the employers do not have problems finding qualified employees and so do not see the added value of talking with partners that reach only a limited amount of students. As a consequence, all organisations collaborate with employers in a rather informal way (through the individual contacts of the teachers) or invite them “one by one” to their centres. Through these informal contacts, partner organisations get information on the appropriateness of their courses and access to places for traineeships or job placement.

→ **Relationship/cooperation with (local) government (institutions) or other institutions engaged in TVET activities**

All partner organisations (except Nairobits and APDA) visited received official licenses to execute TVET programmes (formal or non formal) and as such have to deal with national official government structures such as departments for inspection, for curriculum development (though these departments are often weak). Two organisations are more formally involved in official TVET structures: (1) the director of Hope enterprises is member of the council for VTC of the Ministry of Education. (2) In India AMG-International is recognised to deliver formal secondary education and as such participates in official networks with regard to formal TVET.

Partner organisations collaborated with public employment offices (exchange of information, referring people), if they existed. . No other forms of collaboration with government structures were seen. The evaluators also did not see collaboration with local authorities (in case the local authority would have a local economic development plan or with regard to the local authority as an employer).

We did not see collaboration between public vocational schools and private vocational schools or NGOs (ex; to share infrastructure and equipment, to negotiate together with employers, etc.)<sup>22</sup>. Only Hope enterprises (Ethiopia) shared their infrastructure (practical workshops) with the public schools. And the director of Hope enterprises, as member of the council for VTC, is in the process of negotiating with employers to increase internship opportunities for all TVET students.

We did not see much collaboration between TVET providers in general. The example of Hope enterprises has already been explained. Other examples are (1) AMG international that has institutionalized contacts with Industrial Technical Institutes (formal VET institutes), (2) collaboration between EDU-PRO and ECE, two partners in Albania that exchange ideas on specific VET curricula (though weak), (3) Undugu that is considered to be a leader in the sector of TVET and advice and support are requested from other

---

<sup>22</sup> In Albania the private vocational school (supported by ICCO and Edukans) was in competition with the public vocational school.

organisations (ex. Undugu inspired World vision), (4) YWCA is collaborating with CBOs that also organise TVET for their specific target groups but rely on YWCA for the babysitter and janitor courses. The other partners visited do collaborate with other NGO's or government structures but not specifically on TVET.

### ***Role of CFOs with regard to networking, linking and learning***

*Not much networking, linking and learning have taken place. Woord en Daad stimulates the set up of VTC networks. In particular the JBC assume this responsibility. The evaluators did not see such VTC network in the countries visited, but based on the information of Woord en Daad, one VTC network is still operational. However partners of the same CFO meet each other during partner meetings. Woord en Daad did organise expert meetings where partners meet each other and discuss in particular TVET related issues. Partner meetings organised by Edukans and ICCO are rather focussing the CFO's policy. Only recently (2007) ICCO discussed TVET related issues with their TVET partners in Albania and Edukans organised in India a workshop on Education for Work for its partner organisations, targeting a.o. the issue of community based vocational training.*

*In daily life, partner organisations of the three CFOs do not meet each other or exchange information. For example, Woord en Daad India and AMG International India (partner Woord en Daad) have not exchanged information and ideas (only the directors meet each other but information is not filtered through the rest of the staff, CEO and board members).*

*With the start of the ICCO alliance and the development of common country programmes, collaboration between TVET partners will probably increase.*

*In this context it is worth mentioning the strategic choice of Edukans to start clustering their partners in each country. The purpose is to cluster four to six partners and to increase collaboration, linking and learning within and between these clusters. This strategic choice is very much appreciated by the partners visited. However it is too early to assess the effectiveness of this approach. To support these clusters (and as such the partners), Edukans started to create local expertise centres that will support these clusters and enhance linking and learning and facilitate capacity building.*

#### *Box 4 Local Expertise Centre Development Focus, Bangalore India*

*Development Focus has been acting as the local expertise centre of Edukans Foundation for the past year. Its major objective is to pre-assess and evaluate programmes and projects on behalf of Edukans Foundation and to build capacities of local NGOs getting assistance from the Foundation in managerial and educational skills. It has also formed forums for NGOs working in the field of education and rural/community development and so far about 30 member organisations are being assisted in the three Indian states of Chattisgarh, Orissa and Jharkhand. Most of the assisted NGOs are working in the field of formal and non-formal education and currently the organisation is providing training to them in the field of community development, appropriate technology, life skills and livelihood skills to strengthen their functioning at the grass root levels.*

*The Administrative office of Development Focus located at Bangalore constitutes four staff members, namely a Team Leader, a Consultant, a Programme Coordinator and a trainee, who oversee and provide assistance and guidance to the NGOs through workshops organized by them at state/ headquarters level. The organisation draws heavily on the expertise of other organisations from within and outside the country for providing training in the specified fields.*

#### **4.2.3. ADVOCACY AND LOBBY BY PARTNERS**

Not much advocacy and lobby activities have been seen that go beyond the lobby for the own interest of the partner organisations, namely to receive official recognition of TVET courses provided. To this regard, all partner organisations manage to have contacts with national or decentralised? deconcentrated government structures.

Four organisations are involved in advocacy and lobby activities but not with regard to TVET: (1) Undugu is involved in combating child labour, children rights, etc.; (2) APDA is involved in lobbying the rights of the Afar people, (3) EDU-PRO is involved in lobbying access to primary education and for counselling services in secondary education, (4) Hope enterprises is lobbying for a bigger role for civil society and the informal sector to achieve development in Ethiopia and for setting a climate that attracts investments.

Three organisations (Hope enterprises, ECE and EDU-PRO) received funding for advocacy and lobby and developed a lobby programme with regard to TVET. Only Hope enterprises was successful in this regard: they lobbied on curriculum development and labour insertion with well documented cases and lobby dossiers. Hope enterprises is seen as a valuable interlocutor with relevant expertise. They have already achieved some success as the Ministry of Education had adapted the official technical curricula according to their suggestions and experience. ECE and EDU-PRO (Albania) also have an advocacy and lobby programme and although they access relevant stakeholders at the policy level, they lack a well developed strategy.

### **Role of CFOs to support advocacy and lobby**

*No specific targets were formulated in the policy plans of the CFOs with regard to advocacy and lobby on TVET in the period 2003-2006. No specific support has been given to the partners (except the few examples mentioned), no capacity building activities to this regard have been implemented. To prepare the new subsidy proposals, the CFOs have discussed their policy and strategy on advocacy and lobby with their partners.*

#### **4.2.4. ASSESSMENT OF THE ACHIEVEMENTS**

**Effectiveness**<sup>23</sup> – Of the 13 partners visited, 10 of them organise traditional TVET courses (formal or non formal). Partners organise in class room teaching, centre based, combined with practical workshops and periods of internship. No mayor differences have been identified between the formal and non formal systems with regard to access, relevance and quality of the training. Traditional trades are targeted (computer, car mechanics, electronics, tailoring, cooking, etc.). No innovative approaches have been identified. Two organisations (APDA and Shramdeep) organise community based TVET and Undugu implements an apprenticeship system. The quality and relevance of the two community based TVET programmes is not evident.

The quality of the centre based TVET programmes is of an acceptable level with regard to the average standards in each country. The projects visited belong to the better practices of the country (according to the local consultants) and beyond (according to the experience of the evaluators). One should remark that the quality of TVET still is a challenge in every country. However, all partners visited invest in maintaining and improving the quality of their courses: the quality and motivation of the trainers/teachers; infrastructure and equipment of practical workshops. One of the challenges is the quality of the curricula that is set officially and usually also followed by the non formal TVET providers. Organisations that had been supported by external donors (financially or with technical expertise) delivered higher quality with regard to curricula, syllabi and infrastructure as compared to those who had not received such support. In particular with regard to curriculum development and development of syllabi, external support made the difference.

The TVET projects reach lower skilled people, drop outs from the general education, poor and vulnerable groups. No exclusion mechanisms have been found on poverty. On the contrary, the partners visited reach poor people who would not be able to access private institutions. In the case of the apprenticeship model the

---

<sup>23</sup> Effectiveness: in this chapter the focus is on the performance of the partner organisation, effectiveness will assess on the output level (expected results): organisation of qualitative and relevant TVET courses that lead to well trained people.

partner offers opportunities for poor people who can not access the traditional (endogenous) apprenticeship system because entrance to this system must be paid by the trainee.

To reach poor and unprivileged people, almost all partners collaborate with CBOs and NGOs that work with specific target groups and/or teachers pay house visits to possible beneficiaries. Selection procedures seemed to be transparent. Some hidden exclusion mechanisms might exist, such as exclusion on religion or HIV-status. No specific exclusion mechanisms have been identified with regard to access for rural people but more in depth investigation might prove interesting.

Entrance to TVET programmes required a basic education level. None of the programmes (except APDA and Shramdeep) were targeting illiterate people. For the partners of Woord en Daad, TVET is part of the chain approach, hence the link with basic education is there. For the other partners, this basic education level was a pre condition to enter the course and as such a selection criterion. Two courses (Nairobi and YWCA) required a higher educational level. The TVET providers offered courses of a basic level, often with the possibility to enter a second grade or to continue further education (return to the general system). A minority of the participants re-entered the general system for further education. All partners delivered a diploma or a certificate which enhanced the chances on the labour market.

Drop out rates were higher at the non formal, long term, post secondary TVET as compared to the TVET at secondary level and the short term post secondary TVET. Additional factors that explain a higher drop out were the limited relevance of the training and the required entrance level of education.

To guarantee the relevance of the TVET courses the partner organisations had a lot of contacts with employers and the business sector, though contacts were organised mostly in an informal way (through the network of the teachers). This close relationship with employers made it possible to find internships in business for the beneficiaries and to adapt the curricula to the needs of the businesses. However, formal meetings with business representatives to discuss the appropriateness of curricula rarely took place (except at the JBCs). Partners did not have formal contacts with private sector associations nor collaborated with other stakeholders to execute pro-active market development research. Specific courses were dropped the moment the organisations experienced market saturation. No specific strategies were developed to create job opportunities.

None of the partners was involved in strengthening of teachers associations, parents associations and private sector associations. These objectives were not part of the policies of the Dutch NGOs, or of the policies of

their counterparts. A few partner organisations did develop advocacy and lobby programmes with regard to TVET and all organisations were lobbying the respective government structures to obtain recognition of the TVET courses offered. Only one organisation had developed a successful advocacy and lobby strategy that resulted in making changes at the national policy level with regard to curriculum development (Hope enterprises). The other organisations did not achieve results to this regard as they did not have a well developed advocacy and lobby strategy, based on good cases and well documented dossiers.

**Efficiency** - In the scope of this evaluation it was impossible to gather all data necessary to analyse the cost-effectiveness of the TVET programmes. Not least because budgets were including many times more activities than just the TVET activities. Nor has any information been found in the few existing evaluation reports. It is impossible to compare different approaches and conclusions drawn would not go beyond what is already general accepted.

However, the evaluators have identified several factors that have an influence on the efficiency of the TVET programmes. Most of the organisations took initiatives to increase or guarantee the efficiency of their programmes. We highlight some examples but we can not draw general conclusions as cases were very different:

- Ethiopian AID (and to a certain extent also APDA) mainly outsourced TVET courses to other TVET providers (on a contract base).
- Ten organisations implement several development programmes that strengthen each other (general education, family programmes, livelihood programmes, etc).
- All organisations developed own income generating activities (tuition fees, fee for job mediation services, income from commercial activities) though none of them will become self sustainable based on these incomes generated.
- Five partners did receive financial or support in kind from (local) governments.
- The fact that courses (formal and non formal) were officially recognised opened access to government services, such as teacher training or support with curriculum development.
- Some of the organisations worked with teachers at free lance base which was an efficient use of the resources.
- There were different systems to pay employers who accepted trainees but on average stipends were low (and lower compared to similar programmes in the region).

Some factors hampering efficiency of the TVET programmes were:

- There was little collaboration between several TVET providers (public and private) hence infrastructure was not always used optimally;
- A combination of long term and short term courses within the same infrastructure, with an increase of short term courses, could enhance better use of existing infrastructure;
- The high drop out rate at some projects or the small number of graduates reduces efficiency of the programme. Not much follow up was given to these drop outs.
- Most of the budget was invested in infrastructure and equipment. Not much money was invested in producing good textbooks or in salaries of teachers (salaries were not very high compared to other NGOs or private sector).
- Partners did collaborate with government structures and deconcentrated services of the Ministries of Education, Labour, Agriculture. However, most of these structures are weak and/or in a reform process. Services were not always of a good quality (ex. employment offices, support to curricula development, etc).

The main concern with regard to efficiency of the TVET programmes is related to (1) the large investments in infrastructure and equipment of practical workshops when this infrastructure is under-used and (2) the number of drop outs.

**Relevance**<sup>24</sup> – All courses were highly demanded and full, and respond to an existing need by students that have dropped out from the general system or students with low level of education. In some cases the demand was higher than the capacity of the TVET provider. When the interest of students decreased and/or a certain sector was saturated, partners dropped the specific course. Based on the interviews with students, courses appeared to respond to their needs and interests (except the bamboo courses offered by Shramdeep and the leather courses at APDA) and the level of education of the beneficiaries (except Nairobi and YWCA for some students). All students and ex-students interviewed confirmed the relevance of the courses in perspective of finding a job. All courses combine technical skills with soft skills. Students generally indicated that the combination of soft skills and occupational skills was very relevant to getting a job or becoming self-employed (see further evaluation question 3).

---

<sup>24</sup> In this chapter, relevance will be assessed with regard to the courses: are they matching the demands of the labour market and the needs of the target groups?

Some organisations organised specific activities to inform the future participants on the different curricula that were organised to help them to make an appropriate choice: info-day (ex; EDU-PRO), orientation interview (ex. YWCA, NairoBits), introduction days (ex. Undugu).

It is surprising that the relevance of the two community based projects (Shramdeep and APDA) was assessed as lower than the relevance of the centre based TVET courses. In the case of Shramdeep, the staff proposed to organise bamboo courses within the perspective of market opportunities, though women were not interested in this kind of art and preferred cutting and tailoring. In the case of APDA, the self help groups and income generating groups chose a particular trade assuming a market niche that turned out not to exist (leather and textiles or tie and dye). This teaches us that responding to the needs or interest of target groups needs to be linked to market opportunities. More interaction with these community groups seems to be needed to decide on the most appropriate training (ex. joint market analysis, longer preparation process with these groups).

All TVET courses (except NairoBits, some courses at ECE) were focussing on basic –low level- technical or vocational skills, including attention to soft skills and personal development. This level corresponds to the educational level of the beneficiaries. Only a few students continued further education. In long term-post secondary and non formal courses, students dropped out rather often because the course lasted too long and they started to look for a job with the minimum basic skills already acquired. Relevance of long term, non formal, post secondary TVET can be questioned and needs to be well considered in perspective of the needs and demands of the target groups.

Most of the courses were relevant with regard to job opportunities in the labour market. All organisations had good contacts with the labour market, though contacts were organised mostly in an informal way (through the network of the teachers). During visits of teachers at employers, comments could be given with regard to the curricula and the quality of the trainees. It depended on the responsiveness of the TVET provider to what extent comments were taken into account. More research to this regard could prove interesting.

Only the JBC at AMG-international met a group of 30 to 40 employers regularly (every 3 months) in a formal way. The JBCs at Woord en Daad and at Hope enterprises also had contact with employers but not in a formal way and usually during visits of staff to the workplace for supervising trainees (similar informal approach as seen at the other centre based programmes).

TVET providers dropped specific curricula when students did not find a job any more in that particular sector. Partners did not react in time to avoid market saturation. Market needs assessments were not conducted in a systematic way nor were the existing monitoring data (student's tracer system, contacts with employers, market research) of such a nature as to make the organisations react early to market evolutions. Not many organisations developed new market niches and not many partner organisations were active enough in promoting enough girls participation in relatively new economic activities where gender prejudices are less strong, such as computer and mobile repairs or ICT in general.

One could argue that the private sector would be willing to invest in training of future employees with regard to booming sectors. However, evidence has shown that the quality of private (and for profit) TVET providers is often very low. The significant difference is that young, poor and unprivileged people would hardly have the chance to participate in such trainings.

ICT courses, including webdesign, were always very relevant and participants developed skills that are highly appreciated in the market. The challenge for TVET providers with regard to ICT will be to keep on being up to date and to be aware of the link between ICT and the automatisisation of the industry.

All interventions were in line with national policies and the TVET reform processes when existing. The TVET initiatives implemented by the partner organisations filled a gap in TVET provision as implemented by the state. Governments do not provide sufficient public TVET provision, nor do they reach poor and unprivileged people. In particular with regard to short term (and long term) non formal courses, the NGOs play an important role. They all had elaborated strategies to reach the poorest of the poor (few exceptions).

**Sustainability<sup>25</sup>** – the sustainability of the programmes and institutional sustainability of all partner organisations is weak. Most of them depend very much on one donor, the Dutch CFO. All partners have their own income generating activities (fees of courses, services provided, commercial activities) but none of them will become self sustainable based on these incomes. The self-financing of these training activities is limited by the fact that they all address the needs of a specific poor target group of youngsters or young adults living in slums, street, remote villages or coming from families affected/infected by HIV/AIDS (target group with limited resources).

Programmes, particularly those that do not require large investments in infrastructure and equipment, can be easily continued with a lower budget (but in an adapted form). Example, the methodology of Undugu is

relatively cheap and can easily be continued with a relatively low budget. Other courses that require continuously specific products or tools (usually centre based training) are at risk when funding stops (ex; sewing machines; products needed to teach car mechanics).

All organisations have good chances to diversify their donors. Organisational and financial management systems are put in place and investments in infrastructure have been done. In some countries the government is starting to invest more and more in TVET and some of the partners already receive the support of the local or national government. However, more advocacy and lobby is needed to hold the government accountable to organise sufficient and relevant TVET.

---

<sup>25</sup> In this chapter the focus is on the institutional sustainability (and technological). The next chapter analyses social sustainability.

### 4.3. Evaluation question 3

To what extent did the TVET activities contribute to an improved livelihood situation of the graduates?

This evaluation question concerns the outcome and mid term impact of TVET activities and focuses above all on the beneficiaries. Two judgement criteria had been formulated:

- participants acquired a sustainable level and shape/scope of skills that enabled them to generate an income (outcome)
- Improved livelihoods (impact)

First a description of the state of affairs with regard to these judgement criteria will be given, followed by an assessment of the impact, relevance and sustainability of the results.

#### 4.3.1. OUTCOME – PARTICIPANTS ACQUIRED A SUSTAINABLE LEVEL AND SCOPE OF SKILLS THAT ENABLED THEM TO GENERATE AN INCOME

The main objective of TVET is to provide students with adequate skills in order to find a job and earn an income. The following table presents an overview of the number of students who graduated at the different vocational schools and training centres and the number of ex-students that have found a job. The table is elaborated based on the data gathered during evaluation missions.

Table 22: Overview of the number of graduated students and the number of students that found a job, with regard to the TVET projects funded by the partner organisations in the period 2003-2006

	2003 or 2003-2004			2004 2004-2005			2005 2005-2006			2006 2006-2007		
	Grad.	job	%	Grad.	job	%	Grad.	job	%	grad	job	%
YWCA	125	19	15	89	29	33	161	47	29	305	125	41
ECE	Graduated: 465 – Jobs: from the 155 unemployed 55 found a job = 35% (period 2004-207)											
EDUPRO	189	54	29	162	166	>100	135	45	33	98	n.a.	n.a.
USK	152	n.a.	n.a.	148	n.a.	n.a.	168	n.a.	n.a.	417	n.a.	n.a.
NAIR.	32	32	100	32	32	100	32	32	100	32	32	100
DEEP.	Graduated: 675 – Jobs: 607 = 90% (period 2003-2006)											
ADF	n.r.	n.r.	n.r.	n.r.	n.r.	n.r.	n.r.	n.r.	n.r.	100	90	90
SHRAM <sup>26</sup>	n.r.	n.r.	n.r.	n.r.	n.r.	n.r.	n.r.	n.r.	n.r.	40	36	90
AMG+JBC	n.r.	n.r.	n.r.	325	292	90	325	292	90	325	292	90
WDI	260	234	90	260	234	90	260	234	90	290	261	90
HOPE	111	101	91	80	69	86	146	105	72	73	51	70
ET.AID	40	n.a.	n.a.	35	n.a.	n.a.	27	n.a.	n.a.	40	n.a.	n.a.
APDA	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.	n.a.

<sup>26</sup> Shramdeep= only numbers for the cutting and tailoring course

*Remarks: n.a.= not available; n.r. = not relevant as project had not started yet ; Hope enterprises: numbers only include the activities in Addis Abeba; USK=Undugu Society of Kenya*

Partner organisations did not have good monitoring and student's tracer systems. Only the partners of Woord en Daad had developed a systematic student's tracer system, with support from Woord en Daad and could offer quantitative data (but not for all courses). Data were more easily available on enrolment and completion rates compared to employment rate. Information on the ex-students is usually gathered via the teachers (also partners of Woord en Daad). Undugu, Ethiopian AID and APDA could not offer data on the employment rate of their graduates. However, Undugu stays in contact with most of its students –through their trainers- and could confirm that employment rate is very high. This has been confirmed by a student's tracer study done in 2003 that analysed the enrolment-drop out and employment rates for the period 1997-2003. Most of these students become employed in the informal sector.

**Employment rate** - Employment rates are high for Undugu and Nairobi (Kenya), Hope enterprises in Ethiopia and for all Indian partners (8 of the 13 partners). Once graduated, students were likely to become employed. There was no distinction with regard to employment rate between the different sectors. As already mentioned, partner organisations are very much aware of the market opportunities and once they noticed a certain market saturation, the partners dropped the specific curricula (ex. Hope enterprises that changed the secretarial course for a computer course; EDU-PRO that closed down the formal course on car-mechanics). Besides the relevance of the course with regard to market opportunities, high employment rates can also be explained by the specific approaches used by the partners:

- The apprenticeship system, as implemented by Undugu, and the long term internships, as facilitated by the JBC, bring students in direct contact with possible employers
- The job mediation via Job and Business Centres (and also via the employment centre of YWCA)
- The economical situation of a region/country: employment rates are higher in India as compared to the employment rates in the other countries visited. These results have been attributed, by all stakeholders interviewed, to the booming economic situation in the region.

*Box 5 internships and apprenticeship systems as implemented by AMG International and Undugu Society of Kenya*

**AMG international India**

*AMG collaborates with its JBC to find internship for their students. Typically an employer (always an ex-student) would train six to eight JBC enrolled students. As a rule these students would be offered employment in the end or moved on to other companies in the environment. The basic strength of this approach is that ex/students serve as employers and that they can offer students enrolled in the JBC a true learning environment, much like simulation workshops so often used in Europe for TVET students to gain work experience. Only the workshops as run by AMG are much closer to the world of work. This is decidedly different from 'normal' internships as the employers are much less familiar with the background of the students and are thus less likely to offer a learning environment specifically suited to them.*

**Undugu Society of Kenya**

*The UNDUGU Informal Sector Training Program facilitates access to employment in the informal sector through an on-the-job training scheme. During an initial 3-day workshop, trainees are informed of the characteristics and advantages/disadvantages of each trade/training and invited to select the trade that is most suitable for them. The trainees then choose their future trainer. This reduces the risk of a mismatch between the trainee and his/her trainer and strengthens the self-confidence of the youngsters. UNDUGU checks the competence of the trainer and organises regular follow-up visits to the enterprise where the youngster is trained. This practical training is combined with a half-day in classroom theoretical training. At the end of the training, the trainees are encouraged to pass the official grade test.*

When employment rates are lower this is due to either the difficult economic situation in a region (cases Albania, Afar region in Ethiopia) or the lack of an appropriate strategy to guide students to self employment or employment in the informal sector (APDA and Ethiopian Aid). The local consultant of Albania considered an employment rate of 30% in an economically difficult region as acceptable.

Most of the stakeholders interviewed confirm that the unemployment rate is higher with those students graduating from general education as compared to those graduated from TVET (but no scientific data are available). Interviewed ex-students confirmed that they were better off than friends who had not followed a technical or vocational training. Apparently most of the students who graduated found a job in the sector they were trained for as they were often recruited after their internship.

When courses concerned technical subjects/trades (ex; car mechanics, electronics, computer), students tended to be employed in wage employment. When it concerned beauty, hairdressing, cutting and tailoring students were mostly self employed. This divide runs largely parallel to the gender of the participants. Women predominantly followed tailoring related courses and earned their living from their homes. Men predominantly followed the technical courses and found employment within companies (formal or informal sector). However,

the evaluators did see some exceptions: ex; women who followed computer courses and eventually became employed by companies.

**Job mediation** - All partner organisations have taken initiatives to pro-actively guide their graduates towards employment. All partner organisations are convinced that only education and training would not be enough to find a job. The following table gives a brief overview of the approaches of the partners visited to increase employment rate of their graduates. Details can be found in the field reports.

*Table 23: Brief overview of post-training guidance as implemented by the partners visited*

<b>Partner organisation</b>	<b>Extra support after TVET (job mediation, facilitating access to micro-credits, etc.</b>
YWCA	Job mediation through employment centre
ECE	Not relevant
EDU PRO	Job mediation through informal contacts of teachers. Many students are employed by the company where they did their internship.
UNDUGU	No procedure, no formal job mediation The trainers often assist the trainees to find jobs in the informal sector
NAIROBITS	No systematic job mediation Many trainees are employed by the company where they did their internship.
Deepalaya	Job mediation through informal contacts of teachers
Asha Deep Foundation	Job mediation through informal contacts of teachers
Shramdeep	Focus on self employment
AMG international	Job mediation through JBC: looking for internships (stipend given to students; for villagers, equipment is provided but has to be paid back for half the price) and contacts with employers.
Woord en Daad India	Job mediation through informal contacts by one staff member. JBC is not fully operational yet.
Hope enterprises	Job mediation, access to micro credits, self employment programs (orientation courses in regular curricula, support, micro credit mediation, networking with ex-students...) In company practice mediation & support
Ethiopian aid	Facilitating access to micro credits, collaboration with micro finance institutes
APDA	Facilitating access to micro credits, support to self help groups and income generating activities as part of the integrated rural development programme

YWCA (partner ICCO), Woord en Daad, AMG and Hope enterprises (all partners of Woord en Daad) have institutionalised their activities with regard to job mediation (see boxes).

#### *Box 5 Employment centre YWCA*

*Within the offices of YWCA, an employment office is installed, equipped with one social worker. This social worker makes up the profile of the different graduates of the babysitting and janitor courses. Interested employers can consult these profiles and select possible candidates for an interview. YWCA intervenes in this solicitation process. They organize the interview with the employer and the candidates at the employment office. After being selected, the employee starts a probation period of one month. During this month the social worker visits the workplace and responds to questions of employee and employer. They intervene in cases of conflict. After one month of probation, a contract is signed in the employment office. Salaries are proposed by the employment centre and accepted by both employers and employees. Employer*

*and employee pay a small contribution for this service (95 EUR by employer and 35 EUR by employee). Employers and employees still can consult the social worker afterwards.*

The three partners of Woord en Daad have developed Job and Business centres. JBC are attached to partner organisations that already run a vocational training centre. The staff of JBCs and the staff of VTCs work closely together. JBCs have three functions: (1) job mediation (looking for internships and job opportunities) and coaching of trainees during internship; (2) support to business development (training in business skills and personal development training-within the curricula or apart from the curricula- facilitation of access to micro finances to start an own business); (3) Increasing quality of TVET (VTC networking; set up of student's tracer systems). Staff of JBCs can give courses in the curricula of the VTC (ex. on business skills or personal development) or organise short term VET courses when needed. These JBCs are building up a database of companies and actively look for jobs for students who have been registered in the JBC. These JBCs also arranged internships at a selected number of companies and did follow up the students during and after internship. Many students became employed afterwards in these companies. The JBCs assisted students in the solicitation process. Employees paid a subscription fee at the JBC. Services are in the first place offered to students of the VTC centres supported by Woord en Daad.

#### *Box 6 Job and Business Centres*

*All JBCs are integrated in the VTC and have an own office in the VTC.*

##### ***AMG India***

*Through the JBC students are placed in a work/ learning environments in companies for several months and in this way ensure that what is learned does fit the requirements of the companies. During the site-visit at AMG, the team visited a number of sites in the nearby village where workshops were located. It concerned workshops selling and/or repairing refrigerators. Typically an employer (an ex-student) would train six to eight JBC enrolled students. As a rule these students would be offered employment in the end or moved on to other companies in the environment. AMG also provides training in soft skills and business skills as part of the JBC programme and follow-up activities are undertaken, basically consisting of AMG staff visiting the workshops at a regular basis.*

##### ***WDI India***

*The Job and Business Centre is currently run by one staff member who establishes contacts with the companies and takes spoken English lessons three times a week to improve the language skills of the students. Attempts are also being made to up-date the records of former students and initiate follow-up activities. However, the acclaimed trainings in soft skills, personality development, and in personal and business skills, and the provision of support to tailoring graduates to start own business etc. are some of the activities that have not yet been initiated. Nor are preparatory actions evident to initiate the same. There was also no evidence of any systematic counselling activity conducted during the past/ current year which could prove beneficial to the background of the students some of whom could be encouraged to improve their educational qualifications.*

### **Hope enterprises Ethiopia**

*Hope enterprises established its JBC in 2000 to facilitate and assist graduates in finding employment. The saturation of the job market and the tough competition for graduates to find jobs drove Hope enterprises to take this initiative. The staff member at the JBC tries to identify companies, establishes communication with the respective Human Resource person and keeps records of the contact details. In addition to this, the JBC consults with a number of Micro Finance Institutions (MFIs) to arrange loans for those graduates who are seeking self-employment and want to set up their own business. Apart from the JBC, Hope enterprises established a Career Planning and Placement office. While the JBC is primarily occupied with the identification, lobbying and communication with companies, this office tries to ensure an effective placement of individual graduates. Both services work together, for ex. to advise and assist potential business starters by reviewing their proposals and assessing the marketability and feasibility of their plans). Despite good practices, opinions about the performance of the JBC are mixed. Clearly, graduates would want the JBC to be more proactive.*

This pro-active attitude resulted in good outcome (employment rate). The advantage of this approach is the fact that these JBCs manage to have formalised agreement in terms of (1) evaluation of students, (2) organisation of apprenticeships, availability of apprenticeships, and wages/ stipends earned during internship.

The other partner organisations are involved in job mediation in a more informal way. They all have contacts with businesses (through the network of teachers) and arrange internship for their students. Many times, employment is offered in the end or students moved on to other companies in the environment. They also achieve good employment rate. Ex-students who have started an own business often keep contact with their vocational school or training centre. The difference between both approaches is first and foremost the degree of formalising contacts with employers and the business sector. A student knows he/she can count on an apprenticeship, counselling and/or a job. This security is not there for students participating in the courses organised by partners who had not installed a formal employment centre or JBC.

None of the partners mentioned difficulties in finding enough opportunities for internships. However, in some countries this might be a problem. Internships are usually found in small businesses and in the informal sector. The director of Hope enterprises in Ethiopia is currently lobbying the business sector to increase internship opportunities also within the formal sector and larger businesses.

**Beyond technical skills** – Half of the partner organisations did include soft skills training in their courses, although not always integrated in the curriculum, such as communication skills, solicitation skills, problem solving skills, negotiating with banks, information on and claiming your rights, etc. Stakeholders interviewed confirmed the importance of these kinds of courses with regard to their own personal development and job finding.

We did not see many partners including training with regard to entrepreneurship (except the JBCs at AMG India and Hope enterprises). Some trades lead more to self-employed jobs than other trades (ex. cutting and tailoring). This requires an adaptation of the curricula: more attention to bookkeeping, business plan development, legislation, etc. but none of the organisations had included these topics in their programmes (except AMG and Hope enterprises). Information on micro-credits and facilitation of access to micro finance institutes was only done by Hope enterprises, APDA and Ethiopian Aid.

None of the organisations visited experimented with projects such as running a micro-enterprise at school (practice at school).

**Job duration** – all students and all employers interviewed confirmed that skills acquired were adapted to and relevant for the needs of the businesses. According to the employers interviewed, the quality of skills acquired was generally good and sufficient. Though most of the skills and capacities needed to be trained further and enhanced on the job (which can be seen as normal – and not a problem for the employers). The employers interviewed were satisfied with the students recruited and job duration was mostly guaranteed. Finding a job depends very much on the personality, dynamics and psyche of the graduate student. Little attention was given to people who had dropped out from the TVET or who were not dynamic enough to find a job. Little support was given to graduates who lack basic social skills and who were more likely to lose the job. (also not by the JBCs). It is not clear to what extent 'weaker' graduated students would find a job and maintain a job.

Little attention was given to following up the students once they had found a job, such as further training, refresher courses, psychological support, facilitating access to micro-credit (needed at the moment ), etc. Hope enterprises in Ethiopia is the only organisation visited that offers long term support to their students (through the JBC). They organised extra training for ex-students for up-grading their knowledge and to strengthen them for confronting technical difficulties experienced in their daily jobs.

In order to keep a job, it is also important to be aware of new technologies. Some of the partners are involved in further training, offering short term courses for people that have find a job (ECE, EDU-PRO, Ethiopian AID, some of the JBCs, Hope enterprises).

**Self-employment** – Not much attention is given, by the centre based TVET providers, to the development of entrepreneurship and the starting up of and development of an own enterprise (also not or on a limited scale by the JBCs). Only the programmes of Shramdeep (India) and APDA (Ethiopia), the two community based projects, are supporting beneficiaries in particular to become self employed (working with self help groups or

income generating groups). Apparently, not many students start with an own business immediately after graduating, but first need to acquire some years of practical experience. Discussions with ex-trainees revealed that it is very difficult for them to access credit to start their activities. This corresponds with a general reluctance of the microfinance industry to give loans to youngster without business expertise (no clients, no networks, no experience) since this is considered to be a higher risk than providing credit to people in business<sup>27</sup>. Different models will have to be developed such as seed money or leasing of equipment, to assist the target group of these ex-trainees. Two organisations did offer the tools that were needed (ex. sewing machines): Undugu gave these tools for free (when they had a donor funding this part of the programme), AMG gave tools that needed to be paid back for half the price.

*Box: 7 Life story of Ranjana, participant in the sewing course organised by Woord en Daad in Hyderabad, India*

*This life story is of a woman, Ranjana, who moved with her parents and three younger brothers to Hyderabad from a village 100 km away.. The move from rural to urban areas is typical for India and many thousands of Indians, who are unable to make ends meet from their agricultural activities anymore, try their luck in the city. Ranjana had graduated in her village.*

*Ranjana's father took ill shortly after their arrival, while her mother was regularly incapacitated by a drinking problem. This meant that she –as the only person able to generate an income- tried to attract work for herself to support the family. She got a job as a factory worker but this was on an ad hoc basis. She regularly found herself without a job. As a result, with no regular salary and no stable work the family had a very weak financial position.*

*A social worker from the centre came into contact with Ranjana when she was looking for a job there. The staff subsequently motivated her to join the sewing centre. It appeared that Ranjana had some knowledge of sewing and that she also might be able to teach other students who came to the centre. Ranjana was able to refine her stitching and sewing skills and started to earn her living as a teacher .*

*Subsequently, with the assistance of the centre –she was provided with ten sewing machines – she was able to open up a business of her own. She has become a successful entrepreneur employing around 20 employees and earning a profit of around 8000 RPS (88 EUR) per month.*

---

<sup>27</sup> resource: Mc Nulty, M & Nagarajan, G. (September 2005) Serving youth with microfinance: perspectives of microfinance institutions and youth serving organisations. Micro report n°30, USAID

#### 4.3.2. IMPACT – IMPROVED LIVELIHOODS

**Income generated** – on average ex-graduates earn an income that is acceptable (see table 24). As many of the students are very young and do not have a family yet, the income they earned was perceived as reasonable. Income varied according to the different professions and sometimes also according to the gender of the employee (women in India testified they were earning less than their male colleagues) or the social background (case Kenya). Many of them could pay back school fees or grants received (if asked for) after a reasonable period. Most of the beneficiaries contributed to the household budget, which had a positive impact on the family situation. In particular income generated by beneficiaries who were the eldest in the family and who had to take care of brothers and sisters, made the difference. This proves that the impact of TVET programmes goes beyond the individual. The income generated is mostly not sufficient to sustain an own family. Many of the beneficiaries expect their income to increase, after they have acquired some years of experience. They intend to enrol in better paid jobs or –in case of self-employment- to have perspectives for a growing business. At the beginning of their career, self employed people appear to earn less than colleagues in wage employment. Beneficiaries that are self employed indicated that they will only earn more income if they can access micro-credits to develop their business further (based on discussions with ex-trainees of the Undugu Society of Kenya). Though most of the partners visited do not follow up their ex-students for more than 2 years and do not foresee any guidance or support at the moment ex-students need to expand their activities.

*Table 24: Overview of the average income earned by ex students in the four countries visited*

<b>Partner organisation</b>	<b>Average income</b>
Albania (YWCA, ECE, EDU PRO)	Ex students earned 150 to 200 euro per month, depending on the specific sector. One needs an average of 250 euro/month to sustain a small family.
Kenya (Nairobi and Undugu)	Wages of young employees, trained by Nairobi, are around 165 EUR/month but seem to increase rapidly when employers have the opportunity to appreciate the quality of their work. This compares very favourably with jobs in other sectors. Chances for promotion in these companies are also good. However the alumni mentioned that they faced discrimination based on their origin, in particular with regard to salaries. These were often lower than those paid for similar jobs to people with a better social background. The income of the trainees of Undugu varies from 77 EUR/month when employed in the informal sector to 165 EUR/month when employed in the formal sector. Many (employed in informal sector) emphasized that the only way to make a sustainable income in the medium term is to start their own business.
India (Deepalaya, ADF, Shramdeep, AMG and WDI)	The general income in areas where the pupils come from varies around 20 RPS a day (around 50 eurocents), so around 600 RPS a month (€15) <sup>28</sup> . The income of ex-students who are employed or self-employed as reported to the team varies from 3000 RPS to 8000 RPS a month (€75 to €200), which is a considerable increase. Ex-students also

<sup>28</sup> This finding was presented to us by the JBC officer at Woord en Daad India referring to a national newspaper article. The article used the Indian statistical bureau as its source. Students confirmed this finding.

	believe they would certainly be able to sustain this level of incoming, if not significantly increase it in the near future. Self-employed people generally reported an income of 3000 to 4000 RPS, employed ex-students around 5000 to 7000 RPS and entrepreneurs 7000 to 8000 RPS.
Ethiopia (Ethiopian AID, Hope enterprise and APDA)	The interviewed employees stated that they earn a reliable income that satisfies their basic needs. However they are reluctant to indicate exact figure of their earnings.

*Box 8 Short life story of Beta, participant in babysitting course organised by YWCA*

*Beta participated at the baby-sitting course, organised by YWCA in 2005 and has now already worked for 2 years full-time as a baby sitter in a family, taking care of Emma. Beta is 40 years old, is married and has a son of 17 years old. Beta has a secondary education diploma (poly-techniques) and worked as a public officer during communist times. In the economic transition period she lost her job and became unemployed. This was a very difficult situation. There were not many job opportunities, particularly for older women. Beta considered herself too old to go to university although she realised that with a university degree she would have better chances on the labour market. However, university courses would last too long and the family urgently needed an additional income. She was considering looking for a job in a kindergarten as she loved working with children. Via friends she got in contact with YWCA and took notice of the baby-sitting course. She liked the baby sitting course. It was a short and qualitative course leading to a certificate. She liked the warm and relaxed atmosphere at YWCA. Unfortunately, she has no time to join the other activities organised by YWCA but she participates in the parties at YWCA. She knows that other participants meet each other often.*

*She earns 160 EUR, which is comparable to other jobs but not enough for living. Her husband is a taxi driver and together they just manage to survive and take care of their son. If her son starts an own business she would like to do the administration for him. Meanwhile, she likes the babysitting and will stay in the family with whom she has good contact. Emma will soon start kindergarten, but Beta will stay in the family to take care of Emma after school.*

**Improved integration in the community/society** – education and training do not contribute only to improved knowledge and skills (human capital) but also to social capital. Social capital refers to the advantages of belonging to a social network; to the capacities, attitudes and values needed to function in a society and to take up responsibilities, to show respect, etc... Often poor and disadvantaged people do not have a large network and they often have low self esteem and lack self confidence. To improve integration in the community or society two basic conditions need to be fulfilled: (1) acquisition of basic social skills and values and (2) the enlargement of the social network.

- Acquisition of basic social skills and values:

Most of the organisations do pay attention to values, norms, attitude and social skills (including sexual education and HIV and AIDS education) which are assessed by the beneficiaries as being crucial for finding a job. Many of the beneficiaries also confirmed that finding a job was not the only objective of participating in

TVET courses. They highlighted the importance of their participation at TVET with regard to their personal development. For most beneficiaries participation in TVET courses resulted in an improved self esteem and improved self confidence (as confirmed in all interviews).

Non formal TVET providers integrated group work, therapeutic approaches and/or established intensive contacts with their students, resulting in improved self esteem and confidence of their beneficiaries.

- Enlargement of the social network:

All of the partners (except APDA and Shramdeep) bring their students in contact with employers: they arrange internships, invite employers to the schools, organise fairs with employers and mediate to find jobs. Students also enlarged their social network through their contacts with other beneficiaries (sometimes resulting in self help groups). 9 of the 13 partners visited were not only offering TVET but had implemented various development programmes, often in a holistic or integral approach. This holistic approach had a positive influence on the enlargement of the social network of beneficiaries as they could be put in contact with other NGOs or service providers (health programme, economic programmes, community development programmes, women empowerment programmes etc).

Based on the practice of the partners visited we might assume that they equip their beneficiaries with sufficient skills to enhance integration and participation in society (mainly through finding a job). In some of the projects visited we explicitly saw an improved integration of beneficiaries in the community:

- YWCA: (re)integration of (older) women in society: jobs for women who returned from migration or unemployed women who have been taking care of the children, women became member of YWCA also benefiting from the other programmes of YWCA; reintegration of ex-trafficked girls in society (find a job, family reconciliation).
- Nairobi: students of Nairobi were involved in giving training in basic ICT to young people in their communities or assisting NGOs with using ICT in their daily work. Many of the young employees now consider themselves as role models, indicating that with hard work and courage it is possible to change your personal situation.
- Shramdeep: has identified very backward and remote areas and tribal populations. The targeted Korku tribe included young girls/women with little exposure outside their homes who are given few opportunities for schooling. Students and ex-students indicated they had more contact with the outside world as a result of them selling their products on city markets and bringing in 'modern' equipment such as transistor radios to keep them informed about what is happening in the outside world.

*Box 9 Life story of Anyango, participant of NairoBits*

*Anyango lives in one of the more disadvantaged poor neighbourhoods of Nairobi. She was already active in the local community when she heard about Nairobits through the community based organisation. During the 6 months webdesigner training, she acquired some practical experience in webdesign. She was fascinated by the computer sciences and the combination of art and ICT. She did a scholarship with Mamamikes, a young enterprise which had just launched an e-commerce. The main clientele are the Kenyan diaspora wanting to support their families back home through paying school fees, sending presents, or supporting charity initiatives, etc.*

*After her 6 months as a trainee, she now has an employment contract with Mamamikes and is part of the team that designs the webpages and manages the payment systems of international orders. She still lives with her parents. Part of her income is used to upgrade the house and to finance the school fees of her younger brothers and sisters. She is still active within the CBO and provides computer training in her community.*

The evaluators see also some missed opportunities. Although many TVET providers did implement other development programmes, not many TVET programmes were very much embedded in the communities. The TVET providers did not encourage participation of students at community activities such as housing programmes, water projects, food projects (exception: Hope enterprises - students of the cooking courses, prepared food for poor people in the community around the VET centre). Nor were communities or community based organisations involved in the vocational training centres or activities (except Hope enterprises offering medical check up for community members at the school).

Many of the partners have built their centres or used existing centres nearby or within urban slums or rural and remote areas. Partner organisations collaborated with NGOs and CBOs within the communities in particular for identification and selection of beneficiaries. Five organisations were implementing their programmes within the communities and in close collaboration with these communities:

- Undugu that is working with street children and disadvantaged children within the urban slums putting them in an apprenticeship system, hence offering training on the job
- Shramdeep that was renting a place within the villages they were working with, offering courses to the women of the villages.
- YWCA organised their courses (babysitting or janitor) at their own offices but also within the centres of collaborating NGO's (working with specific target groups).
- Nairobits that was collaborating with CBOs for the selection of the students. The courses were given in the centre of Nairobits, sometimes at quite a distance of the houses of the beneficiaries. However, CBOs were asked to cover transport costs. Students were only accepted at the training if they would become involved in the work of the CBO.

- APDA: TVET was part of the integrated rural development programmes, in particular strengthening the capacities of members of self help groups or strengthening income generating activities. The target group are pastoralist and nomads. Teachers are selected from within the community and move together with the target groups or specific TVET courses are subcontracted to the nearest TVET service provider.

In these programmes, cooperation with NGOs and CBOs is not only focussed on the recruitment of participants but also on the support of the ex-participants towards a better integration in and participation at the communities.

The TVET programmes with hostel facilities sometimes had a negative impact on communities as students preferred to integrate in the communities they had been reallocated to instead of returning to their original homes. Return on the communities of these TVET providers is rather low (based on information delivered by Development focus and on the experiences of the local consultant).

**Gender** – participation at TVET by women contributes to an increased self esteem and self confidence of the participants (as confirmed by the interviewees). In particular women get the opportunity to enlarge their social network and benefit from their participation at TVET. Staff of several organisations (YWCA, Shramdeep, Woord en Daad India, AMG international, NairoBits) confirmed that the fact that women were able to participate at TVET and eventually gain an income was likely to have an impact on their social status and life style, benefiting the whole family. However, no impact studies have been conducted analysing the impact of participation at TVET on gender roles within the family and community.

**Economic development** – The evaluators can not give much information on the impact of TVET with regard to the economic development of the community/region due to time and the approach of this evaluation. The evaluators could gather some indications of economic benefits of the TVET programmes. Income generated at first place contributed to the *household budget* in order to survive and sustain a family. Income generated did somehow increase “*spending power*”. A *minority of ex-students had created small businesses* (information is not available from students that left the VTCs more than 2 years ago). Although the economic impact of these businesses still is very much on the individual level –at this stage (they often do not employ people yet) - there is a huge social impact. These businesses upgrade certain areas making them attractive for people to stay and less attractive for criminality (ex. seen at the slums of Nairobi).

The evaluators see a missed opportunity with regard to market development. The partner organisations did not manage to create new market niches (launching a new job, with a group of people) nor did they develop

strategies to look for business opportunities. None of the partner organisations had a pro-active role on the development of certain businesses. For example, active market prospecting might have shown that the market for mobile repairs is booming with mobile companies prepared to invest in the training of their future employees or business partners.

#### 4.3.3. ASSESSMENT OF THE ACHIEVEMENTS

**Effectiveness at outcome level<sup>29</sup>** – The vast majority of students that had participated in TVET acquired skills that enabled the students to adequately respond to the demands of the labour market. 70% to 90% of the students did find a job or became self-employed (30% in Albania-economy in transition). Once graduated students were likely to become employed. There was no distinction with regard to employment rate between the different courses. For the technical courses in most cases this concerned wage employment. For the beauty, hair dressing and tailoring courses this concerned in most cases self employment, mainly women. The partner organisations did not manage to create new market niches nor did they develop strategies to look for business opportunities, in particular new economic activities where gender prejudices are less strong and where wages would be higher.

An important factor influencing employment rate appears to be the investment by the partner in job mediation and facilitating internships. All partners (except the two community based projects) foresee a short or longer period for internship in businesses and usually trainees find employment in these businesses or approximate businesses. For most of the students guidance was available after training in finding a job. The partners of Woord en Daad had institutionalised Job and Business Centres in place to achieve these results. The other partners had more informal provisions at place. The link between the investment in job mediation and employment rate has been proven (differences in (estimated) employment rate between Hope enterprises (JBC) and Ethiopian AID in Ethiopia and between the courses offered by YWCA in Tirana (with support of employment service) and in the other towns (no support of employment centre)). We can not conclude, based on the results of this evaluation, that one approach is more suitable than the other. JBCs seem to have good results but so do the other partners. Many contacts with employers depend on the engagement and social network of the teachers, also with the partners of Woord en Daad. The approach of JBC is not appropriate for smaller projects targeting smaller groups of beneficiaries, or for community based approaches. However, the evaluation team is convinced that the employment centre of YWCA and JBCs have more possibilities that have not been exploited yet; such as investing more in business skills development and entrepreneurship;

---

<sup>29</sup> In this chapter effectiveness will be analysed at outcome level, focussing the results at the level of the beneficiaries.

negotiating contracts with certain sectors (at sector level) or with local governments; become more involved in networking and quality improvement of the VTCs (now a function that is still under developed in practice).

At this moment the link with business is quite strong (formal and informal) but links with public sector and non-profit sector are weak, although these sectors also offer a range of job opportunities. Investment in public-private partnerships could create more job opportunities.

Only the two community based projects (Shramdeep and APDA) were explicitly preparing their target groups to become self employed, with mixed results. The other –centre based- partners did not pay much attention to the development of entrepreneurship and the starting up and development of an own business. Not many students had started an own business immediately after being graduated. It appeared to be very difficult to start an own business and to access credit as the microfinance industry is in general reluctant to give loans to youngsters without business expertise. Not many organisations were supporting these people with other instruments, such as seed money or leasing equipment.

**Mid-term impact:** the socio-economic situation of the participants has improved much. Participants gained some social skills and enlarged their social networks, crucial for finding and maintaining a job. These results are even strengthened more when TVET providers were also implementing other programmes targeting the same groups of beneficiaries (ex. YWCA- women empowerment programmes, APDA- rural development programmes, Hope enterprises- health care programmes, Undugu-family programme, etc.).

Income generated by employment was reasonable with perspectives of a substantial increase the coming years (when employers had been able to appreciate the quality of the work; when students could eventually start an own business or enlarge their business). Income gained through self-employment was on average lower-at this stage- as compared to income generated through wage employment. Unfortunately, this runs parallel with the gender divide as mostly women became self-employed. A well developed strategy to support sustainable self-employment was missing in the sample of partners visited.

Most of the beneficiaries contributed to the household budget what had a positive impact on the family situation. The income generated is mostly not sufficient to sustain an own family. Many beneficiaries expect their income will increase. They intend to enrol in better paid jobs – after having years of experience- or to develop further their own business-in case of self employed- once they would be able to access micro-credits. However, the partner organisations visited do not foresee continuous or long term follow up of ex-students in case they might need retraining or more support and guidance to expand their activities.

At four organisations (YWCA, NairoBits, Shramdeep, Undugu) evidence has found of an improved integration of beneficiaries in their community and at five organisations (YWCA, Hope enterprises, Shramdeep, APDA, NairoBits) we have seen a close link between the TVET activities and community development programmes. This was mainly due to an intensive and close collaboration (partnership) with CBO's and NGO's within these communities and as such also possible for centre based organisations. However, only a few (3) centre based organisations did collaborate more intensive with local CBO's and NGO's (collaboration that goes beyond the selection of beneficiaries).

The evaluators have not much information on the impact on local economic development of the region/communities. Based on the data gathered, the evaluators assume this impact to be low. Income generated mostly contributed to the household budget (surviving) and was not enough to sustain an own family. Not many investments have been done by the ex-graduates. A minority of the ex-graduates became self-employed, but the economic impact is very much on the individual level.

**Relevance** – The acquired skills did match the demands of the labour market. Employers were satisfied with the level of education and the quality of the skills acquired. Interviewed students confirmed that they were better of than friends that had not followed TVET. These friends remained unemployed or in lower paid jobs. Training, job mediation and eventually earning an income is extremely relevant for the target groups of these partner organisations. Almost all partner organisations were targeting poor people. Some of them used transparent selection criteria and collaborated with local NGOs and CBOs to really reach the poorest of the poor. Unemployment rate is high in most of the intervention regions.

Not all students did manage to complete the courses or to find a job. The relevance of the training for those who dropped out at early stages is however very weak since they mostly did not acquire marketable skills and might become disappointed and discouraged. The partner organisations did not develop strategies to support weaker students (for all kind of reasons: family situation, personality, basic social skills, etc.).

As the image of TVET with the general public is rather negative, it is extremely important to develop qualitative and high relevant TVET courses that result in employment. Good employment rates will make TVET more attractive and increase enrolment. At the moment the overall image of TVET still is rather negative. Extra efforts are needed to promote TVET and make it more attractive. Only one partner visited was involved in promoting TVET (EDU-PRO)

**Sustainability**<sup>30</sup> – With regard to sustainable employment, most of the beneficiaries did find a good job and because of the appreciated quality of their performance job duration is mostly guaranteed. For those who did receive tools, it was easier to find a job or even to start an own business.

Almost all people have been able to improve their employability to a significant degree. Though, in some cases it may be argued that the skills level provided is not enough to ensure a permanent access to decent employment. Four partner organisations (partners of Woord en Daad and Undugu Society of Kenya) did invest in further education to supplement the skills level of the beneficiaries (referring to further education, facilitating grants for further education, etc).

Employment is sustainable but could be improved through medium term support to the business activities. In particular for those beneficiaries who will start after some years of experience with an own business. Basic business training and advice will be important to sustain income. However, the partner organisations did not foresee in this kind of support nor did they cooperate with organisations specialised in business development.

---

<sup>30</sup> Sustainability: in this chapter we focus on the sustainability of the result at the level of the beneficiaries (social sustainability)

## 5. CONCLUSIONS AND RECOMMENDATIONS

---

### 5.1. Nature of the TVET projects visited: conventional projects offering traditional TVET courses

We start this chapter on conclusions with some general remarks on the nature of TVET projects visited. Most partners offer centre based TVET rather than community based services. A minority of the partners offered formal, secondary education. The majority was involved in non formal post secondary vocational training<sup>31</sup>, however mostly following the official curricula in order to deliver officially recognised diplomas. Hence the division between formal and non formal TVET becomes artificial.

Only five partners offered short term post secondary courses. The other partners – usually - offered a combination of long term and short term courses with an emphasis on the long term courses, often to the detriment of the short term courses. Based on the results of this evaluation, the evaluators question the relevance of long term TVET courses at post secondary level, targeting marginalised poor groups.

Apprenticeship systems are not often funded by the CFOs (see portfolio analysis), one apprenticeship project has been visited. Taking into account the results, the advantages and the efficiency of such a system, it is questionable why not more apprenticeship projects are supported by the CFOs. The CFOs and their partners have acknowledged the importance of (long term) internships and they all invest in organising relevant internship for their students, with mixed results. These efforts are usually not systematised and depend largely on the network of the teachers. Only Woord en Daad is strengthening the internships system through the JBCs with good results (see further 5.3).

Only two partners implemented a community based approach linking up with organised groups within the vicinity (ex. Self help groups, community based entrepreneurs or CBOs). The centre based organisations were above all training centres implementing a traditional classroom-based approach (in combination with practice) and offering traditional courses such as car mechanics, computer, electronics, hair dressing, cutting and tailoring. Partners followed official standards and curricula (also those organising non formal courses). The evaluators have not seen many innovative approaches or experiments (ex. new teaching approaches,

---

<sup>31</sup> Selection of partners visited is in coherence with the overall TVET partner portfolio.

introducing new subjects) and partners appeared to be bound to the limits as set by the government. Partners were not involved in TVET reform processes, or in advocacy and lobby activities to change the national approaches and curricula (two exceptions). Most of the TVET providers were neither very aware of the national TVET reforms nor linked to reform initiatives (ex. pilots, often supported by bilateral donors or the European Commission).

## **Recommendations**

We recommend the CFOs - while developing further their TVET policy and identifying new partners - to take into account following suggestions:

- In perspective of effectiveness and efficiency it is recommended to include more apprenticeship models in the TVET portfolio.
- CFOs should increase the number of partners offering short term post secondary vocational training in their TVET portfolio (see further).
- In order to increase efficient use of infrastructure of long term TVET providers, it is recommended to stimulate the combination of short term and long term TVET courses. Short term courses will attract another public and drop outs from the long term courses could be referred to the short term courses.
- As the CFOs are a partner of the TVET providers in the South, they should use the existing know-how in The Netherlands and beyond, with regard to teacher training, TVET policy development, curriculum development, etc. CFOs have to stimulate actively innovative approaches and experiments in the sector of TVET. The CFOs should also inform and link their partners more with the national TVET reforms and bilateral donors active in this sector.

## 5.2. Conclusions with regard to access, quality and relevance of TVET

All TVET partners visited offered a considerable level of qualitative and relevant TVET programmes and many of them were perceived (by the stakeholders interviewed) as best practices in their region/country.

**Access** - All projects target lower skilled people, drop outs from the general system, and poor and vulnerable groups. All projects take initiatives to enhance participation of poor people (ex. hostels, scholarships, voucher systems to cover transport costs, collaboration with CBOs and NGOs that work with specific vulnerable groups, delivery of tools, etc.). All projects aim to achieve gender balanced participation, mostly by programming “traditional” courses that attract girls/women. The evaluators did not identify exclusion mechanisms based on poverty but the nature of courses sometimes required a certain interest, educational level or creativity. None of the partners were offering TVET for illiterate people (except the community based projects), hence this target group was excluded from the TVET courses (and only present in projects supporting smallscale income generating activities) Some hidden exclusion mechanisms might exist, such as exclusion based on religion or HIV-status.

**Quality** - Courses are of an acceptable quality, within the limitations and standards set by the legislative system in a country. Quality of the courses was mostly guaranteed through the quality and motivation of teachers, the quality and appropriateness of the curricula, and the infrastructure and equipment of the practical workshops. Obviously the quality of TVET projects supported by external donors is higher than that of the public systems or projects not having access to external donors. In particular, improvements of infrastructure and the technical expertise with regard to curriculum and syllabi development offered by external donors or experts were significant. All projects aimed to include as much practical training as possible in their approach (adaptation of the curriculum, facilitation of internships, equipment of workshops). Quality remains a challenge. A well developed strategy on teacher training and -by extension a human resource policy- are lacking at most cases visited. Only Woord en Daad supported teacher training with their partners (through funding, discussing policy to this regard, exchange of teachers with teachers in the Netherlands). At the other partners teacher training –if it existed at all - was not organised in a systematic way. Curriculum adaptations (to make courses more appropriate and practical) are limited by the official standards set. It is striking that little attention was paid to equipping schools with good textbooks, available for all students (which is not a high cost and highly demanded by the students).

**Relevance** - The TVET projects visited are generally quite relevant with regard to the needs of the participants and job opportunities within the region. To guarantee the relevance of the TVET courses with

regard to job opportunities the partner organisations had a lot of contacts with employers and the business sector, though contacts mostly were organised in an informal way (through networks of the teachers). This close relationship with employers made it possible to find internships in business and to adapt the curricula – to a certain extent - to the needs of the businesses. However, formal meetings with business representatives to discuss the appropriateness of curricula rarely took place (except at the JBCs). The needs of the labour market are not well analysed in an indepth and detailed manner. Partners did not have formal contacts with private sector associations nor collaborated with other stakeholders to execute pro-active market development research. Monitoring systems were failing in order to prevent market saturation. Specific courses were dropped the moment the organisations experienced market saturation.

Relevance of some projects is questioned by the high drop out rate of students. High drop out was witnessed in the post secondary centre based TVET projects (not at the secondary schools) but also in the community based projects. The relevance of the training for those who dropped out at early stages is weak since they mostly did not acquire marketable skills and might become disappointed and discouraged. The most important factor explaining this drop out is (beside when beneficiaries fail to see the relevance of a certain course, ex. Shramdeep) the length of the training. Little attention is given to people who dropped out or to weaker students who do not take profit of services offered, such as job mediation. No activities have been taken to prevent or follow up these drop outs. No specific attention was given to 'weaker' students.

## **Recommendations**

Access, quality and relevance of TVET programmes will remain a challenge. The three CFOs are aware of these challenges as specific objectives to improve access; quality and relevance of TVET programmes are integrated in the current policy plans and financing programmes. The evaluators formulate following recommendations:

- In all countries teacher training is a major challenge and governments are willing/planning to invest in this. More support by CFOs to teacher training is recommended, including attention to the development of human resource policies that guarantee the welfare and motivation of teachers.
- Improvement of curricula and syllabi was mostly only possible with support from external experts (local or national). The CFOs should invest more in this kind of technical support, but not forgetting to pay sufficient attention to the provision of syllabi.

- A clear strategy on capacity building is needed<sup>32</sup>. Expertise can be attracted from the South or the North. In order to give the opportunity to TVET service providers to learn from good practices and/or to come in contact with innovative approaches (in the South and the North) exchange visits are one of the appropriate tools. Local expertise centres (LEC), as implemented by Edukans, could also play a role in the capacity building strategy. But a clear strategy and approach need to be developed for these LECs.
- A strategy should be developed to guarantee the follow up of drop outs: develop relevant short term courses, implement a modular system (that makes the combination with income generating activities easier), refer drop outs to other organisations and execute a study on the causes and effects of the drop out.
- With regard to the post secondary, non formal vocational training, CFOs should preferably invest more in short term courses than in long term courses.
- A more formal and structural approach is needed to involve employers and ex-alumni in the development and adaptation of the curricula.

---

<sup>32</sup> Capacity building starts from an assessment of the existing capacity. Capacity building can focus on four levels: (1) delivery of tools/syllabi/workshops; (2) training of individuals (ex. teacher training);(3) support to organisational development (ex. human resource policy) and (4) institutional building (ex. enlarging the networks of the TVET providers, linking up with national reform processes).

### **5.3. Conclusions with regard to employment of the beneficiaries**

TVET appears to be an effective tool in poverty reduction. The vast majority of students that participated in TVET, acquired skills (soft skills and vocational skills) that enabled them to adequately respond to the demands of the labour market. 70% to 90% (30% in Albania) of the students –who graduated- found a job or became self-employed. There was no distinction with regard to employment rate between the different courses. The technical courses mainly lead to wage employment. The beauty, hair dressing and tailoring courses lead mostly to self employment (mainly women). Because of the appreciated quality of the performance of ex-trainees, job duration was guaranteed in most cases.

The most important factor for increasing the employment rate is the system of internships. All TVET providers organised short- or long term internships within companies. Trainees afterwards stayed within these companies or could more easily relate to similar companies. All TVET providers (except the community based projects) facilitated these internships, usually through the informal contacts of teachers with business people. In three projects this strategy was more or less formalised (JBC at AMG and Hope enterprises and the apprenticeship approach of Undugu): TVET providers had formal and structural contacts with business representatives and training and follow up of the trainees was formalised in an agreement. Regular follow up was done by the teachers discussing performance and progress of the trainees. At the other projects (post secondary vocational training) these contacts and follow up were organised in an informal way and depended on the engagement and motivation of the individual teachers.

Another important factor is job-mediation. Only four TVET providers invested in job mediation (which goes beyond facilitating internships): the JBCs financed by Woord en Daad and the employment centre at YWCA. They had contacts with potential employers (developing a database of potential employers), equipped students with solicitation skills and – in the case of YWCA - intervened when negotiating the contract. Two of the JBCs continued to offer training once students were employed (refreshment courses, retraining). At the other projects, this job mediation was mainly informal and accidental.

None of the partners visited was involved in pro-active research on job opportunities. The partner organisations did not manage to create new market niches nor did they develop strategies to look for business opportunities, in particular new economic activities where gender prejudices are less strong and where wages would be higher.

The majority of the students entered wage employment (formal and informal sector), only a minority became self-employed. Only the two community based projects (Shramdeep and APDA) were explicitly preparing their target groups to become self employed, with mixed results. Attention to entrepreneurship (self-employment) and the creation of a business are weak at all the TVET providers. Even the community based organisations, supporting self-employment, did not have a well developed strategy to support small and young businesses. Not many partner organisations were supporting their beneficiaries with business training, business development advice, seed money or leasing equipment, nor did they cooperate with organisations specialised in business development. Not many students started an own business immediately after graduating. It appeared to be very difficult to start a business and to access credit as the microfinance industry is generally reluctant to give loans to youngsters without business expertise. Only a few partner organisations were supporting these people with alternative instruments, such as seed money or leasing equipment.

The socio-economic situation of the participants has improved a lot. Participants gained some social skills (negotiating skills, communication, knowing your rights, etc) and enlarged their social networks, which is crucial for finding and maintaining a job. Income generated by employment was reasonable with perspectives of a substantial increase for the coming years. Income earned through self-employment was on average lower-at this stage- compared to income generated through wage employment. Unfortunately, this runs parallel with the gender divide as mostly women became self-employed. A well developed strategy to support sustainable self-employment was absent in the sample of partners visited.

### **Recommendations:**

The importance of internships and job mediation has been highlighted. A clear and systematic approach should be developed to this regard. We formulate the following recommendations:

- Only the JBCs, as implemented by Woord en daad, did organise long term internships and formalised the management of these internships. In the other projects, the internship system should be further developed and formalised. This requires specific capacities (staff and knowhow) to organise and supervise internships.
- When internship opportunities are rare, joint efforts should be undertaken to advocate the businesses to this regard.
- CFOs could look for partners implementing an apprenticeship system as implemented by Undugu. The Undugu case should be documented as a good practice.
- Partner organisations should act in a more pro-active way, to conduct market needs assessment including a gender approach and to develop strategies to create job opportunities. Some examples: TVET providers could create new market development by launching a new job, with a group of

people (if possibly in collaboration with women organisations); TVET providers could conduct assessments to identify growth-oriented sectors as well as to examine the possibilities to counter gender prejudices in businesses and profession. We strongly believe that there is scope to develop specific businesses and employment in new areas such as ICT, services, tourism, etc., often in collaboration with larger companies. More collaboration with the public sector, such as local authorities, or the non profit sector (such as CBOs) could create job opportunities in these particular sectors.

- CFOs should link their educational programmes more with their economic development programmes as implemented by the ICCO alliance (hence Edukans can benefit from this as well) and Woord en Daad (to a certain extent Woord en Daad do so, but here too the link could be strengthened). Partners from economic development programmes can assist TVET partners in conducting market needs analysis and TVET partners could become easier in contact with organisations that support business development.
- As access to micro finance institutes appears to be difficult for young people, it is extremely relevant that TVET providers invest in the initial start up of small businesses: via seed money, leasing equipment, and or linking ex-students with organisations specialised in business development (ex. sending a list of ex-graduates to these organisations that support business development)
- Partner organisations should develop a good student tracer system in order to have reliable data on the impact of the TVET programmes. Student tracer systems are currently based on the informal contacts of teachers with ex-students. The creation of ex-alumni activities could strengthen the relationship with the ex-students and the former training centre (and as such be a source to trace ex-students), and strengthen the social network of ex-students. One could also systematize the “informal” information of the teachers and execute -at regular base- student tracer studies.

#### **5.4. Conclusions with regard to the collaboration of TVET partners with civil society organisations (including community based strategy)**

10 of the 13 partners visited were centre based organisations but implemented their centres within or close to the urban and/or rural intervention zones. The majority collaborated with community based organisations but mainly for the identification and selection of beneficiaries. Two community based projects and one apprenticeship project visited are really embedded within the communities. However, this embedment did not always guarantee the relevance and quality of the training.

At five organisations (secondary and post secondary examples) we have seen a close link between the TVET activities and community development programmes. This resulted from an intensive and close collaboration (partnership) with CBOs and NGOs within these communities and as such is also possible for centre based organisations. However, only a few (3) centre based organisations did collaborate more intensively with local CBOs and NGOs (collaboration that goes beyond the selection of beneficiaries).

As a consequence, the impact of TVET programmes on the communities was limited to a modest economical impact, mostly at individual level (set up of small enterprises; increase of spending power). There was little return of the TVET programmes towards the communities; for example, community development programmes were rarely strengthened by the TVET projects (few exceptions).

None of the partners was involved in collaboration with teachers associations, parents associations and private sector associations. There was not even much collaboration between different TVET providers (public and private). Partners did collaborate with government structures, though these structures were often weak and/or in a reform process.

#### **Recommendations:**

Partner organisations develop effective and relevant TVET but often operate in an isolated way. A multi stakeholders' approach is not put into practice yet. In the period 2003-2006 support to TVET was very much project based. The challenge for the next period is to effectively implement TVET within programme logic, based on a rights based approach.

- As already recommended, the CFOs should link their educational programmes more with the economical programmes. Through the economical programmes private sector associations could be strengthened, and this will make them a more interesting partner for the TVET providers.

- The CFOs should develop strategies to strengthen beneficiaries in claiming their rights: students, parents, teachers and communities. CFOs should look for strategic partnerships with organisations or actors that are involved in this kind of intervention. We do not see a role for the TVET providers to this end as they lack the capacity, network and time to become involved in this. TVET providers can be stimulated to collaborate with these civil society organisations – should they exist.. CFOs could ask their partners to what extent they have taken into account suggestions from these civil society organisations.
- The evaluators recommend that the TVET providers look for opportunities to work in closer collaboration with the communities. This will strengthen the social fabric and have -at the medium term -impact on the claim making power of the different stakeholders. More community based approach will also have an impact on the integration of beneficiaries in society. Stronger relationships with local businesses, community based organisations and NGOs involved in local development and livelihood programmes will increase the influence from outside on the TVET systems, make them more relevant and enhance the impact of the TVET on the communities.

## 5.5. Conclusions with regard to the policy and practice of the CFO

Policy development on education for work is quite recent for ICCO and Edukans. In the period of evaluation (2003-2006) no specific policy or strategy existed. Interventions were implemented through projects. This lack of policy and strategy influenced the quality of support to their partner. In 2005 Edukans started to develop a policy on education for work, with a clear choice to invest in community based non formal vocational training targeting the strengthening of income generating activities. Woord en Daad has a longer experience with TVET and started to implement a job and income programme since 2001. This Job and Income programme is a logical component in the chain approach (with regard to basic education) as implemented by Woord en Daad. In the period 2003-2006 Woord en Daad further developed their policy and strategy (ex. the creation of JBCs). Both strategies, the approach of Woord en Daad and the approach of Edukans, are difficult to compare and primarily reflect strategic choices that are legitimate and in coherence with their respective analysis and policy.

The relationship between ICCO and the two other CFOs during the period of the block grants was primarily a financial relationship. Exchange of experiences and know-how between the different NGOs rarely took place. The CFOs were not documenting good practices in a structured and systematic way and there was no support to develop or improve monitoring and evaluation systems. There was no exchange on gender and HIV/AIDS policies, though ICCO has more experience and tools in this regard and these could be shared. However collaboration between ICCO and Edukans, and to a certain extent with Woord en Daad, has increased since 2005 and currently there is much more policy discussion with regard to TVET.

The relationship between the CFOs and their counterparts is primarily a financial relationship with sometimes significant contributions to infrastructure and equipment of workshops. Less input has been given with regard to teacher training and curriculum development (except Woord en Daad). The CFOs all invest in capacity development of their partners, mostly focussing on organisational development. Partners appreciate the support by the Dutch NGOs as adequate.

Not much linking and learning activities have taken place. Organisations have met each other but mainly to discuss the policies of the CFOs and their future relationships (except Woord en Daad that organised several expert meetings). Most organisations are only involved in their own programmes and good practices are not documented in a systematic way (some exceptions).

The type of support differs significantly, however. Woord en Daad has a long lasting relationship with a limited number of partners and gives more direction/guidance. Edukans and ICCO are supportive to their partners in providing the necessary expertise but not in a pro-active way.

Each of the three organisations is clearly evolving from a strategy emphasising input in infrastructure (hardware) to a strategy that pays more attention to the development of the software. To date this evolution is not yet supported by a strategy on capacity building (clarifying exactly how the processes of capacitating partners will be executed). As a result, most of the current interventions are project based and not embedded in coherent and integral capacity building processes.

TVET in itself is not sustainable for poor and disadvantaged target groups and therefore needs continued donor funding. The CFOs clearly prepared their partners to be able to apply for other donors: organisational and management tools are in place and the organisations did develop a relevant track record with regard to TVET. Though, since there has not been much lobbying so far, government has not yet been held accountable for increasing the funding of TVET. Most likely, the partner organisations will keep on depending on external donors.

## **Recommendations**

We formulate some reflections with regard to the three CFOs

**ICCO (ICCO alliance)** - No specific choice has been made yet to support a particular kind of educational partner. The focus however seems to be on post secondary vocational training and on the improvement of the quality, relevance and access of TVET (see recommendations there). Based on this evaluation, we recommend selecting in particular TVET partners who organise short term TVET courses and/or partners that pay enough attention to internships. In the past period, TVET projects were often integrated in bigger development programmes. This is an interesting approach as this strengthens the results of the TVET activities. However, also in these projects, sufficient attention should go to improving the quality and relevance (see recommendations in the above). The link with the economic development programmes should be strengthened. In the MFS proposal, objectives are also formulated with regard to civil society strengthening and advocacy and lobby. Not many activities and results have been identified to this regard in this evaluation. We recommend that an integrated approach should be developed while elaborating country strategic plans. One should look for strategic partnerships with other organisations (than TVET providers) to realize the objectives related to the strengthening of civil society organisations (and the claim making power) involved in TVET. Advocacy and lobby is not something that is added to a project. A strategy with regard to advocacy and

lobby needs to be developed, right at the beginning and alongside the country programme on education for work. Most of the TVET providers are not equipped with relevant expertise and strategic partnerships with relevant organisations should be established. However, all TVET providers can play a role in advocacy and lobby strategies by documenting their good practices and delivering information from practice to nurture lobby dossiers.

**Edukans** - we did not visit primary education projects, hence no conclusions can be drawn on the vocationalisation of primary education. Edukans intends to move towards a community based approach. We support this approach. Results of the evaluation show that a return effect of TVET on communities largely depends on the collaboration of TVET providers with community based organisations. However, we see a difference between community based approaches focussing on income generating groups and the common TVET projects. Income generating projects are often part of local (economic) development programmes and - of course- do contain some technical training component. But this is slightly different from self employment or wage employment achieved through TVET. This reflection should be taken into consideration when discussing this approach with partners. Edukans will also continue to invest more in HIV and AIDS. Experiences, tools and good practices resulting from the network Educaids should be integrated in the programme "Education for work". Moreover, a strategy on mainstreaming HIV and AIDS into programmes and projects should be developed for the entire organisation. Much can be learned from the experiences on HIV and AIDS mainstreaming as implemented by ICCO. The local expertise centres seem to be an interesting approach, though it is too soon to assess their relevance and impact. However these LEC can assume responsibility with regard to capacity building of the TVET service providers, linking and learning between TVET service providers, negotiating jointly a particular business sector, looking for strategic partnerships (all recommendations of this evaluation).

**Woord en Daad** - has a clear and well established approach that is regularly discussed with partners and research on several -TVET related -topics is executed. The strategy has its merits. Woord en Daad should continue to develop the JBCs as not all JBCs are yet fully operational and not all operate in the same professional way (difference between AMG and Woord en Daad India). The evaluators assume that more tasks can be taken up by the JBC and believe their potential is not yet fully exploited. The VTCs seem to operate very much on their own (except Hope enterprises). We recommend that more collaboration should be sought with community based organisations, other TVET providers, private sector, etc. Hope enterprises is a very good case (and already included in several evaluations of projects and joint evaluations). It should be interesting to document this practice and its lessons learned. Woord en Daad implements a chain approach, including a system of scholarship. In the policy it is stated that beneficiaries can enter at every stage of the

chain. It might be interesting to investigate to what extent possible beneficiaries really take advantage of this. Advocacy and lobby has been integrated in the policy. As formulated for the ICCO alliance, an integrated advocacy and lobby strategy should be developed (see recommendations ICCO-alliance). Woord en Daad did start a programme for HIV/AIDS mainstreaming, focussing on internal and external mainstreaming. ICCO has already quite some experience, tools and capacity building strategies, which can be used to strengthen the HIV/AIDS programme of Woord en Daad.

**Recommendations for the three CFOs** - A more pro-active dialogue with counterparts (in particular for ICCO ad Edukans) is needed and is also in compliance with the new co-financing system that stipulates that counterparts in the South request from the CFO (beyond funding) more and more specialised knowledge, advice and strategic orientation. It will be a challenge to increase the expertise with regard tot TVET of the programme officers and to decrease the (administrative) burden of the programme officers.

More efforts should be made to help partners implementing a gender approach. With regard to gender, there are a lot of challenges ahead. In particular gender based needs assessments and impact assessments of TVET on gender relations within families are needed. This can be discussed with partner organisations and if possible, separate budgets can be made available for these kinds of assessments. This requires sufficient gender sensitivity of the own programme officers (and training if this is lacking). We also recommend increasing the collaboration with women and women support organisations which is in line with the recommendation to increase the cooperation in general with community based organisations, NGOs and private sector.

## 5.6. Reflections with regard to the evaluation policy

The evaluation team has the impression that the CFOs expect the same approaches and results from project evaluations, partner evaluations, programme evaluations and joint evaluations. However, every evaluation has its limits and own characteristics. Project and partner evaluations demand an exhaustive assessment of the evaluation criteria where programme evaluations try to identify main conclusions on a limited number of (strategic) subjects and focus more on strategic questions. A programme evaluation, certainly a joint evaluation like this one, has to rely on existing projects and partner evaluations as only a limited time is available to visit partners. Time spent at the partners should preferably be devoted to discussions related to strategic issues rather than to the collection of factual data with regard to the results of a project. When data on the effectiveness, efficiency, relevance and sustainability of projects are missing, valuable evaluation time is spent on the collection of these data (in order to find comparable material) so that there is less time to reflect together with the partner on the factors that have an influence on effectiveness, efficiency, relevance and sustainability and on strategic questions. Therefore, conclusions of a programme evaluation sometimes will remain rather superficial.

We recommend that the CFOs reflect on their evaluation strategies, discuss the coherence between partner evaluations and programme evaluations and strengthen the evaluation capacities of their partners. Partners do not have to be the “subject” of programme evaluations but rather partners in programme evaluations. Woord en Daad did start to develop further their evaluation strategy and decided to strengthen the partner evaluations. Programme evaluations will be executed on the basis of the analysis of these partner evaluation reports and consider mostly desk work. For the ICCO alliance it will be a challenge to strengthen the partner evaluations (identification of evaluation, identification of subjects, identification of an approach, strengthening the evaluation capacity of the partner) and look for links between the results of these partner evaluations and a programme evaluation.

This evaluation had two objectives: accountability and learning. These two objectives are always difficult to combine and often the emphasis is on either accountability or learning. In this evaluation too the emphasis was more on accountability. Some issues remain to be investigated further. We list some suggestions (not exhaustive) for further research:

- What (hidden) exclusion mechanisms to enter TVET programmes do exist, and is there a difference between urban and rural settings?
- Gender: to what extent does gender (and existing gender roles) hamper access to TVET; what is the impact of participation at TVET on gender roles and on the family situation of the participants?

- Is there a real difference with regard to employment rate between graduates from the general system in comparison and TVET graduates?
- What kind of human resource policies are implemented in educational organisations (in general and for TVET in particular), and do they have an effect on the quality and motivation of the teachers?
- To what extent do TVET providers take into account recommendations from the business sector or communities with regard to curriculum development? Responsiveness of the schools?
- What are the causes and effect of drop outs, and is there a difference between men and women?

## **6. ANNEXES**

---

6.1. Terms of reference

6.2. Evaluation framework

6.3. Chronogram of the evaluation

6.4. Overview of working documents (organisational report and field reports) that are available upon request

6.5. Brief description of the partners visited

6.6. Reaction of ACE Europe on comments of the CFOs on the first draft of the evaluation report

Annexes are compiled in a separate document.